



KEN PAXTON
ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS

October 27, 2020

Ms. Mia M. Martin
General Counsel
Richardson Independent School District
400 South Greenville Avenue
Richardson, Texas 75081-4198

OR2020-26896

Dear Ms. Martin:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 850651.

The Richardson Independent School District (the "district") received a request for information related to incidents that resulted in injuries, including a specified incident involving the injury of a named individual. The district claims the submitted information is excepted from disclosure under sections 552.101, 552.102, 552.117, and 552.147 of the Government Code. We have considered the exceptions the district claims and reviewed the submitted representative sample of information.¹

Section 552.101 of the Government Code excepts from disclosure "information considered to be confidential by law, either constitutional, statutory, or by judicial decision." Gov't Code § 552.101. Section 552.101 encompasses information made confidential by the Medical Practice Act ("MPA"), subtitle B of title 3 of the Occupations Code, which governs release of medical records. Section 159.002 of the MPA provides, in relevant part:

(a) A communication between a physician and a patient, relative to or in connection with any professional services as a physician to the patient, is

¹ We assume the "representative sample" of records submitted to this office is truly representative of the requested records as a whole. See Open Records Decision Nos. 499 (1988), 497 (1988). This open records letter does not reach, and therefore does not authorize the withholding of, any other requested records to the extent those records contain substantially different types of information than that submitted to this office.

confidential and privileged and may not be disclosed except as provided by this chapter.

(b) A record of the identity, diagnosis, evaluation, or treatment of a patient by a physician that is created or maintained by a physician is confidential and privileged and may not be disclosed except as provided by this chapter.

(c) A person who receives information from a confidential communication or record as described by this chapter, other than a person listed in Section 159.004 who is acting on the patient's behalf, may not disclose the information except to the extent that disclosure is consistent with the authorized purposes for which the information was first obtained.

Occ. Code § 159.002(a)-(c). Information subject to the MPA includes both medical records and information obtained from those medical records. *See id.* §§ 159.002, .004. This office has concluded the protection afforded by section 159.002 extends only to records created by either a physician or someone under the supervision of a physician. *See* Open Records Decision Nos. 487 (1987), 370 (1983), 343 (1982). We have further found when a file is created as a result of a hospital stay, all the documents in the file referring to diagnosis and treatment constitute physician-patient communications or “[r]ecords of the identity, diagnosis, evaluation, or treatment of a patient by a physician that are created or maintained by a physician.” Open Records Decision No. 546 (1990).

Upon review, we find some of the submitted information, which we have marked, constitutes records of the identity, diagnosis, evaluation, or treatment of a patient by a physician that were created or are maintained by a physician and information obtained from a patient's medical records. Accordingly, the district must withhold the marked information under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with the MPA. However, we find the district has not demonstrated any portion of the remaining information consists of medical records for purposes of the MPA, and the district may not withhold any of the remaining information under section 552.101 on that basis.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code also encompasses information made confidential by section 402.083 of the Labor Code. Section 402.083 provides, in part, “[i]nformation in or derived from a claim file regarding an employee is confidential and may not be disclosed by the [Division of Workers' Compensation for the Texas Department of Insurance (the “division”)] except as provided by this subtitle or other law.” Labor Code § 402.083(a). In Open Records Decision No. 533 (1989), this office construed the predecessor to section 402.083(a) to apply only to information the governmental body obtained from the Industrial Accident Board, subsequently the Texas Workers' Compensation Commission, and now the division. *See* ORD 533 at 3-6; *see also* Labor Code § 402.086 (transferring confidentiality conferred by section 402.083(a) of the Labor Code to information other parties obtain from division files). Additionally, this office has interpreted section 402.083 to generally protect only that “information in or derived from a claim file that explicitly or implicitly discloses the identities of employees who file workers' compensation claims.” *See* Open Records Decision No. 619 at 10 (1993). However, we also have stated, “[w]hether specific information implicitly discloses the identity of a particular employee

must be determined on a case-by-case basis.” *Id.* Prior decisions of this office have found information revealing the date of injury, as well as an injured employee’s name, beneficiary name, commission claim number, social security number, home telephone number, home address, and date of birth implicitly or explicitly identifies claimants and is therefore excepted from disclosure under section 552.101 in conjunction with section 402.083.² The district asserts the information it marked is derived from claim files obtained from the division and implicitly or explicitly discloses the identities of employees who filed workers’ compensation claims. Upon review, we find some of the information at issue, which we marked, is subject to section 402.083(a). Accordingly, the district must withhold the information we marked under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 402.083 of the Labor Code. However, we find the district has not demonstrated it received any of the remaining records from the division. Therefore, the district has not demonstrated the applicability of section 402.083 to any of the remaining information at issue. Thus, the district may not withhold any of the remaining information under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 402.083(a) of the Labor Code.

Section 552.102(a) of the Government Code excepts from disclosure “information in a personnel file, the disclosure of which would constitute a clearly unwarranted invasion of personal privacy.” Gov’t Code § 552.102(a). The Texas Supreme Court held section 552.102(a) excepts from disclosure the dates of birth of state employees in the payroll database of the Texas Comptroller of Public Accounts. *Tex. Comptroller of Pub. Accounts v. Attorney Gen. of Tex.*, 354 S.W.3d 336 (Tex. 2010). Accordingly, the district must withhold the employees’ dates of birth we marked under section 552.102(a) of the Government Code. However, we find no portion of the remaining information is subject to section 552.102(a) of the Government Code, and the district may not withhold any of the remaining information on that basis.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code also encompasses the doctrine of common-law privacy, which protects information that is (1) highly intimate or embarrassing, the publication of which would be highly objectionable to a reasonable person, and (2) not of legitimate concern to the public. *Indus. Found. v. Tex. Indus. Accident Bd.*, 540 S.W.2d 668, 685 (Tex. 1976). To demonstrate the applicability of common-law privacy, both prongs of this test must be satisfied. *Id.* at 681-82. Types of information considered intimate and embarrassing by the Texas Supreme Court are delineated in *Industrial Foundation*. *Id.* at 683. Additionally, this office has concluded some kinds of medical information are generally highly intimate or embarrassing. See Open Records Decision No. 455 (1987). Upon review, we find some of the remaining information, which we marked, satisfies the standard articulated by the Texas Supreme Court in *Industrial Foundation*. Therefore, the district must withhold the information we marked under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy.

Section 552.117(a)(1) of the Government Code excepts from disclosure the home address and telephone number, emergency contact information, social security number, and family

² The “commission” refers to the predecessor agency of the division, which was established under House Bill 7, 79th Legislature, R.S. (2005).

member information of a current or former employee or official of a governmental body who requests this information be kept confidential under section 552.024 of the Government Code, except as provided by section 552.024(a-1). *See* Gov't Code §§ 552.117(a)(1), .024. Section 552.024(a-1) of the Government Code provides, "A school district may not require an employee or former employee of the district to choose whether to allow public access to the employee's or former employee's social security number." *Id.* § 552.024(a-1). Thus, the district may only withhold under section 552.117 the home address and telephone number, emergency contact information, and family member information of a current or former employee or official of the district who requests this information be kept confidential under section 552.024. Whether a particular item of information is protected by section 552.117(a)(1) must be determined at the time of the governmental body's receipt of the request for the information. *See* Open Records Decision No. 530 at 5 (1989). Thus, information may only be withheld under section 552.117(a)(1) on behalf of a current or former employee who made a request for confidentiality under section 552.024 prior to the date of the governmental body's receipt of the request for the information. The district informs us the individuals whose information is at issue timely requested confidentiality under section 552.024 of the Government Code. Therefore, the district must withhold the information we marked under section 552.117(a)(1) of the Government Code.

Section 552.147(a-1) of the Government Code provides, "The social security number of an employee of a school district in the custody of the district is confidential."³ Gov't Code § 552.147(a-1). Thus, section 552.147(a-1) makes the social security numbers of school district employees confidential, without such employees being required to first make a confidentiality election under section 552.024 of the Government Code. *Id.* § 552.024(a-1) (school district may not require employee or former employee of district to choose whether to allow public access to employee's or former employee's social security number). Reading sections 552.024(a-1) and 552.147(a-1) together, we conclude section 552.147(a-1) makes confidential the social security numbers of both current and former school district employees. Accordingly, the district must withhold the social security numbers we marked under section 552.147(a-1) of the Government Code.

In summary, the district must withhold the information we marked under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with the MPA. The district must withhold the information we marked under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 402.083 of the Labor Code. The district must withhold the employees' dates of birth we marked under section 552.102(a) of the Government Code. The district must withhold the information we marked under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy. The district must withhold the information we marked under section 552.117(a)(1) of the Government Code. The district must withhold the social security numbers we marked under section 552.147(a-1) of the Government Code. The district must release the remaining information.

³ The Office of the Attorney General will raise a mandatory exception on behalf of a governmental body, but ordinarily will not raise other exceptions. *See* Open Records Decision Nos. 481 (1987), 480 (1987), 470 (1987).

This letter ruling is limited to the particular information at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other information or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For more information concerning those rights and responsibilities, please visit our website at <https://www.texasattorneygeneral.gov/open-government/members-public/what-expect-after-ruling-issued> or call the OAG's Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. Questions concerning the allowable charges for providing public information under the Public Information Act may be directed to the Cost Rules Administrator of the OAG, toll free, at (888) 672-6787.

Sincerely,

Claire V. Morris Sloan
Assistant Attorney General
Open Records Division

CVMS/jxd

Ref: ID# 850651

Enc. Submitted documents

c: Requestor
(w/o enclosures)