



KEN PAXTON
ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS

October 16, 2020

Ms. Audrea Hutson
Open Records
Williamson County Sheriff's Office
508 South Rock Street
Georgetown, Texas 78626

OR2020-26074

Dear Ms. Hutson:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 848988.

The Williamson County Sheriff's Office (the "sheriff's office") received a request for information related to a specified incident involving a named individual. You state you will redact dates of birth of members of the public pursuant to the previous determination issued in Open Records Letter No. 2016-21706 (2016).¹ You claim the submitted information is excepted from disclosure under section 552.101 of the Government Code. We have considered the exception you claim and reviewed the submitted information.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code excepts from public disclosure "information considered to be confidential by law, either constitutional, statutory, or by judicial decision." Gov't Code § 552.101. This section encompasses section 58.008 of the Family Code, which provides, in part:

(b) Except as provided by Subsection (c), law enforcement records concerning a child and information concerning a child that are stored by electronic means or otherwise and from which a record could be generated may not be disclosed to the public and shall be:

¹ Open Records Letter No. 2016-21607 is a previous determination issued to the sheriff's office authorizing it to withhold dates of birth of members of the public under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy without the necessity of requesting an attorney general's decision.

(1) if maintained on paper or microfilm, kept separate from adult records;

(2) if maintained electronically in the same computer system as adult records, accessible only under controls that are separate and distinct from the controls to access electronic data concerning adults; and

(3) maintained on a local basis only and not sent to a central state or federal depository, except as provided by Subsection (c) or Subchapter B, D, or E.

...

(d) Law enforcement records concerning a child may be inspected or copied by:

...

(2) a criminal justice agency, as defined by Section 411.082, Government Code[.]

Fam. Code § 58.008(b), (d)(2); *see also id.* § 51.03(a)-(b) (defining “delinquent conduct” and “conduct indicating a need for supervision” for purposes of title 3 of Family Code). Section 58.008(b) is applicable to records of juvenile conduct that occurred before, on, or after September 1, 2017. *See* Act of May 28, 2017, 85th Leg., R.S., ch. 746, § 22, 2017 Tex. Sess. Law Serv. 3173, 3187. The juvenile must have been at least 10 years old and less than 17 years of age when the conduct occurred. *See* Fam. Code § 51.02(2) (defining “child” for purposes of title 3 of Family Code). You assert, and we agree, the submitted information involves juvenile offenders so as to fall within the scope of section 58.008(b).

We note the submitted information lists the named individual as a suspect who was an adult at the time of the incident at issue. Although the requestor is a representative of the Federal Bureau of Investigation National Instant Criminal Background Check System (the “FBI”), the requestor is seeking information about an adult arrestee and not the juvenile offenders identified in the submitted information. Thus, we conclude the requestor does not have a right of access to the submitted information under section 58.008(d) of the Family Code. *See id.* § 58.008(d)(2) (providing “[l]aw enforcement records concerning a child may be inspected or copied by a criminal justice agency as that term is defined by Section 411.082, Government Code[.]”). Therefore, the submitted information is generally confidential under section 58.008 of the Family Code.

We note, however, section 411.089(a) of the Government Code provides that “[a] criminal justice agency is entitled to obtain from the [Texas Department of Public Safety] any criminal history record information [(“CHRI”)] maintained by the [Texas Department of Public Safety] about a person.” *See* Gov’t Code § 411.089(a). In addition, section 411.087(a) of the Government Code provides in pertinent part the following:

(a) [A] person, agency, department, political subdivision, or other entity that is authorized by this subchapter or Subchapter E-1 to obtain from the [Texas Department of Public Safety] [CHRI] maintained by the [Texas Department of Public Safety] that relates to another person is authorized to:

...

(2) obtain from any other criminal justice agency in this state [CHRI] maintained by that criminal justice agency that relates to that person.

Id. § 411.087(a)(2). We note CHRI is defined as “information collected about a person by a criminal justice agency that consists of identifiable descriptions and notations of arrests, detentions, indictments, informations, and other formal criminal charges and their dispositions.” *See id.* § 411.082(2). We note the submitted information contains CHRI of the individual named in the request. However, a criminal justice agency that receives CHRI from another criminal justice agency pursuant to section 411.087(a)(2) may only receive such information for a criminal justice purpose. *See id.* §§ 411.083(c), .087(b); *see also* Open Records Decision No. 655 (1997) (discussing limitations on release of CHRI).

Section 411.082 of the Government Code defines a “criminal justice agency” as including “a federal or state agency that is engaged in the administration of criminal justice under a statute or executive order and that allocates a substantial portion of its annual budget to the administration of criminal justice[.]” Gov’t Code § 411.082(3)(A). “Administration of criminal justice” has the meaning assigned to it by article 66.001 of the Code of Criminal Procedure. *See id.* § 411.082(1). Article 66.001 defines “administration of criminal justice” as “the detection, apprehension, detention, pretrial release, post-trial release, prosecution, adjudication, correctional supervision, or rehabilitation of an offender. The term includes criminal identification activities and the collection, storage, and dissemination of [CHRI].” Crim. Proc. Code art. 66.001(1). Upon review, we find the FBI is a criminal justice agency as defined by section 411.082, and the requestor intends to use the CHRI for a criminal justice purpose. Consequently, pursuant to section 411.087(a)(2), the sheriff’s office must generally make available to the requestor information pertaining to the named individual that shows the types of allegation made and whether there was an arrest, information, indictment, detention, conviction, or other formal charges and their dispositions. Thus, there is a conflict between the confidentiality provided by section 58.008(b) of the Family Code and the requestor’s right of access under section 411.087(a)(2) of the Government Code.

Where information falls within both a general and a specific statutory provision, the specific provision prevails over the general statute. *See* Gov’t Code § 311.026 (where general statutory provision conflicts with specific provision, specific provision prevails as exception to general provision unless the general provision is the later enactment and the manifest intent is that the general provision prevail); *Cuellar v. State*, 521 S.W.2d 277 (Tex. Crim. App. 1975) (under well-established rule of statutory construction, specific statutory provisions prevail over general ones). In this instance, although section 58.008(b) of the Family Code generally makes juvenile law enforcement records confidential, section 411.087(a)(2) of the Government Code gives specific types of requestors, criminal

justice agencies, access to particular information, CHRI, for a criminal justice purpose. Thus, the statutory right of access granted to the requestor by section 411.087(a)(2) of the Government Code prevails over the more general confidentiality provision of section 58.008(b) of the Family Code. Therefore, notwithstanding section 58.008(b), the sheriff's office must generally make available to the requestor the information pertaining to the named individual that shows the types of allegations made and whether there was an arrest, information, indictment, detention, conviction, or other formal charges and their dispositions pursuant to section 411.087(a)(2) of the Government Code. Although you also seek to withhold the submitted information under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy, we note a specific statutory right of access prevails over a claim under common-law privacy. *See Collins v. Tex Mall, L.P.*, 297 S.W.3d 409, 415 (Tex. App.—Fort Worth 2009, no pet.) (statutory provision controls and preempts common law only when statute directly conflicts with common-law principle); *see also CenterPoint Energy Houston Elec. LLC v. Harris County Toll Rd. Auth.*, 436 F.3d 541, 544 (5th Cir. 2006) (common law controls only where there is no conflicting or controlling statutory law). Therefore, the sheriff's office may not withhold the CHRI at issue under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy. The sheriff's office must generally withhold the remaining information under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 58.008(b) of the Family Code.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code also encompasses section 261.201(a) of the Family Code, which provides as follows:

Except as provided by Section 261.203, the following information is confidential, is not subject to public release under [the Act] and may be disclosed only for purposes consistent with this code and applicable federal or state law or under rules adopted by an investigating agency:

- (1) a report of alleged or suspected abuse or neglect made under this chapter and the identity of the person making the report; and
- (2) except as otherwise provided in this section, the files, reports, records, communications, audiotapes, videotapes, and working papers used or developed in an investigation under this chapter or in providing services as a result of an investigation.

Fam. Code § 261.201(a). The submitted information relates to an investigation of alleged or suspected child abuse or neglect. *See id.* § 261.001(1), (4) (defining “abuse” and “neglect” for purposes of chapter 261 of the Family Code); *see also id.* § 101.003(a) (defining “child” for purposes of this section as person under 18 years of age who is not and has not been married or who has not had the disabilities of minority removed for general purposes). Accordingly, we find this information is subject to section 261.201 of the Family Code. You do not indicate the sheriff's office has adopted a rule that governs the release of this type of information. Therefore, we assume no such regulation exists. Given that assumption, we conclude the submitted information is generally confidential pursuant to section 261.201(a) of the Family Code. *See id.* § 261.201(a). However,

section 261.201(a) provides information encompassed by subsection (a) may be disclosed “for purposes consistent with [the Family Code] and applicable federal or state law.” *See id.* Chapter 411 of the Government Code constitutes “applicable state law” in this instance.

As noted above the requestor is a representative of the FBI, which is a criminal justice agency as defined by section 411.082 of the Government Code. As further noted above, the requestor intends to use the CHRI for a criminal justice purpose. However, we are unable to determine whether the requestor intends to use the CHRI for purposes consistent with the Family Code. Thus, we must rule conditionally. If the sheriff’s office determines the requestor does not intend to use the CHRI for purposes consistent with the Family Code, then it must withhold the submitted information in its entirety under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 261.201(a) of the Family Code. However, if the sheriff’s office determines the requestor intends to use the CHRI for purposes consistent with the Family Code, then the requestor is authorized by section 411.087 of the Government Code to obtain CHRI from the sheriff’s office regarding the named individual. *See Gov’t Code § 411.087(a)(2).*

In summary, if the sheriff’s office determines the requestor does not intend to use the CHRI for purposes consistent with the Family Code, then it must withhold the submitted information in its entirety under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 261.201(a) of the Family Code. If the sheriff’s office determines the requestor intends to use the CHRI for purposes consistent with the Family Code, then the sheriff’s office must release the CHRI to this requestor pursuant to section 411.1087 of the Government Code, but withhold the remaining information under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with sections 58.008(b) and 261.201(a) of the Family Code.

This letter ruling is limited to the particular information at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other information or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For more information concerning those rights and responsibilities, please visit our website at <https://www.texasattorneygeneral.gov/open-government/members-public/what-expect-after-ruling-issued> or call the OAG’s Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. Questions concerning the allowable charges for providing public information under the Public Information Act may be directed to the Cost Rules Administrator of the OAG, toll free, at (888) 672-6787.

Sincerely,

Tim Neal
Assistant Attorney General
Open Records Division

TN/jm

Ms. Andrea Hutson - Page 6

Ref: ID# 848988

Enc. Submitted documents

c: Requestor
(w/o enclosures)