



KEN PAXTON
ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS

October 28, 2020

Mr. Justin Bradford Smith
Assistant District Attorney
27th Judicial District
P.O. Box 540
Belton, Texas 76513-0540

OR2020-27016

Dear Mr. Bradford:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 851751.

The 27th Judicial District Attorney's Office (the "district attorney's office") received a request for a specified prosecution file. The district attorney's office states it has released some of the requested information, but claims the submitted information is excepted from disclosure under section 552.101 of the Government Code. We have considered the claimed exception and reviewed the submitted information.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code excepts from disclosure "information considered to be confidential by law, either constitutional, statutory, or by judicial decision." Gov't Code § 552.101. Section 552.101 encompasses article 42A.256 of the Code of Criminal Procedure. Article 42A.256 is applicable to presentence investigation and postsentence reports and provides, in part, the following:

- (a) The judge by order may direct that any information and records that are not privileged and that are relevant to a presentence or postsentence report be released to a supervision officer conducting a presentence investigation under [subchapter F of Chapter 42A of the Code of Criminal Procedure] or preparing a postsentence report under Article 42A.259. The judge may also issue a subpoena to obtain that information.

(b) A presentence or postsentence report and all information obtained in connection with a presentence investigation or postsentence report are confidential and may be released only as:

(1) provided by:

(A) Subsection (c);

(B) Article 42A.255;

(C) Article 42A.257;

(D) Article 42A.259; or

(E) Section 614.017, Health and Safety Code; or

(2) directed by the judge for the effective supervision of the defendant.

Crim. Proc. Code art. 42A.256(a)-(b). The district attorney's office asserts Exhibit D consists of a presentence investigation report. The district attorney's office also asserts the release provisions in article 42A.256 are not applicable. Based on these representations, we conclude the district attorney's office must withhold Exhibit D under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with article 42A.256 of the Code of Criminal Procedure.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code also encompasses chapter 411 of the Government Code, which pertains to criminal history record information ("CHRI") generated by the National Crime Information Center or by the Texas Crime Information Center. Title 28, part 20 of the Code of Federal Regulations governs the release of CHRI that states obtain from the federal government or other states. Open Records Decision No. 565 (1990). The federal regulations allow each state to follow its individual law with respect to CHRI it generates. *Id.* Section 411.083 of the Government Code makes CHRI the Texas Department of Public Safety ("DPS") maintains confidential, except DPS may disseminate this information as provided in subchapters E-1 and F of chapter 411 of the Government Code. *See* Gov't Code § 411.083(a). Sections 411.083(b)(1) and 411.089(a) authorize a criminal justice agency to obtain CHRI, but a criminal justice agency may not release CHRI except to another criminal justice agency for a criminal justice purpose. *Id.* § 411.089(b)(1). Other entities specified in chapter 411 of the Government Code are entitled to obtain CHRI from DPS or another criminal justice agency; however, those entities may not release CHRI except as provided by chapter 411. *See generally id.* §§ 411.090-.127. Thus, any CHRI generated by the federal government or another state may not be made available to the requestor except in accordance with federal regulations. *See* ORD 565. However, driving record information is not made confidential by the confidentiality provisions that govern CHRI. *See* Gov't Code § 411.082(2)(B) (definition of CHRI does not include driving record information). In addition, section 411.083 does not apply to active warrant information or other information relating to one's current

involvement with the criminal justice system. *See id.* § 411.081(b) (police department allowed to disclose information pertaining to person's current involvement in the criminal justice system). Upon review, we find some of the information at issue, which we have marked, is confidential under section 411.083. Therefore, the district attorney's office must withhold the information we have marked under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 411.083 of the Government Code. However, the remaining information does not contain CHRI for purposes of chapter 411. Accordingly, the remaining information is not confidential under chapter 411, and the district attorney's office may not withhold it under section 552.101 of the Government Code on that ground.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code also encompasses the doctrine of common-law privacy, which protects information that is (1) highly intimate or embarrassing, the publication of which would be highly objectionable to a reasonable person, and (2) not of legitimate concern to the public. *Indus. Found. v. Tex. Indus. Accident Bd.*, 540 S.W.2d 668, 685 (Tex. 1976). To demonstrate the applicability of common-law privacy, both prongs of this test must be satisfied. *Id.* at 681-82. Types of information considered intimate and embarrassing by the Texas Supreme Court are delineated in the *Industrial Foundation* decision. *Id.* at 683. Additionally, this office has concluded some kinds of medical information are generally highly intimate or embarrassing. *See* Open Records Decision No. 455 (1987). A compilation of an individual's criminal history is highly embarrassing information, the publication of which would be highly objectionable to a reasonable person. *Cf. U.S. Dep't of Justice v. Reporters Comm. for Freedom of the Press*, 489 U.S. 749, 764 (1989) (finding significant privacy interest in compilation of individual's criminal history by recognizing distinction between public records found in courthouse files and local police stations and compiled summary of criminal history information). Furthermore, we find a compilation of a private citizen's criminal history is generally not of legitimate concern to the public. The Third Court of Appeals has concluded public citizens' dates of birth are protected by common-law privacy pursuant to section 552.101. *See Paxton v. City of Dallas*, No. 03-13-00546-CV, 2015 WL 3394061, at *3 (Tex. App.—Austin May 22, 2015, pet. denied) (mem. op.). The district attorney's office must withhold the submitted date of birth under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy. We also find some of the remaining information, which we have marked, satisfies the standard articulated by the Texas Supreme Court in the *Industrial Foundation* decision. Accordingly, the district attorney's office must also withhold the information we have marked under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy. However, the remaining information is not confidential under common-law privacy, and the district attorney's office may not withhold it under section 552.101 on that ground.

Section 552.130 of the Government Code provides information relating to a motor vehicle operator's license, driver's license, motor vehicle title or registration, or personal identification document issued by an agency of this state or another state or country is excepted from public release.¹ *See* Gov't Code § 552.130. The district attorney's office

¹ The Office of the Attorney General will raise a mandatory exception on behalf of a governmental body. *See* Open Records Decision Nos. 481 at 2 (1987), 480 at 5 (1987).

must withhold the submitted driver's license number, type, and issuing state and the information we have marked under section 552.130 of the Government Code.

In summary, the district attorney's office must withhold the following: (1) Exhibit D under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with article 42A.256 of the Code of Criminal Procedure; (2) the information we have marked under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 411.083 of the Government Code; (3) the submitted date of birth and the information we have marked under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy; and (4) the submitted driver's license number, type, and issuing state and the information we have marked under section 552.130 of the Government Code. The district attorney's office must release the remaining information.

This letter ruling is limited to the particular information at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other information or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For more information concerning those rights and responsibilities, please visit our website at <https://www.texasattorneygeneral.gov/open-government/members-public/what-expect-after-ruling-issued> or call the OAG's Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. Questions concerning the allowable charges for providing public information under the Public Information Act may be directed to the Cost Rules Administrator of the OAG, toll free, at (888) 672-6787.

Sincerely,

James L. Coggeshall
Assistant Attorney General
Open Records Division

JLC/jm

Ref: ID# 851751

Enc. Submitted documents

c: Requestor
(w/o enclosures)