



KEN PAXTON
ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS

September 24, 2020

Ms. Tiffany Bangs
Assistant County Attorney
Harris County Attorney's Office
1019 Congress, 15th Floor
Houston, Texas 77002

OR2020-24100

Dear Ms. Bangs:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 845841 (C.A. File No. 20PIA0454).

The Office of the Harris County Constable, Precinct 4 (the "constable's office"), received a request for information pertaining to two named officers. You claim the submitted information is excepted from disclosure under section 552.101 of the Government Code.¹ We have considered the exception you claim and reviewed the submitted information. We have also received and considered comments submitted by the requestor. *See* Gov't Code § 552.304 (providing that interested party may submit written comments regarding why information should or should not be released).

Initially, we note the submitted information includes peace officers' Texas Commission on Law Enforcement ("TCOLE") identification numbers. Section 552.002(a) of the Government Code defines "public information" as information that is written, produced, collected, assembled, or maintained under a law or ordinance or in connection with the transaction of official business:

(1) by a governmental body;

¹ We note the constable's office failed to comply with section 552.301 of the Government Code in requesting a ruling; however, section 552.101 of the Government Code can provide a compelling reason to withhold information sufficient to overcome the presumption of openness caused by a failure to comply with section 552.301. *See* Gov't Code §§ 552.301, .302. Accordingly, we will consider your argument under section 552.101. Although you also cite to section 552.108 of the Government Code, you make no arguments to support this exception. Therefore, we assume you have withdrawn your claim that this section applies to the submitted information. *See* Gov't Code §§ 552.301, .302.

(2) for a governmental body and the governmental body:

(A) owns the information;

(B) has a right of access to the information; or

(C) spends or contributes public money for the purpose of writing, producing, collecting, assembling, or maintaining the information; or

(3) by an individual officer or employee of a governmental body in the officer's or employee's official capacity and the information pertains to official business of the governmental body.

Id. § 552.002(a). In Open Records Decision No. 581 (1990), this office determined certain computer information, such as source codes, documentation information, and other computer programming, that has no significance other than its use as a tool for the maintenance, manipulation, or protection of public property is not the kind of information made public under section 552.021 of the Government Code. We understand the submitted TCOLE identification numbers are unique computer-generated numbers assigned to peace officers for identification in TCOLE's electronic database, and may be used as an access device number on the TCOLE website. Therefore, we find the submitted TCOLE numbers do not constitute public information under section 552.002 of the Government Code. Accordingly, the submitted TCOLE numbers are not subject to the Act and the constable's office need not release this information to the requestor.²

Section 552.102(a) of the Government Code excepts from disclosure "information in a personnel file, the disclosure of which would constitute a clearly unwarranted invasion of personal privacy."³ Gov't Code § 552.102(a). The Texas Supreme Court held section 552.102(a) excepts from disclosure the dates of birth of state employees in the payroll database of the Texas Comptroller of Public Accounts. *Tex. Comptroller of Pub. Accounts v. Attorney Gen. of Tex.*, 354 S.W.3d 336 (Tex. 2010). Upon review, we find the constable's office must withhold the employees' dates of birth under section 552.102(a) of the Government Code.⁴

Section 552.101 of the Government Code excepts "information considered to be confidential by law, either constitutional, statutory, or by judicial decision." Gov't Code § 552.101. Section 552.101 encompasses the doctrine of common-law privacy, which protects information that is (1) highly intimate or embarrassing, the publication of which

² As we are able to make this determination, we need not address your argument against disclosure of this information.

³ The Office of the Attorney General will raise mandatory exceptions on behalf of a governmental body but ordinarily will not raise other exceptions. See Open Records Decision Nos. 481 (1987), 480 (1987), 470 (1987).

⁴ As our ruling is dispositive, we need not address your argument against disclosure of this information.

would be highly objectionable to a reasonable person, and (2) not of legitimate concern to the public. *Indus. Found. v. Tex. Indus. Accident Bd.*, 540 S.W.2d 668, 685 (Tex. 1976). To demonstrate the applicability of common-law privacy, both prongs of this test must be satisfied. *Id.* at 681-82. Types of information considered intimate and embarrassing by the Texas Supreme Court are delineated in *Industrial Foundation*. *Id.* at 683. Additionally, this office has concluded some kinds of medical information are generally highly intimate or embarrassing. *See* Open Records Decision No. 455 (1987). This office has also found personal financial information not relating to a financial transaction between an individual and a governmental body is generally highly intimate or embarrassing. *See* Open Records Decision Nos. 545 (1990) (common-law privacy protects mortgage payments, assets, bills, and credit history), 523 (1989) (common-law privacy protects credit reports, financial statements, and other personal financial information), 373 (1983) (sources of income not related to financial transaction between individual and governmental body protected under common-law privacy), 600 (1992) (personal financial information includes choice of particular insurance carrier). The Third Court of Appeals has concluded public citizens' dates of birth are protected by common-law privacy pursuant to section 552.101. *See Paxton v. City of Dallas*, No. 03-13-00546-CV, 2015 WL 3394061, at *3 (Tex. App.—Austin May 22, 2015, pet. denied) (mem. op.). We also note the public generally has a legitimate interest in information that relates to public employment and public employees. *See* Open Records Decisions Nos. 562 at 10 (1990) (personnel file information does not involve most intimate aspects of human affairs, but in fact touches on matters of legitimate public concern), 542 (1990), 470 at 4 (1987) (public has legitimate interest in job qualifications and performance of public employees), 444 at 5-6 (1986) (public has legitimate interest in knowing reasons for dismissal, demotion, promotion, or resignation of public employees). Thus, the constable's office must withhold all public citizens' dates of birth and the information we marked under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy. However, we find you have failed to demonstrate the remaining information is highly intimate or embarrassing and not of legitimate public concern. Therefore, the constable's office may not withhold any of the remaining information under section 552.101 on that basis.

After reviewing the information at issue, we have determined no novel or complex issue exists in the remaining responsive information. Thus, we address other applicable exceptions in a summary ruling.

The constable's office must withhold the I-9 form we marked under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 1324a of title 8 of the United States Code. The constable's office must withhold the criminal history record information we marked under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 411.083 of the Government Code and federal law. The constable's office must withhold the submitted accident report under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 550.065(b) of the Transportation Code. The constable's office must withhold the submitted L-2 and L-3 forms, which we marked, under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 1701.306 of the Occupations Code. The constable's office must withhold the information we marked under section 552.117(a)(2) of the Government Code; however, the constable's office may only withhold the marked cellular telephone numbers if the cellular telephone services are not paid for by a governmental body. The constable's

office must withhold the motor vehicle record information we marked under section 552.130 of the Government Code. The constable's office must withhold the account number we have marked under section 552.136 of the Government Code. The constable's office must withhold the personal e-mail addresses, which we marked, under section 552.137 of the Government Code, unless the individuals to whom the e-mail addresses belong affirmatively consent to their release. The constable's office must release the remaining information.⁵

This letter ruling is limited to the particular information at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other information or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For more information concerning those rights and responsibilities, please visit our website at <https://www.texasattorneygeneral.gov/open-government/members-public/what-expect-after-ruling-issued> or call the OAG's Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. Questions concerning the allowable charges for providing public information under the Public Information Act may be directed to the Cost Rules Administrator of the OAG, toll free, at (888) 672-6787.

Sincerely,

Matthew Taylor
Assistant Attorney General
Open Records Division

MT/rm

Ref: ID# 845841

Enc. Submitted documents

c: Requestor
(w/o enclosures)

⁵ We note the information being released contains social security numbers. Section 552.147(b) of the Government Code authorizes a governmental body to redact a living person's social security number from public release without the necessity of requesting a decision from this office under the Act. Gov't Code § 552.147(b).