



KEN PAXTON
ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS

December 4, 2020

Ms. Dyanne Hargrove
Paralegal
City of Cedar Park
450 Cypress Creek Road
Cedar Park, Texas 78613

OR2020-30295

Dear Ms. Hargrove:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 856307 (Ref. No. 20-1432).

The Cedar Park Police Department (the "department") received a request for all reports pertaining to the requestor. You state you will release some information. You claim some of the submitted information is excepted from disclosure under sections 552.101 and 552.108 of the Government Code. We have considered the exceptions you claim and reviewed the submitted information.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code excepts from public disclosure "information considered to be confidential by law, either constitutional, statutory, or by judicial decision." Gov't Code § 552.101. This section encompasses information protected by section 261.201 of the Family Code, which provides, in part, as follows:

(a) [T]he following information is confidential, is not subject to public release under Chapter 552, Government Code, and may be disclosed only for purposes consistent with this code and applicable federal or state law or under rules adopted by an investigating agency:

(1) a report of alleged or suspected abuse or neglect made under this chapter and the identity of the person making the report; and

(2) except as otherwise provided in this section, the files, reports, records, communications, audiotapes, videotapes, and working

papers used or developed in an investigation under this chapter or in providing services as a result of an investigation.

Fam. Code § 261.201(a). Exhibit E was used or developed in an investigation of alleged or suspected child abuse or neglect conducted by the department. *See id.* §§ 101.003(a) (defining “child” for purposes of this section as person under 18 years of age who is not and has not been married or who has not had the disabilities of minority removed for general purposes), 261.001(1), (4) (defining “abuse” and “neglect” for purposes of chapter 261 of the Family Code). Accordingly, we find this information is subject to chapter 261 of the Family Code. In this instance, the requestor is a parent of the child victim listed in the information at issue and is alleged to have committed the suspected abuse or neglect. Thus, the requestor does not have a right of access to the information at issue under section 261.201(k). *See id.* § 261.201(k). The department states it has not adopted a rule that governs the release of this type of information. Given that assumption, we conclude the department must withhold Exhibit E under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 261.201 of the Family Code.¹ *See* Open Records Decision No. 440 at 2 (1986) (predecessor statute).

Section 552.108(a)(1) of the Government Code excepts from disclosure “[i]nformation held by a law enforcement agency or prosecutor that deals with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime . . . if . . . release of the information would interfere with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime[.]” Gov’t Code § 552.108(a)(1). A governmental body claiming section 552.108(a)(1) must explain how and why the release of the requested information would interfere with law enforcement. *See id.* §§ 552.108(a)(1), .301(e)(1)(A); *see also Ex parte Pruitt*, 551 S.W.2d 706 (Tex. 1977). The department states Exhibit D pertains to a pending criminal investigation. Based on this representation, we conclude the release of the information at issue would interfere with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime. *See Houston Chronicle Publ’g Co. v. City of Houston*, 531 S.W.2d 177 (Tex. Civ. App.—Houston [14th Dist.] 1975) (court delineates law enforcement interests that are present in active cases), *writ ref’d n.r.e. per curiam*, 536 S.W.2d 559 (Tex. 1976). Thus, section 552.108(a)(1) is applicable to Exhibit D.

Section 552.108(a)(2) of the Government Code excepts from disclosure information concerning an investigation that did not result in conviction or deferred adjudication. *See* Gov’t Code § 552.108(a)(2). A governmental body claiming section 552.108(a)(2) must demonstrate the requested information relates to a criminal investigation that has concluded in a final result other than a conviction or deferred adjudication. *See id.* § 552.301(e)(1)(A) (governmental body must provide comments explaining why exceptions raised should apply to information requested). The department states Exhibit C relates to a closed criminal investigation that did not result in a conviction or deferred adjudication. Based on this representation and our review, we agree section 552.108(a)(2) is applicable to Exhibit C.

However, section 552.108 does not except from disclosure basic information about an arrested person, an arrest, or a crime. *Id.* § 552.108(c). Basic information refers to the

¹ As our ruling is dispositive, we need not address the remaining arguments against disclosure of this information.

information held to be public in *Houston Chronicle*. See 531 S.W.2d at 186-88; Open Records Decision No. 127 (1976) (summarizing types of information considered to be basic information). Thus, with the exception of the basic information, which must be released, the department may withhold Exhibit D under section 552.108(a)(1) of the Government Code and may withhold Exhibit C under section 552.108(a)(2) of the Government Code.²

Section 552.101 of the Government Code also encompasses the doctrine of common-law privacy, which protects information that is (1) highly intimate or embarrassing, the publication of which would be highly objectionable to a reasonable person, and (2) not of legitimate concern to the public. *Indus. Found. v. Tex. Indus. Accident Bd.*, 540 S.W.2d 668, 685 (Tex. 1976). To demonstrate the applicability of common-law privacy, both prongs of this test must be satisfied. *Id.* at 681-82. Types of information considered intimate and embarrassing by the Texas Supreme Court are delineated in *Industrial Foundation*. *Id.* at 683. The Third Court of Appeals has concluded public citizens' dates of birth are protected by common-law privacy pursuant to section 552.101. See *Paxton v. City of Dallas*, No. 03-13-00546-CV, 2015 WL 3394061, at *3 (Tex. App.—Austin May 22, 2015, pet. denied) (mem. op.). Additionally, this office has concluded some kinds of medical information are generally highly intimate or embarrassing. See Open Records Decision No. 455 (1987). We note the requestor has a right of access to her own date of birth and her minor child's date of birth pursuant to section 552.023 of the Government Code. See Gov't Code § 552.023(a) ("person's authorized representative has special right of access, beyond right of general public, to information held by governmental body that relates to person and that is protected from public disclosure by laws intended to protect that person's privacy interests"); Open Records Decision No. 481 at 4 (1987) (privacy theories not implicated when individuals request information concerning themselves). Upon review, we conclude some of the remaining information meets the standard articulated by the Texas Supreme Court in *Industrial Foundation*. Accordingly, with the exception of the date of birth belonging to the requestor and her minor child, the department must withhold all public citizens' dates of birth and the information you marked under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy.

You state you will redact certain information pursuant to section 552.130(c) of the Government Code.³ Section 552.130 of the Government Code provides information relating to a motor vehicle operator's license, driver's license, motor vehicle title or registration, or personal identification document issued by an agency of this state or another state or country is excepted from public release. See Gov't Code § 552.130. We note section 552.130 protects personal privacy. Accordingly, the requestor has a right of access to her own motor vehicle record information pursuant to section 552.023 of the Government Code and it may not be withheld from her under section 552.130. See *id.* § 552.023(a); ORD 481 at 4. Accordingly, with the exception of the motor vehicle record information

² As our ruling is dispositive, we need not address the remaining argument against disclosure of this information.

³ Section 552.130(c) allows a governmental body to redact the information described in section 552.130(a) without the necessity of seeking a decision from the attorney general. See Gov't Code § 552.130(c). If a governmental body redacts such information, it must notify the requestor in accordance with section 552.130(e). See *id.* § 552.130(d), (e).

we marked for release, the department must withhold the motor vehicle record information you marked under section 552.130 of the Government Code.

In summary, the department must withhold Exhibit E under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 261.201 of the Family Code. With the exception of the basic information, which must be released, the department may withhold Exhibit D under section 552.108(a)(1) of the Government Code and may withhold Exhibit C under section 552.108(a)(2) of the Government Code. With the exception of the dates of birth belonging to the requestor and her minor child, the department must withhold all public citizens' dates of birth and the information you marked under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy. With the exception of the motor vehicle record information we marked for release, the department must withhold the motor vehicle record information you marked under section 552.130 of the Government Code. The department must release the remaining information.⁴

This letter ruling is limited to the particular information at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other information or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For more information concerning those rights and responsibilities, please visit our website at <https://www.texasattorneygeneral.gov/open-government/members-public/what-expect-after-ruling-issued> or call the OAG's Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. Questions concerning the allowable charges for providing public information under the Public Information Act may be directed to the Cost Rules Administrator of the OAG, toll free, at (888) 672-6787.

Sincerely,

Pearlie Gault
Attorney
Open Records Division

PG/mo

Ref: ID# 856307

Enc. Submitted documents

c: Requestor
(w/o enclosures)

⁴ We note the requestor has a right of access to some of the information being released. If the department receives another request for this information from a different requestor, the department must again seek a ruling from this office. *See* Gov't Code §§ 552.301, .302; Open Records Decision No. 673 (2001).