



KEN PAXTON
ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS

October 5, 2020

Ms. Justine Tan
Assistant Criminal District Attorney
Galveston County
600 59th Street, Suite 1001
Galveston, Texas 77551

OR2020-24976

Dear Ms. Tan:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 848650 (ORR# 20-136).

The Galveston County Sheriff's Office (the "sheriff's office") received a request for all reports involving the requestor and two named individuals during a specified time period. The sheriff's office states it is releasing some of the requested information. The sheriff's office claims the submitted information is excepted from disclosure under sections 552.101, 552.108, and 552.130 of the Government Code. We have considered the exceptions the sheriff's office claims and reviewed the submitted information.

Section 552.108 of the Government Code provides, in relevant part:

(a) Information held by a law enforcement agency or prosecutor that deals with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime is excepted from [required public disclosure] if:

- (1) release of the information would interfere with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime; [or]
- (2) it is information that deals with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime only in relation to an investigation that did not result in conviction or deferred adjudication[.]

Gov't Code § 552.108(a)(1)-(2). A governmental body claiming section 552.108(a)(1) must explain how and why the release of the information at issue would interfere with law

enforcement. *See id.* §§ 552.108(a)(1), .301(e)(1)(A); *see also Ex parte Pruitt*, 551 S.W.2d 706, 710 (Tex. 1977). A governmental body claiming section 552.108(a)(2) must demonstrate the information at issue relates to a closed criminal investigation that concluded in a final result other than conviction or deferred adjudication. *See Gov't Code* §§ 552.108(b)(1), .301(e)(1)(A) (governmental body must provide comments explaining why exceptions raised should apply to information requested).

The sheriff's office claims section 552.108(a)(1) of the Government Code for the submitted information, and states the submitted information relates to an investigation of an incident that "is pending, and the requested information contains information that may be introduced at trial." Further, the sheriff's office states "Facts are still being gathered relating to this incident, and release of the requested information may ultimately hinder the investigation and prosecution of this case[.]" The sheriff's office also claims section 552.108(a)(2) of the Government Code for the submitted information and states the submitted information relates to an "investigation [that] is closed and did not result in a conviction or deferred adjudication." The sheriff's office explains "no warrant was issued and the alleged suspect in the reports was never arrested." Based on these conflicting representations, we are unable to determine whether the submitted report relates to an ongoing criminal case or to a closed case that did not result in conviction or deferred adjudication. Thus, we find the sheriff's office has failed to demonstrate the applicability of section 552.108(a)(1) or section 552.108(a)(2) to the information at issue. Therefore, the sheriff's office may not withhold any of the information at issue under section 552.108 of the Government Code.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code excepts from disclosure "information considered to be confidential by law, either constitutional, statutory, or by judicial decision."¹ Gov't Code § 552.101. Section 552.101 encompasses the doctrine of common-law privacy. *Indus. Found. v. Tex. Indus. Accident Bd.*, 540 S.W.2d 668, 685 (Tex. 1976). Under the common-law right of privacy, an individual has a right to be free from the publicizing of private affairs in which the public has no legitimate concern. *Id.* at 682. The Third Court of Appeals has concluded public citizens' dates of birth are protected by common-law privacy pursuant to section 552.101. *See Paxton v. City of Dallas*, No. 03-13-00546-CV, 2015 WL 3394061, at *3 (Tex. App.—Austin May 22, 2015, pet. denied) (mem. op.). Thus, with the exception of the requestor's date of birth, to which the requestor has a right of access pursuant to section 552.023 of the Government Code, the sheriff's office must withhold all public citizens' dates of birth under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy. *See Gov't Code* § 552.023(a) ("person's authorized representative has special right of access, beyond right of general public, to information held by governmental body that relates to person and that is protected from public disclosure by laws intended to protect that person's privacy interests"); Open Records Decision No. 481 at 4 (1987) (privacy theories not implicated when individual requests information concerning herself).

¹ The Office of the Attorney General will raise mandatory exceptions on behalf of a governmental body, but ordinarily will not raise other exceptions. *See Open Records Decision* Nos. 481 (1987), 480 (1987), 470 (1987).

Section 552.130 of the Government Code provides information relating to a motor vehicle operator's license, driver's license, motor vehicle title or registration, or personal identification document issued by an agency of this state or another state or country is excepted from public release. *See* Gov't Code § 552.130. Accordingly, the sheriff's office must withhold the motor vehicle record information it marked under section 552.130 of the Government Code.

In summary, with the exception of the requestor's date of birth, the sheriff's office must withhold all public citizens' dates of birth under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy. The sheriff's office must withhold the motor vehicle record information it marked under section 552.130 of the Government Code. The sheriff's office must release the remaining information to this requestor.²

This letter ruling is limited to the particular information at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other information or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For more information concerning those rights and responsibilities, please visit our website at <https://www.texasattorneygeneral.gov/open-government/members-public/what-expect-after-ruling-issued> or call the OAG's Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. Questions concerning the allowable charges for providing public information under the Public Information Act may be directed to the Cost Rules Administrator of the OAG, toll free, at (888) 672-6787.

Sincerely,

Claire V. Morris Sloan
Assistant Attorney General
Open Records Division

CVMS/mo

Ref: ID# 848650

Enc. Submitted documents

c: Requestor
(w/o enclosures)

² We note the requestor has a right of access to some of the information being released. *See* Gov't Code § 552.023(a); ORD 481 at 4. Thus, if the sheriff's office receives another request for the same information from a different requestor, the sheriff's office must again seek a decision from this office.