



KEN PAXTON
ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS

December 17, 2020

Ms. Tiffany Bull
Assistant City Attorney
City of Grand Prairie
P.O. Box 534045
Grand Prairie, Texas 75053-4045

OR2020-31636

Dear Ms. Bull:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 858916 (Ref. No. GPCA 20-0181).

The Grand Prairie Police Department (the "department") received four requests from four different requestors for information pertaining to a specified incident.¹ You claim the submitted information is excepted from disclosure under sections 552.101 and 552.108 of the Government Code. We have considered the exceptions you claim and reviewed the submitted representative sample of information.²

Section 552.101 of the Government Code excepts from disclosure "information considered to be confidential by law, either constitutional, statutory, or by judicial decision." Gov't Code § 552.101. This section encompasses information protected by other statutes. Section 261.201 of the Family Code provides, in relevant part, as follows:

¹ We note the first requestor modified her request. The department provides documentation showing it sought and received clarification of the information requested. *See* Gov't Code § 552.222 (providing if request for information is unclear, governmental body may ask requestor to clarify request); *see also* *City of Dallas v. Abbott*, 304 S.W.3d 380, 387 (Tex. 2010) (holding that when a governmental entity, acting in good faith, requests clarification or narrowing of an unclear or overbroad request for information, the ten-day period to request an attorney general ruling is measured from the date the request is clarified or narrowed).

² We assume the "representative sample" of records submitted to this office is truly representative of the requested records as a whole. *See* Open Records Decision Nos. 499 (1988), 497 (1988). This open records letter does not reach, and therefore does not authorize the withholding of, any other requested records to the extent those records contain substantially different types of information than that submitted to this office.

(a) [T]he following information is confidential, is not subject to public release under Chapter 552, Government Code, and may be disclosed only for purposes consistent with this code and applicable federal or state law or under rules adopted by an investigating agency:

(1) a report of alleged or suspected abuse or neglect made under this chapter and the identity of the person making the report; and

(2) except as otherwise provided in this section, the files, reports, records, communications, audiotapes, videotapes, and working papers used or developed in an investigation under this chapter or in providing services as a result of an investigation.

...

(k) Notwithstanding Subsection (a), an investigating agency, other than the [Texas Department of Family and Protective Services] or the Texas Juvenile Justice Department, on request, shall provide to the parent, managing conservator, or other legal representative of a child who is the subject of reported abuse or neglect, or to the child if the child is at least 18 years of age, information concerning the reported abuse or neglect that would otherwise be confidential under this section. The investigating agency shall withhold information under this subsection if the parent, managing conservator, or other legal representative of the child requesting the information is alleged to have committed the abuse or neglect.

(l) Before a child or a parent, managing conservator, or other legal representative of a child may inspect or copy a record or file concerning the child under Subsection (k), the custodian of the record or file must redact:

...

(2) any information that is excepted from required disclosure under [the Act], or other law[.]

Fam. Code § 261.201(a), (k), (l)(2). Upon review, we find the submitted information was used or developed in an investigation conducted under chapter 261 of the Family Code, so as to fall within the scope of section 261.201(a). *See id.* § 261.001(1), (4) (defining “abuse” and “neglect” for purposes of Family Code chapter 261); *see also id.* § 101.003(a) (defining “child” for purposes of this section as person under 18 years of age who is not and has not been married or who has not had disabilities of minority removed for general purposes). Accordingly, we find this information is subject to chapter 261 of the Family Code. You state the department has not adopted a rule that governs the release of this type of information. Therefore, we assume no such rule exists. Given that assumption, the department must generally withhold the submitted information in its entirety from the first and second requestors under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with

section 261.201(a) of the Family Code.³ However, we note the fourth requestor is a parent of the child victim and the third requestor represents the fourth requestor. Further, the fourth requestor is not accused of committing the alleged or suspected child abuse or neglect. Thus, pursuant to section 261.201(k), the information at issue may not be withheld from the third and fourth requestors under section 552.101 of the Government Code on the basis of section 261.201(a). *See id.* § 261.201(k). Further, section 261.201(1)(2) states any information that is excepted from required disclosure under the Act or other law must still be withheld from disclosure. *Id.* § 261.201(1)(2). Therefore, we will consider whether the information at issue is otherwise excepted from disclosure under the Act.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code also encompasses section 58.008 of the Family Code, which provides, in part:

(b) Except as provided by Subsection (d), law enforcement records concerning a child and information concerning a child that are stored by electronic means or otherwise and from which a record could be generated may not be disclosed to the public and shall be:

(1) if maintained on paper or microfilm, kept separate from adult records;

(2) if maintained electronically in the same computer system as adult records, accessible only under controls that are separate and distinct from the controls to access electronic data concerning adults; and

(3) maintained on a local basis only and not sent to a central state or federal depository, except as provided by Subsection (c) or Subchapter B, D, or E.

Id. § 58.008(b); *see also id.* § 51.03(a) (defining “delinquent conduct” for purposes of title 3 of Family Code). Section 58.008(b) is applicable to records of juvenile conduct that occurred before, on, or after September 1, 2017. The juvenile must have been at least 10 years old and less than 17 years of age when the conduct occurred. *See id.* § 51.02(2) (defining “child” for purposes of title 3 of Family Code). The submitted information involves a juvenile offender, so as to fall within the scope of section 58.008(b). It does not appear any of the exceptions in section 58.008 apply. Accordingly, the department must generally withhold the submitted information from the third and fourth requestors under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 58.008(b) of the Family Code.⁴

We note the information at issue includes a CR-3 accident report. Section 550.065 applies only to a written report of an accident required under section 550.061, 550.062, or 601.004. Transp. Code § 550.065(a)(1). Chapter 550 requires the creation of a written report when

³ As our ruling is dispositive, we need not address your remaining argument against disclosure of this information, with respect to the first and second requestors.

⁴ As our ruling is dispositive, we need not address your remaining argument against disclosure of this information.

the accident resulted in injury to or the death of a person or damage to the property of any person to the apparent extent of \$1,000 or more. Transp. Code §§ 550.061 (operator's accident report), .062 (officer's accident report). An accident report is privileged and for the confidential use of the Texas Department of Transportation or a local governmental agency of Texas that has use for the information for accident prevention purposes. *Id.* § 550.065(b). However, a governmental entity may release an accident report in accordance with subsections (c) and (c-1). *Id.* § 550.065(c), (c-1). Section 550.065(c) provides a governmental entity shall release an accident report to a person or entity listed under this subsection. *Id.* § 550.065(c).

In this instance, the second, third, and fourth requestors are persons listed under section 550.065(c). Therefore, the second, third, and fourth requestors have a right of access to the submitted accident report. The first requestor is not a person listed under section 550.065(c) and does not have such a right of access. However, section 550.065(c-1) requires the department to create a redacted accident report that may be requested by any person. *Id.* § 550.065(c-1). The redacted accident report may not include the information listed in subsection (f)(2). *Id.* Therefore, the first requestor has a right of access to the redacted accident report. Thus, we must address the conflict between the confidentiality provided under sections 261.201(a) and 58.008(b) of the Family Code and the rights of access provided under sections 550.065(c) and (c-1) of the Transportation Code. Where general and specific statutes are in irreconcilable conflict, the specific provision typically prevails as an exception to the general provision unless the general provision was enacted later and there is clear evidence the legislature intended the general provision to prevail. *See Gov't Code § 311.026(b); City of Lake Dallas v. Lake Cities Mun. Util. Auth.*, 555 S.W. 2d 163, 168 (Tex. Civ. App.—Fort Worth 1977, writ ref'd n.r.e.). We note section 261.201(a) generally pertains to all records of alleged or suspected child abuse or neglect and section 58.008(b) generally pertains to all juvenile law enforcement records. However, section 550.065 specifically pertains to accident reports. Accordingly, we find section 550.065 is more specific than, and prevails over sections 261.201(a) and 58.008(b). We also note that, although you raise section 552.108 to withhold the information, a statutory right of access prevails over the Act's general exceptions to public disclosure. *See, e.g.*, Open Records Decision Nos. 613 at 4 (1993) (exceptions in Act cannot impinge on statutory right of access to information), 451 (1986) (specific statutory right of access provisions overcome general exception to disclosure under the Act). Because section 552.108 is a general exception under the Act, the requestors' statutory access under sections 550.065(c) and (c-1) prevails and the department may not withhold the information under section 552.108 of the Government Code. Therefore, the department must release the submitted CR-3 accident report in its entirety to the second, third, and fourth requestors pursuant to section 550.065(c) of the Transportation Code, and must release the redacted accident report to the first requestor pursuant to section 550.065(c-1) of the Transportation Code.

In summary, the department must release the submitted CR-3 accident report in its entirety to the second, third, and fourth requestors pursuant to section 550.065(c) of the Transportation Code and release the redacted accident report to the first requestor pursuant to section 550.065(c-1) of the Transportation Code. The department must withhold the remaining information from the first and second requestors under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 261.201(a) of the Family Code and the third

and fourth requestors under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 58.008(b) of the Family Code.

This letter ruling is limited to the particular information at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other information or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For more information concerning those rights and responsibilities, please visit our website at <https://www.texasattorneygeneral.gov/open-government/members-public/what-expect-after-ruling-issued> or call the OAG's Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. Questions concerning the allowable charges for providing public information under the Public Information Act may be directed to the Cost Rules Administrator of the OAG, toll free, at (888) 672-6787.

Sincerely,

Pearlie Gault
Attorney
Open Records Division

PG/jm

Ref: ID# 858916

Enc. Submitted documents

c: 4 Requestors
(w/o enclosures)