



KEN PAXTON
ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS

November 2, 2020

Ms. Amanda Sandhu
Police Records Manager
City of North Richland Hills
P.O. Box 820609
North Richland Hills, Texas 76182-0609

OR2020-27474

Dear Ms. Sandhu:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 851863 (Ref. No. 20-1006).

The North Richland Hills Police Department (the "department") received a request for all e-mails involving a named employee and a specified topic during a stated time period.¹ You state the department will withhold e-mail addresses of members of the public under section 552.137 of the Government Code pursuant to Open Records Decision No. 684 (2009).² You state the department has released some of the requested information. You claim the submitted information is excepted from disclosure under section 552.108 of the Government Code. We have considered the exception you claim and reviewed the submitted information.

Initially, you inform us the department will withhold portions of the submitted information pursuant to the previous determination this office granted the department in Open Records

¹ We understand the requestor was required to make a deposit for payment of anticipated costs for the request under section 552.263 of the Government Code, which the department received on August 21, 2020. *See* Gov't Code § 552.263(e) (if governmental body requires deposit or bond for anticipated costs pursuant to section 552.263, request for information is considered to have been received on date that governmental body receives deposit or bond).

² Open Records Decision No. 684 is a previous determination to all governmental bodies authorizing them to withhold certain information, including an e-mail address of a member of the public under section 552.137 of the Government Code, without the necessity of requesting an attorney general decision.

Letter No. 2017-10552 (2017). Open Records Letter No. 2017-10552 authorizes the department to withhold certain information from a requestor under section 552.108(a)(1) of the Government Code in specified circumstances without the necessity of first requesting a ruling from this office. We note, however, that previous determination states “the department may not rely on [Open Records Letter No. 2017-10552] in response to requests in which basic information is not responsive. For example, no basic information is at issue in a request for only a dashboard camera video recording or 9-1-1 call audio recording. Thus, the department may not rely upon this previous determination in response to those types of requests.” In this instance, basic information is not at issue in the instant request. Therefore, the department is not authorized to rely upon Open Records Letter No. 2017-10552 to withhold the information at issue from the requestor under section 552.108 of the Government Code. Nevertheless, we will address your arguments against disclosure of the submitted information.

Section 552.108(a)(1) of the Government Code excepts from disclosure “[i]nformation held by a law enforcement agency or prosecutor that deals with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime . . . if . . . release of the information would interfere with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime[.]” Gov’t Code § 552.108(a)(1). A governmental body claiming section 552.108(a)(1) must explain how and why this exception is applicable to the information at issue. *See id.* §§ 552.108(a)(1), .301(e)(1)(A); *see also Ex parte Pruitt*, 551 S.W.2d 706 (Tex. 1977). You state portions of the submitted information, which you have marked, relate to pending criminal investigations. Based on this representation, we conclude release of the information you have marked will interfere with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime. *See Houston Chronicle Publ’g Co. v. City of Houston*, 531 S.W.2d 177 (Tex. Civ. App.—Houston [14th Dist.] 1975) (court delineates law enforcement interests that are present in active cases), *writ ref’d n.r.e. per curiam*, 536 S.W.2d 559 (Tex. 1976). Accordingly, we find the department may withhold the information you have marked under section 552.108(a)(1) of the Government Code.

Section 552.108(b)(1) of the Government Code excepts from disclosure the internal records and notations of law enforcement agencies and prosecutors when their release would interfere with law enforcement and crime prevention.³ Gov’t Code § 552.108(b)(1); *see also* Open Records Decision No. 531 at 2 (1989) (quoting *Ex parte Pruitt*, 551 S.W.2d 706 (Tex. 1977)). A governmental body claiming section 552.108(b)(1) must explain how and why the release of the requested information would interfere with law enforcement. *See* Gov’t Code §§ 552.108(b)(1), .301(e)(1)(A); *see also Ex parte Pruitt*, 551 S.W.2d 706. Section 552.108(b)(1) is intended to protect “information which, if released, would permit private citizens to anticipate weaknesses in a police department, avoid detection, jeopardize officer safety, and generally undermine police efforts to effectuate the laws of this State.” *See City of Fort Worth v. Cornyn*, 86 S.W.3d 320, 327 (Tex. App.—Austin 2002, no pet.). This office has concluded section 552.108(b)(1) excepts from public disclosure information relating to the security or operation of a law enforcement agency. *See, e.g.*, Open Records Decision Nos. 531 (release of detailed use of force guidelines would unduly interfere with law enforcement), 252 (1980) (section 552.108 of the Government Code is designed to

³ Although you do not cite to section 552.108(b)(1) of the Government Code in your brief to this office, we understand you to raise this section based on the substance of your argument.

protect investigative techniques and procedures used in law enforcement), 143 (1976) (disclosure of specific operations or specialized equipment directly related to investigation or detection of crime may be excepted). Section 552.108(b)(1) is not applicable, however, to generally known policies and procedures. *See, e.g.*, ORDs 531 at 2-3 (Penal Code provisions, common law rules, and constitutional limitations on use of force not protected), 252 at 3 (governmental body failed to indicate why investigative procedures and techniques requested were any different from those commonly known).

You state some of the remaining information, if released, would interfere with law enforcement or prosecution of crime. You argue “release of this information to members of the public could hinder future investigations and crime detection.” Additionally, you assert release of the information at issue “could potentially aid individuals who are participating in criminal activity to elude law enforcement detection.” Based on these representations and our review, we agree release of the information at issue, which you have marked, would interfere with law enforcement. Accordingly, the department may withhold the information you have marked under section 552.108(b)(1) of the Government Code.

Section 552.117(a)(1) of the Government Code excepts from disclosure the current and former home addresses and telephone numbers, emergency contact information, social security numbers, and family member information of current or former employees of a governmental body who request that this information be kept confidential under section 552.024 of the Government Code.⁴ Gov’t Code § 552.117(a)(1). Section 552.117(a)(1) also applies to the personal cellular telephone number of a current or former official or employee of a governmental body, provided the cellular telephone service is not paid by a governmental body. *See* Open Records Decision No. 506 at 5-6 (1988). Whether a particular piece of information is protected by section 552.117(a)(1) must be determined at the time the request for it is made. *See* Open Records Decision No. 530 at 5 (1989). Accordingly, a governmental body must withhold information under section 552.117(a)(1) on behalf of a current or former employee only if the individual made a request for confidentiality under section 552.024 prior to the date on which the request for this information was made. Therefore, if the employee whose information is at issue timely requested confidentiality under section 552.024 of the Government Code and the cellular telephone service is not paid for by a governmental body, the department must withhold the cellular telephone number we have marked under section 552.117(a)(1) of the Government Code. Conversely, if the employee at issue did not timely request confidentiality under section 552.024 or the cellular telephone service is paid for by a governmental body, the department may not withhold the information at issue under section 552.117(a)(1) of the Government Code.

Section 552.130 of the Government Code provides information relating to a motor vehicle operator’s license, driver’s license, motor vehicle title or registration, or personal identification document issued by an agency of this state or another state or country is

⁴ The Office of the Attorney General will raise mandatory exceptions on behalf of a governmental body, but ordinarily will not raise other exceptions. *See* Open Records Decision Nos. 481 (1987), 480 (1987), 470 (1987).

excepted from public release. *See* Gov't Code § 552.130. Accordingly, the department must withhold all visible license plates within the remaining information under section 552.130 of the Government Code.

In summary, the department may withhold the information you have marked under section 552.108(a)(1) of the Government Code. The department may withhold the information you have marked under section 552.108(b)(1) of the Government Code. If the employee whose information is at issue timely requested confidentiality under section 552.024 of the Government Code and the cellular telephone service is not paid for by a governmental body, the department must withhold the cellular telephone number we have marked under section 552.117(a)(1) of the Government Code. The department must withhold all visible license plates within the remaining information under section 552.130 of the Government Code. The department must release the remaining information.

This letter ruling is limited to the particular information at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other information or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For more information concerning those rights and responsibilities, please visit our website at <https://www.texasattorneygeneral.gov/open-government/members-public/what-expect-after-ruling-issued> or call the OAG's Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. Questions concerning the allowable charges for providing public information under the Public Information Act may be directed to the Cost Rules Administrator of the OAG, toll free, at (888) 672-6787.

Sincerely,

Alexandra C. Burks
Assistant Attorney General
Open Records Division

ACB/gw

Ref: ID# 851863

Enc. Submitted documents

c: Requestor
(w/o enclosures)