



KEN PAXTON
ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS

December 11, 2020

Ms. Catherine Zellers
City Attorney
City of Weatherford
P.O. Box 255
Weatherford, Texas 76086

OR2020-31049

Dear Ms. Zellers:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 857796 (Records Center No. W002177).

The Weatherford Police Department (the "department") received a request for three specified police reports involving two named individuals and one named place of business. You claim the submitted information is excepted from disclosure under sections 552.101 and 552.130 of the Government Code. We have considered the exceptions you claim and reviewed the submitted information.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code excepts "information considered to be confidential by law, either constitutional, statutory, or by judicial decision." Gov't Code § 552.101. Section 552.101 encompasses the doctrine of common-law privacy, which protects information that is (1) highly intimate or embarrassing, the publication of which would be highly objectionable to a reasonable person, and (2) not of legitimate concern to the public. *Indus. Found. v. Tex. Indus. Accident Bd.*, 540 S.W.2d 668, 685 (Tex. 1976). To demonstrate the applicability of common-law privacy, both prongs of this test must be satisfied. *Id.* at 681-82. A compilation of an individual's criminal history is highly embarrassing information, the publication of which would be highly objectionable to a reasonable person. *Cf. U.S. Dep't of Justice v. Reporters Comm. for Freedom of the Press*, 489 U.S. 749, 764 (1989) (finding significant privacy interest in compilation of individual's criminal history by recognizing distinction between public records found in courthouse files and local police stations and compiled summary of criminal history information). Furthermore, we find a compilation of a private citizen's criminal history is generally not of legitimate concern to the public. Although you contend the submitted information is protected by common-law privacy as a compilation of criminal records, we note the requestor seeks specified records. The request does not require the department to compile an individual's criminal history and does not implicate the privacy interests of the

named individuals. Thus, we find you have failed to demonstrate the present request requires the department to compile unspecified law enforcement records concerning the named individuals and none may be withheld under section 552.101 on this basis.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code also encompasses information protected by section 261.201 of the Family Code, which provides, in relevant part:

(a) [T]he following information is confidential, is not subject to public release under [the Act], and may be disclosed only for purposes consistent with this code and applicable federal or state law or under rules adopted by an investigating agency:

(1) a report of alleged or suspected abuse or neglect made under [chapter 261 of the Family Code] and the identity of the person making the report; and

(2) except as otherwise provided in this section, the files, reports, records, communications, audiotapes, videotapes, and working papers used or developed in an investigation under [chapter 261 of the Family Code] or in providing services as a result of an investigation.

Fam. Code § 261.201(a). Exhibit D was used or developed in an investigation of alleged or suspected child abuse by the department. *See id.* §§ 101.003(a) (defining “child” for purposes of section 261.201 as person under 18 years of age who is not and has not been married or who has not had the disabilities of minority removed for general purposes), 261.001(1) (defining “abuse” for purposes of chapter 261 of the Family Code). Thus, this information falls within the scope of section 261.201 of the Family Code. Therefore, we find Exhibit D is generally confidential under section 261.201(a) of the Family Code. Section 261.201(a), however, also provides information encompassed by subsection (a) may be disclosed “for purposes consistent with [the Family Code] and applicable federal or state law.” *Id.* § 261.201(a).

Chapter 411 of the Government Code constitutes “applicable state law” in this instance. The requestor is a representative of the Texas Department of Licensing and Regulation (the “TDLR”). Sections 411.093 and 411.122 of the Government Code both provide the TDLR is entitled to obtain criminal history record information (“CHRI”) maintained by the Texas Department of Public Safety (“DPS”) that relates to a person who is a holder of a license issued by the TDLR. Gov’t Code §§ 411.093(a), .122(a)(1), .122(d)(10). Section 411.087 of the Government Code provides an agency that is entitled to obtain CHRI from DPS is also authorized to “obtain from any other criminal justice agency in this state [CHRI] maintained by that criminal justice agency[.]” *Id.* § 411.087. CHRI is defined as “information collected about a person by a criminal justice agency that consists of identifiable descriptions and notations of arrests, detentions, indictments, informations, and other formal criminal charges and their dispositions.” *See id.* § 411.082(2). Thus, when read together, sections 411.087, 411.093, and 411.122 of the Government Code may grant the TDLR a right of access to CHRI in Exhibit D.

The requestor is conducting an investigation of an individual who is a holder of a license from the TDLR. Accordingly, if the department determines release of Exhibit D is consistent with the purposes of the Family Code, then the requestor has a right of access to CHRI about the individual pursuant to sections 411.087, 411.093, and 411.122 of the Government Code. In that instance, the department must release the information that shows the types of allegations made and whether there was an arrest, information, indictment, detention, conviction, or other formal charges and their dispositions, and must withhold the remaining information under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 261.201 of the Family Code. However, if the department determines release of the CHRI is not consistent with the purposes of the Family Code, then the department must withhold Exhibit D in its entirety under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 261.201 of the Family Code.

As noted above, section 552.101 encompasses the doctrine of common-law privacy, which is subject to the two-part test discussed above. *Indus. Found*, 540 S.W.2d at 685. Types of information considered intimate and embarrassing by the Texas Supreme Court are delineated in *Industrial Foundation*. *Id.* at 683. The Third Court of Appeals has concluded public citizens' dates of birth are protected by common-law privacy pursuant to section 552.101. *See Paxton v. City of Dallas*, No. 03-13-00546-CV, 2015 WL 3394061, at *3 (Tex. App.—Austin May 22, 2015, pet. denied) (mem. op.). Upon review, we find some of the remaining information satisfies the standard articulated by the Texas Supreme Court in *Industrial Foundation*. We note some of the information at issue pertains to individuals who have been de-identified and whose privacy interests are, thus, protected. Accordingly, the department must withhold the information we marked and all identifiable public citizens' dates of birth under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy. However, we find you have failed to demonstrate any of the remaining information at issue is highly intimate or embarrassing and not of legitimate public concern. Therefore, the department may not withhold any of the remaining information under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy.

Section 552.130 of the Government Code excepts from disclosure information relating to a motor vehicle operator's or driver's license or permit issued by an agency of this state or another state or country. Gov't Code § 552.130(a)(1). Accordingly, the department must withhold the motor vehicle record information we have marked under section 552.130 of the Government Code.

You ask whether the submitted information can be provided to the requestor through an intergovernmental transfer. This office has concluded information subject to the Act may be transferred between governmental bodies without waiving exceptions to the public disclosure of that information. *See* Attorney General Opinion JM-590 (1986); Open Records Decision Nos. 655, 567 (1990), 561 (1990), 516 (1989). These decisions are based on the well-settled policy of this state that governmental agencies should cooperate with each other in the interest of the efficient and economical administration of their statutory duties. *See* ORD 516. However, the transfer of confidential information from one governmental body to another is prohibited where the relevant confidentiality statute authorizes release of the confidential information only to specific entities, and the requesting governmental body is not among the statute's enumerated entities. *See* Attorney

General Opinions DM-353 at 4 n.6 (1995) (intergovernmental transfer permitted under statutory confidentiality provision only where disclosure to another governmental agency is required or authorized by law), JM-590 at 4-5 (1986) (where governmental body is not included among expressly enumerated entities to which confidential information may be disclosed, information may not be transferred to that governmental body); *see also* Open Records Decision Nos. 655 (1997), 650 (1996) (transfer of confidential information to federal agency impermissible unless federal law requires its disclosure). Section 261.201 of the Family Code and section 552.130 of the Government Code are confidentiality statutes with their own release provisions. Therefore, Exhibit D and the information we marked under section 552.130 of the Government Code may not be released pursuant to the intergovernmental transfer doctrine. However, we note the doctrine of common-law privacy does not have specific release provisions governing public release of information. Thus, the department has the discretion to release the remaining information under the doctrine of common-law privacy pursuant to the intergovernmental transfer doctrine.

In summary, if the department determines release of the CHRI is consistent with the purposes of the Family Code, then the department must release the CHRI, but must withhold the remaining information in Exhibit D under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 261.201 of the Family Code. If the department determines release of the CHRI is not consistent with the purposes of the Family Code, then the department must withhold Exhibit D in its entirety under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 261.201 of the Family Code. If the department chooses not to exercise its discretion under the intergovernmental transfer doctrine, the department must withhold all identifiable public citizens' dates of birth under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy. The department must withhold the motor vehicle record information we have marked under section 552.130 of the Government Code. The remaining information must be released.

This letter ruling is limited to the particular information at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other information or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For more information concerning those rights and responsibilities, please visit our website at <https://www.texasattorneygeneral.gov/open-government/members-public/what-expect-after-ruling-issued> or call the OAG's Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. Questions concerning the allowable charges for providing public information under the Public Information Act may be directed to the Cost Rules Administrator of the OAG, toll free, at (888) 672-6787.

Sincerely,

Pearlie Gault
Attorney
Open Records Division

PG/be

Ref: ID# 857796

Enc. Submitted documents

c: Requestor
(w/o enclosures)