



KEN PAXTON
ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS

September 29, 2020

Ms. Shannon Montgomery
City Secretary
City of Rhome
PO Box 228
Rhome, Texas 76078

OR2020-24368

Dear Ms. Montgomery:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 846657.

The City of Rhome (the "city") received a request for information pertaining to a specified arrest involving the requestor. You claim the submitted information is excepted from disclosure under sections 552.101 and 552.108 of the Government Code. We have considered the exceptions you claim and reviewed the submitted information.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code excepts "information considered to be confidential by law, either constitutional, statutory, or by judicial decision." Gov't Code § 552.101. Section 552.101 encompasses other statutes, such as the federal Driver's Privacy Protection Act of 1994 (the "DPPA"), section 2721 of title 18 of the United States Code. Section 2721 provides, in part, the following:

(a) In general — A State department of motor vehicles, and any officer, employee, or contractor thereof, shall not knowingly disclose or otherwise make available to any person or entity:

(1) personal information, as defined in 18 U.S.C. 2725(3), about any individual obtained by the department in connection with a motor vehicle record, except as provided in subsection (b) of this section;
or

(2) highly restricted personal information, as defined in 18 U.S.C. 2725(4), about any individual obtained by the department in connection with a motor vehicle record, without the express consent of the person to whom such information applies, except uses permitted in subsections (b)(1), (b)(4), (b)(6), and (b)(9)[.]

(b) Permissible uses.—Personal information referred to in subsection (a) . . . and, subject to subsection (a)(2), may be disclosed as follows:

(1) For use by any government agency . . . in carrying out its functions.

. . .

(c) Resale or redisclosure.—An authorized recipient of personal information (except a recipient under subsection (b)(11) or (12)) may resell or redisclose the information only for a use permitted under subsection (b) (but not for uses under subsection (b)(11) or (12)). . . . Any authorized recipient (except a recipient under subsection (b)(11)) that resells or rediscloses personal information covered by this chapter must keep for a period of 5 years records identifying each person or entity that receives information and the permitted purpose for which the information will be used and must make such records available to the motor vehicle department upon request.

18 U.S.C. § 2721(a), (b)(1), (c). Section 2721(a) is applicable to state departments of motor vehicles. *See id.* § 2721(a). Pursuant to section 2721(b), personal information may be disclosed to certain entities by a state department of motor vehicles. *See id.* § 2721(b). The city states some of the information at issue is subject to section 2721(a) of the DPPA. However, we find the city is not a state department of motor vehicles. Furthermore, the city does not assert it received the information at issue from a state department of motor vehicles. Therefore, the city has failed to demonstrate the information at issue is subject to section 2721(a) of the DPPA. Accordingly, the city may not withhold any of the submitted information under section 552.101 of the Government Code on that basis.

Next, we note portions of the submitted information are subject to article 2.1396 of the Code of Criminal Procedure, which provides,

A person stopped or arrested on suspicion of an offense under Section 49.04, 49.045, 49.07, or 49.08, Penal Code, is entitled to receive from a law enforcement agency employing the peace officer who made the stop or arrest a copy of any video made by or at the direction of the officer that contains footage of:

(1) the stop;

(2) the arrest;

(3) the conduct of the person stopped during any interaction with the officer, including during the administration of a field sobriety test;
or

(4) a procedure in which a specimen of the person's breath or blood is taken.

Crim Proc. Code art 2.1396. The submitted information includes video recordings made by or at the direction of officers employed by the city's police department that contain footage of the requestor being stopped or arrested on suspicion of an offense under section 49.04 of the Penal Code. *See* Penal Code § 49.04 (person commits offense if person is intoxicated while operating motor vehicle in public place). Thus, the requestor is entitled to receive these portions of the video recordings pursuant to article 2.1396 of the Code of Criminal Procedure.

You also argue portions of the video recordings to which the requestor has access under article 2.1396 of the Code of Criminal Procedure consist of criminal history record information ("CHRI") subject to section 411.083 of the Government Code. Thus, there is a conflict between the confidentiality provided under section 411.083 and the right of access provided under article 2.1396 for the video recording at issue. Where general and specific statutes are in irreconcilable conflict, the specific provision typically prevails as an exception to the general provision unless the general provision was enacted later and there is clear evidence the legislature intended the general provision to prevail. *See* Gov't Code § 311.026(b); *Horizon/CMS Healthcare Corp. v. Auld*, 34 S.W.3d 887, 901 (Tex. 2000) ("more specific statute controls over the more general"); *Cuellar v. State*, 521 S.W.2d 211 (Tex. Crim. App. 1975) (under well-established rule of statutory construction, specific statutory provisions prevail over general ones). Although section 411.083 generally pertains to CHRI generated by the National Crime Information Center or by the Texas Crime Information Center, article 2.1396 specifically provides access to certain video footage pertaining to stops or arrests on suspected violations of sections 49.04, 49.045, 49.07, and 49.08 of the Penal Code. Therefore, we find article 2.1396 is more specific than, and prevails over, the general confidentiality provided under section 411.083. Additionally, we note article 2.1396 is the later enacted statute. *See* Gov't Code § 311.025(a) (if statutes enacted at different sessions of legislature are irreconcilable, statute latest in enactment prevails). Thus, the city may not withhold any portion of the video recordings at issue under section 552.101 in conjunction with section 411.083. Accordingly, the city must release the portions of the submitted video recordings that depict the stop, the arrest, the conduct of the requestor, or a procedure in which a specimen of the blood or breath of the requestor is taken pursuant to article 2.1396 of the Code of Criminal Procedure. However, we will address your argument against disclosure of the remaining information at issue.

Section 552.108(a)(1) of the Government Code excepts from disclosure "[i]nformation held by a law enforcement agency or prosecutor that deals with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime . . . if . . . release of the information would interfere with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime[.]" Gov't Code § 552.108(a)(1). A governmental body claiming section 552.108(a)(1) must explain how and why the release of the requested information would interfere with law enforcement. *See id.* §§ 552.108(a)(1), .301(e)(1)(A); *see also Ex parte Pruitt*, 551 S.W.2d 706 (Tex. 1977). You state Exhibit B relates to a pending investigation and prosecution. Based on your representation and our review, we find release of the information at issue would interfere with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime. *See Houston Chronicle Publ'g Co. v. City of Houston*, 531 S.W.2d 177 (Tex. Civ. App.—Houston [14th Dist.] 1975) (court delineates law enforcement

interests that are present in active cases), *writ ref'd n.r.e. per curiam*, 536 S.W.2d 559 (Tex. 1976).

However, section 552.108 does not except from disclosure basic information about an arrested person, an arrest, or a crime. Gov't Code § 552.108(c). Basic information refers to the information held to be public in *Houston Chronicle*. See 531 S.W.2d at 186-88; Open Records Decision No. 127 (1976) (summarizing types of information considered to be basic information). Accordingly, with the exception of basic information, the city may withhold Exhibit B under section 552.108(a)(1) of the Government Code.

Section 552.130 provides information relating to a motor vehicle operator's license, driver's license, motor vehicle title or registration, or personal identification document issued by an agency of this state or another state or country is excepted from public release. See Gov't Code § 552.130. We note some of the remaining video recordings contain information not relating to the requestor that is subject to section 552.130. Accordingly, with the exception of the information belonging to the requestor, the city must withhold all visible and audible license plates, driver's license numbers, and driver's license issuing states in the remaining recordings at issue under section 552.130 of the Government Code.

In summary, pursuant to article 2.1396 of the Code of Criminal Procedure, the city must release those portions of the video recordings that depict the stop, the arrest, the conduct of the requestor, or a procedure in which a specimen of the requestor's blood or breath is taken. With the exception of basic information, the city may withhold Exhibit B under section 552.108(a)(1) of the Government Code. With the exception of the information belonging to the requestor, the city must withhold all visible and audible license plates, driver's license numbers, and driver's license issuing states in the video recordings at issue, under section 552.130 of the Government Code. The remaining information must be released.

This letter ruling is limited to the particular information at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other information or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For more information concerning those rights and responsibilities, please visit our website at <https://www.texasattorneygeneral.gov/open-government/members-public/what-expect-after-ruling-issued> or call the OAG's Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. Questions concerning the allowable charges for providing public information under the Public Information Act may be directed to the Cost Rules Administrator of the OAG, toll free, at (888) 672-6787.

Sincerely,

Paige Lay
Assistant Attorney General
Open Records Division

PL/rm

Ms. Shannon Montgomery - Page 5

Ref: ID# 846657

Enc. Submitted documents

c: Requestor
(w/o enclosures)