



KEN PAXTON
ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS

November 3, 2020

Ms. Tiffany Bangs
Assistant County Attorney
County of Harris
1019 Congress, 15th Floor
Houston, Texas 77002

OR2020-27550

Dear Ms. Bangs:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 852173 (C.A. File No. 20PIA0581).

The Office of the Harris County Constable, Precinct 4 (the "constable's office") received a request for information pertaining to a specified incident. You claim some of the submitted information is excepted from disclosure under section 552.108 of the Government Code. We have considered the exception you claim and reviewed the submitted information.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code excepts from disclosure "information considered to be confidential by law, either constitutional, statutory, or by judicial decision."¹ Gov't Code § 552.101. Section 552.101 encompasses section 58.008 of the Family Code, which provides, in part:

(b) Except as provided by Subsection (c), law enforcement records concerning a child and information concerning a child that are stored by electronic means or otherwise from which a record could be generated may not be disclosed to the public and shall be:

(1) if maintained on paper or microfilm, kept separate from adult records;

¹ The Office of the Attorney General will raise mandatory exceptions on behalf of a governmental body, but ordinarily will not raise other exceptions. See Open Records Decision Nos. 481 (1987), 480 (1987), 470 (1987).

(2) if maintained electronically in the same computer system as adult records, accessible only under controls that are separate and distinct from the controls to access electronic data concerning adults; and

(3) maintained on a local basis only and not sent to a central state or federal depository, except as provided by Subsection (c) or Subchapter B, D, or E.

...

(d) Law enforcement records concerning a child may be inspected or copied by:

(1) a juvenile justice agency, as defined by Section 58.101;

(2) a criminal justice agency, as defined by Section 411.082, Government Code;

(3) the child; or

(4) the child's parent or guardian.

(e) Before a child or a child's parent or guardian may inspect or copy a record concerning the child under Subsection (d), the custodian of the record shall redact:

...

(2) any information that is excepted from required disclosure under [the Act] or any other law.

Fam. Code § 58.008(b), (d), (e)(2); *see also id.* § 51.03(a)-(b) (defining “delinquent conduct” and “conduct indicating a need for supervision” for purposes of title 3 of Family Code). Section 58.008(b) is applicable to records of juvenile conduct that occurred before, on, or after September 1, 2017. *See id.* § 58.008(b). The juvenile must have been at least 10 years old and less than 17 years of age when the conduct occurred. *See id.* § 51.02(2) (defining “child” for purposes of title 3 of Family Code). We find the submitted information involves a juvenile offender, so as to fall within the scope of section 58.008(b). In this instance, however, the requestor may be a parent of the juvenile offender at issue and, thus, may have a right of access to the information at issue pursuant to section 58.008(d). *See id.* § 58.008(d). Therefore, we must rule conditionally. To the extent the requestor is not a parent of the juvenile offender, the constable's office must withhold the submitted information in its entirety under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 58.008(b) of the Family Code. If the requestor is a parent of the juvenile offender, the constable's office may not withhold the information at issue on that ground. *See id.* In that case, however, section 58.008(e)(2) states any information excepted

from required disclosure must be redacted. *See id.* § 58.008(e)(2). Thus, we will consider whether the submitted information is otherwise excepted from disclosure.

Section 552.108(a)(1) of the Government Code excepts from disclosure “[i]nformation held by a law enforcement agency or prosecutor that deals with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime . . . if . . . release of the information would interfere with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime[.]” Gov’t Code § 552.108(a)(1). A governmental body claiming section 552.108(a)(1) must explain how and why the release of the requested information would interfere with law enforcement. *See id.* §§ 552.108(a)(1), .301(e)(1)(A); *see also Ex parte Pruitt*, 551 S.W.2d 706 (Tex. 1977). The constable’s office states Exhibit B pertains to an active criminal investigation or prosecution. Based on this representation, we conclude the release of the information at issue would interfere with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime. *See Houston Chronicle Publ’g Co. v. City of Houston*, 531 S.W.2d 177 (Tex. Civ. App.—Houston [14th Dist.] 1975) (court delineates law enforcement interests that are present in active cases), *writ ref’d n.r.e. per curiam*, 536 S.W.2d 559 (Tex. 1976). Thus, section 552.108(a)(1) is applicable to Exhibit B.

However, we note section 552.108 does not except from disclosure basic information about an arrested person, an arrest, or a crime. Gov’t Code § 552.108(c). Basic information refers to the information held to be public in *Houston Chronicle*. *See* 531 S.W.2d at 186-88; Open Records Decision No. 127 (1976) (summarizing types of information considered to be basic information). Thus, with the exception of the basic information, which must be released, the constable’s office may withhold Exhibit B under section 552.108(a)(1) of the Government Code.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code also encompasses the doctrine of common-law privacy. *Indus. Found. v. Tex. Indus. Accident Bd.*, 540 S.W.2d 668, 685 (Tex. 1976). Under the common-law right of privacy, an individual has a right to be free from the publicizing of private affairs in which the public has no legitimate concern. *Id.* at 682. The Third Court of Appeals has concluded public citizens’ dates of birth are protected by common-law privacy pursuant to section 552.101. *See Paxton v. City of Dallas*, No. 03-13-00546-CV, 2015 WL 3394061, at *3 (Tex. App.—Austin May 22, 2015, pet. denied) (mem. op.). Thus, the constable’s office must withhold the public citizens’ dates of birth we marked under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy.

Section 552.130 of the Government Code provides information relating to a motor vehicle operator’s license, driver’s license, motor vehicle title or registration, or personal identification document issued by an agency of this state or another state or country is excepted from public release. *See* Gov’t Code § 552.130. Accordingly, the constable’s office must withhold the motor vehicle record information we marked under section 552.130 of the Government Code.

In summary, to the extent the requestor is not a parent of the juvenile offender, the constable’s office must withhold the submitted information in its entirety under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 58.008(b) of the Family Code. To the extent the requestor is a parent of the juvenile offender, the constable’s office: (1)

may, with the exception of the basic information, which must be released, withhold Exhibit B under section 552.108(a)(1) of the Government Code; (2) must withhold the public citizens' dates of birth we marked under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy; (3) must withhold the motor vehicle record information we marked under section 552.130 of the Government Code; and (4) must release the remaining information.²

This letter ruling is limited to the particular information at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other information or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For more information concerning those rights and responsibilities, please visit our website at <https://www.texasattorneygeneral.gov/open-government/members-public/what-expect-after-ruling-issued> or call the OAG's Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. Questions concerning the allowable charges for providing public information under the Public Information Act may be directed to the Cost Rules Administrator of the OAG, toll free, at (888) 672-6787.

Sincerely,

Meagan Hunter
Assistant Attorney General
Open Records Division

MH/jm

Ref: ID# 852173

Enc. Submitted documents

c: Requestor
(w/o enclosures)

² In this instance, the requestor has a right of access to the information being released. Therefore, the constable's office must again seek a decision from this office if it receives another request for the same information from another requestor.