



KEN PAXTON
ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS

December 1, 2020

Ms. Nena Chima-Tetteh
Assistant City Attorney
Arlington Police Department
Mail Stop 04-0200
P.O. Box 1065
Arlington, Texas 76004-1065

OR2020-29848

Dear Ms. Chima-Tetteh:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 855573 (Ref. No. R104302).

The Arlington Police Department (the "department") received a request for certain information pertaining to a specified incident, including body worn camera recordings, dashboard and in-car camera recordings, 9-1-1 audio recordings and call sheets, and photographs.¹ You claim the submitted information is excepted from disclosure under section 552.101 of the Government Code. We have considered the exception you claim and reviewed the submitted information.

Initially, we note you have only submitted one body worn camera recording in response to the present request. Additionally, you do not inform us the department has released any information responsive to the other types of information sought in the present request. Although you state the department has submitted a representative sample of the requested information, we find the submitted information is not representative of all the types of information to which the requestor seeks access. Please be advised, this open records letter ruling applies only to the types of information the department has submitted for our review. This ruling does not authorize the department to withhold any information that is substantially different from the types of information you submitted to this office. *See* Gov't Code § 552.302 (where request for attorney general decision does not comply with

¹ We note the department sent the requestor a cost estimate of charges pursuant to section 552.2615 of the Government Code. *See* Gov't Code § 552.2615. The estimate of charges required the requestor to provide a deposit for payment of anticipated costs under section 552.263 of the Government Code. *See id.* § 552.263(a).

requirements of Gov't Code § 552.301, information at issue is presumed to be public). Accordingly, to the extent any information responsive to the remaining portions of the present request existed on the date the department received the request, we assume the department has released it to the requestor. If the department has not released any such information, it must do so at this time. *See id.* §§ 552.301(a), .302; *see also* Open Records Decision No. 664 (2000) (if governmental body concludes no exceptions apply to requested information, it must release information as soon as possible).

Section 552.101 of the Government Code excepts from disclosure “information considered to be confidential by law, either constitutional, statutory, or by judicial decision.” Gov't Code § 552.101. This section encompasses information made confidential by other statutes. We note the submitted information consists of a recording from a police officer's body worn camera. Section 1701.661(a) of the Occupations Code states the information a requestor must provide when seeking a body worn camera recording. *See* Occ. Code § 1701.661(a). We note the requestor provides the requisite information for the body worn camera recording at issue. However, section 1701.661(f) provides, in relevant part:

A law enforcement agency may not release any portion of a recording made in a private space . . . without written authorization from the person who is the subject of that portion of the recording or, if the person is deceased, from the person's authorized representative.

Id. § 1701.661(f). You assert the recording at issue was made in a private space and is therefore made confidential by section 1701.661(f). *See id.* § 1701.651(3) (defining “private space” for purposes of section 1701.661(f)). However, upon review, we find no portion of the submitted body worn camera recording was made in a private space. *See id.* Therefore, the department may not withhold any portion of the submitted information under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 1701.661(f) of the Occupations Code.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code also encompasses the doctrine of common-law privacy. *Indus. Found. v. Tex. Indus. Accident Bd.*, 540 S.W.2d 668, 685 (Tex. 1976). Under the common-law right of privacy, an individual has a right to be free from the publicizing of private affairs in which the public has no legitimate concern. *Id.* at 682. The court of appeals has concluded public citizens' dates of birth are protected by common-law privacy pursuant to section 552.101. *Paxton v. City of Dallas*, No. 03-13-00546-CV, 2015 WL 3394061, at *3 (Tex. App.—Austin May 22, 2015, pet. denied) (mem. op.). Accordingly, the department must withhold all audible and visible dates of birth of public citizens within the recording at issue under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy.

Section 552.130 of the Government Code excepts from public disclosure information relating to a motor vehicle operator's or driver's license, motor vehicle title or registration, or personal identification document issued by an agency of this state or another state or

country.² *See* Gov't Code § 552.130. Accordingly, the department must withhold all audible and visible license plates and registration stickers within the remaining recording at issue under section 552.130 of the Government Code.

In summary, the department must: (1) withhold all audible and visible dates of birth of public citizens within the recording at issue under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy; (2) withhold all audible and visible license plates and registration stickers within the remaining recording at issue under section 552.130 of the Government Code; and (3) release the remaining information.

This letter ruling is limited to the particular information at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other information or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For more information concerning those rights and responsibilities, please visit our website at <https://www.texasattorneygeneral.gov/open-government/members-public/what-expect-after-ruling-issued> or call the OAG's Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. Questions concerning the allowable charges for providing public information under the Public Information Act may be directed to the Cost Rules Administrator of the OAG, toll free, at (888) 672-6787.

Sincerely,

Blake Brennan
Assistant Attorney General
Open Records Division

BBX/be

Ref: ID# 855573

Enc. Submitted documents

c: Requestor
(w/o enclosures)

² The Office of the Attorney General will raise a mandatory exception on behalf of a governmental body, but ordinarily will not raise other exceptions. *See* Open Records Decision Nos. 481 (1987), 480 (1987), 470 (1987).