



KEN PAXTON
ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS

November 13, 2020

Ms. Julie Pandya Doshier
Counsel for the City of Allen
Nichols, Jackson, Dillard, Hager & Smith, L.L.P.
500 North Akard, Suite 1800
Dallas, Texas 75201

OR2020-28515

Dear Ms. Doshier:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 853527 (ORR# 117624).

The City of Allen (the "city"), which you represent, received a request for two specified incident reports. The city states it is withholding some of the requested information pursuant to sections 552.130(c) and 552.136(c) of the Government Code and Open Records Letter No. 2018-11817 (2017).¹ The city claims some of the submitted information is excepted from disclosure under sections 552.101 and 552.108 of the Government Code. We have considered the claimed exception and reviewed the submitted information.

Section 552.108(a)(2) of the Government Code excepts from disclosure information concerning an investigation that concluded in a result other than conviction or deferred

¹ Section 552.130(c) of the Government Code allows a governmental body to redact the information described in section 552.130(a) without the necessity of seeking a decision from the attorney general. See Gov't Code § 552.130(c). If a governmental body redacts such information, it must notify the requestor pursuant to section 552.130(e). See *id.* § 552.130(d), (e). Section 552.136 of the Government Code permits a governmental body to withhold the information described in section 552.136(b) without the necessity of seeking a decision from this office. See *id.* § 552.136(c). If a governmental body redacts such information, it must notify the requestor in accordance with section 552.136(e). See *id.* § 552.136(d), (e). Open Records Letter No. 2018-11817 authorizes the city to withhold dates of birth of members of the public under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy without the necessity of requesting an attorney general's decision. See *id.* § 552.301(a); Open Records Decision No. 673 at 7-8 (2001).

adjudication. Gov't Code § 552.108(a)(2). A governmental body claiming section 552.108(a)(2) must demonstrate the information at issue relates to a criminal investigation that has concluded in a final result other than conviction or deferred adjudication. *See id.* §§ 552.108(a)(2), .301(e)(1)(A). The city states the information it has marked under section 552.108(a)(2) pertains to cases that concluded in results other than conviction or deferred adjudication. Thus, the city may withhold the information it has marked under section 552.108(a)(2) of the Government Code.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code excepts from disclosure “information considered to be confidential by law, either constitutional, statutory, or by judicial decision.” Gov't Code § 552.101. This section encompasses the common-law physical safety exception that the Texas Supreme Court recognized in *Texas Department of Public Safety v. Cox Texas Newspapers, L.P. & Hearst Newspapers, L.L.C.*, 343 S.W.3d 112, 117 (Tex. 2011) (“freedom from physical harm is an independent interest protected under law, untethered to the right of privacy”). In the *Cox* decision, the Supreme Court recognized, for the first time, a common-law physical safety exception to required disclosure. *Cox*, 343 S.W.3d at 118. Pursuant to this common-law physical safety exception, the court determined “information may be withheld [from public release] if disclosure would create a substantial threat of physical harm.” *Id.* In applying this new standard, the court noted “deference must be afforded” law enforcement experts regarding the probability of harm, but further cautioned “vague assertions of risk will not carry the day.” *Id.* at 119. Upon review, we find the city has failed to establish the physical safety exception is applicable to any of the remaining information. Therefore, the city may not withhold any of the remaining information under section 552.101 on that ground.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code also encompasses the doctrine of common-law privacy, which protects information that is (1) highly intimate or embarrassing, the publication of which would be highly objectionable to a reasonable person, and (2) not of legitimate concern to the public. *Indus. Found. v. Tex. Indus. Accident Bd.*, 540 S.W.2d 668, 685 (Tex. 1976). To demonstrate the applicability of common-law privacy, both prongs of this test must be satisfied. *Id.* at 681-82. Types of information considered intimate and embarrassing by the Texas Supreme Court are delineated in the *Industrial Foundation* decision. *Id.* at 683. This office has found personal financial information not relating to the financial transaction between an individual and a governmental body is excepted from required public disclosure under common-law privacy. *See* Open Records Decision Nos. 600 (1992), 545 (1990). Upon review, we agree the information that the city has marked under common-law privacy satisfies the standard articulated by the Texas Supreme Court in the *Industrial Foundation* decision. Accordingly, the city must withhold the information it has marked under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy.

In summary, the city may withhold the information it has marked under section 552.108(a)(2) of the Government Code. The city must withhold the information it has marked under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy. The city must release the remaining information.

This letter ruling is limited to the particular information at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other information or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For more information concerning those rights and responsibilities, please visit our website at <https://www.texasattorneygeneral.gov/open-government/members-public/what-expect-after-ruling-issued> or call the OAG's Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. Questions concerning the allowable charges for providing public information under the Public Information Act may be directed to the Cost Rules Administrator of the OAG, toll free, at (888) 672-6787.

Sincerely,

James L. Coggeshall
Assistant Attorney General
Open Records Division

JLC/mo

Ref: ID# 853527

Enc. Submitted documents

c: Requestor
(w/o enclosures)