



**KEN PAXTON**  
ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS

January 12, 2022

Mr. Joseph J. Gorfida, Jr.  
Counsel for the City of Richardson  
Nichols, Jackson, Dillard, Hager & Smith, L.L.P.  
500 North Akard Street, Suite 1800  
Dallas, Texas 75201

OR2022-01153

Dear Mr. Gorfida:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 924870 Reference No. 125711 and 125974).

The City of Richardson (the "city"), which you represent, received two requests from different requestors for information pertaining to Bid No. 59-21, Debris Removal and Disposal Services. You state the city has released some of the requested information. You claim some of the submitted information is excepted from disclosure under sections 552.110 and 552.1101 of the Government Code.<sup>1</sup> You also state release of the submitted information may implicate the proprietary interests of third parties. Accordingly, you state, and provide documentation showing, you notified Aftermath Disaster Recovery, Inc.; Arbor Masters Tree Service; Ceres Environmental; CrowderGulf, LLC; Tree Care, Inc.; D&J Enterprises, Inc.; DRC Emergency Services; Graham County Land Company, LLC; and TFR Enterprises, Inc. of the request for information and of their right to submit arguments to this office as to why the submitted information should not be released. *See* Gov't Code § 552.305(d); *see also* Open Records Decision No. 542 (1990) (statutory predecessor to section 552.305 permits governmental body to rely on interested third party to raise and explain applicability of exception in the Act in certain circumstances). We have considered the submitted arguments and reviewed the submitted information.

---

<sup>1</sup> We note that although you raise section 552.101 of the Government Code, you make no arguments to support this exception. Therefore, we assume you have withdrawn your claim this section applies to the submitted information. *See* Gov't Code §§ 552.301, .302.

We note an interested third party is allowed ten business days after the date of its receipt of the governmental body's notice under section 552.305(d) to submit its reasons, if any, as to why information relating to that party should be withheld from public disclosure. *See* Gov't Code § 552.305(d)(2)(B). As of the date of this letter, we have not received comments from any of the third parties at issue explaining why their information should not be released. Therefore, we have no basis to conclude any of the third parties have a protected proprietary interest in the submitted information. *See, e.g., id.* § 552.110 (requiring the provision of specific factual evidence demonstrating the applicability of the exception). Accordingly, the city may not withhold any of the information at issue on the basis of any proprietary interest the third parties at issue may have in it.

We note you raise section 552.110 of the Government Code. Section 552.110 of the Government Code protects (1) trade secrets, and (2) commercial or financial information the disclosure of which would cause substantial competitive harm to the person from whom the information was obtained. *See id.* § 552.110(b)-(c). Although you assert some of the submitted information is excepted under section 552.110, that exception is designed to protect the interests of third parties, not the interests of a governmental body. In addition, although you raise section 552.1101 of the Government Code for the information at issue, this section protects only the interests of a vendor, contractor, potential vendor, or potential contractor that has provided information to a governmental body, not those of the governmental body itself. *See id.* § 552.1101(c). Thus, we do not address your arguments under sections 552.110 or 552.1101 of the Government Code.

Section 552.130 of the Government Code excepts from public disclosure information relating to a motor vehicle operator's license, driver's license, motor vehicle title or registration, or personal identification document issued by an agency of this state or another state or country.<sup>2</sup> *See id.* § 552.130. Accordingly, the city must withhold the submitted vehicle identification numbers under section 552.130 of the Government Code.

Section 552.136 of the Government Code states "[n]otwithstanding any other provision of this chapter, a credit card, debit card, charge card, or access device number that is collected, assembled, or maintained by or for a governmental body is confidential." *Id.* § 552.136; *see also id.* § 552.136(a) (defining "access device"). This office has concluded insurance policy numbers constitute access device numbers for purposes of section 552.136. Accordingly, we find the city must withhold the submitted insurance policy numbers under section 552.136 of the Government Code.

We note some of the materials at issue may be protected by copyright. A custodian of public records must comply with the copyright law and is not required to furnish copies of records that are copyrighted. Open Records Decision No. 180 at 3 (1977). A governmental body must allow inspection of copyrighted materials unless an exception applies to the information. *Id.*; *see* Open Records Decision No. 109 (1975). If a member of the public wishes to make copies of copyrighted materials, the person must do so unassisted by the

---

<sup>2</sup> The Office of the Attorney General will raise mandatory exceptions on behalf of a governmental body. *See* Open Records Decision Nos. 481 (1987), 480 (1987), 470 (1987).

governmental body. In making copies, the member of the public assumes the duty of compliance with the copyright law and the risk of a copyright infringement suit.

In summary, the city must withhold the submitted vehicle identification numbers under section 552.130 of the Government Code. The city must withhold the submitted insurance policy numbers under section 552.136 of the Government Code. The city must release the remaining information; however, any information subject to copyright may only be released in accordance with copyright law.

This letter ruling is limited to the particular information at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other information or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For more information concerning those rights and responsibilities, please visit our website at <https://www.texasattorneygeneral.gov/open-government/members-public/what-expect-after-ruling-issued> or call the OAG's Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. Questions concerning the allowable charges for providing public information under the Public Information Act may be directed to the Cost Rules Administrator of the OAG, toll free, at (888) 672-6787.

Sincerely,

Jennifer Copeland  
Assistant Attorney General  
Open Records Division

JC/ba

Ref: ID# 924870

Enc. Submitted documents

c: Requestors  
(w/o enclosures)

11 Third Parties  
(w/o enclosures)