



KEN PAXTON
ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS

September 22, 2020

Ms. Audrea Hutson
Open Records
Williamson County Sheriff's Office
508 South Rock Street
Georgetown, Texas 78626

OR2020-23826

Dear Ms. Hutson:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 845790.

The Williamson County Sheriff's Office (the "sheriff's office") received two requests from the same requestor for information related to a specified incident involving a named individual. The sheriff's office claims the submitted information is excepted from disclosure under sections 552.101, 552.130, and 552.152 of the Government Code. We have considered the exceptions the sheriff's office claims and reviewed the submitted information.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code excepts from disclosure "information considered to be confidential by law, either constitutional, statutory, or by judicial decision." Gov't Code § 552.101. Section 552.101 encompasses section 58.008 of the Family Code, which provides, in part:

(b) Except as provided by Subsection (c), law enforcement records concerning a child and information concerning a child that are stored by electronic means or otherwise from which a record could be generated may not be disclosed to the public and shall be:

(1) if maintained on paper or microfilm, kept separate from adult records;

(2) if maintained electronically in the same computer system as adult records, accessible only under controls that are separate and distinct from the controls to access electronic data concerning adults; and

(3) maintained on a local basis only and not sent to a central state or federal depository, except as provided by Subsection (c) or Subchapter B, D, or E.

...

(d) Law enforcement records concerning a child may be inspected or copied by:

...

(2) a criminal justice agency, as defined by Section 411.082, Government Code[.]

Fam. Code § 58.008(b), (d)(2); *see id.* § 51.03(a) (defining “delinquent conduct” for purposes of title 3 of Family Code). Section 58.008(b) is applicable to records of juvenile conduct that occurred before, on, or after September 1, 2017. *See* Act of May 28, 2017, 85th Leg., R.S., ch. 746, § 22. The juvenile must have been at least 10 years old and less than 17 years of age when the conduct occurred. *See* Fam Code § 51.02(2) (defining “child” for purposes of title 3 of Family Code). The submitted information involves juvenile offenders, so as to fall within the scope of section 58.008(b).

However, the requestor is a representative of the Colorado Bureau of Investigation (the “bureau”). Section 58.008(d)(2) of the Family Code gives a “criminal justice agency, as defined by section 411.082 of the Government Code a right of access to juvenile law enforcement records. *See id.* § 58.008(d)(2). Section 411.082 of the Government Code defines a “criminal justice agency” to include “a federal or state agency that is engaged in the administration of criminal justice under a statute or executive order and that allocates a substantial portion of its annual budget to the administration of criminal justice[.]” Gov’t Code § 411.082(3)(B). “Administration of criminal justice” has the meaning assigned by article 66.001 of the Code of Criminal Procedure. *See id.* § 411.082(1). Article 66.001 of the Code of Criminal Procedure defines “[a]dministration of criminal justice” as the “detection, apprehension, detention, pretrial release, post-trial release, prosecution, adjudication, correctional supervision, or rehabilitation of an offender. The term includes criminal identification activities and the collection, storage, and dissemination of [CHRI].” Crim. Proc. Code art. 66.001(1). Thus, we find the bureau is a criminal justice agency and the requestor is requesting information about one of the juvenile offenders on behalf of a criminal justice agency as provided by section 58.008(d)(2) of the Family Code. Thus, the bureau generally has a right of access under section 58.008(d)(2) to the submitted information. We note a statutory right of access to the information prevails over common-law privacy. *See Collins v. Tex Mall, L.P.*, 297 S.W.3d 409, 415 (Tex. App.—Fort Worth 2009, no pet.) (statutory provision controls and preempts common law only when statute directly conflicts with common-law principle); *CenterPoint Energy Houston Elec. LLC v.*

Harris County Toll Rd. Auth., 436 F.3d 541, 544 (5th Cir. 2006) (common law controls only where there is no conflicting or controlling statutory law). Although the sheriff's office also asserts section 552.152 of the Government Code to withhold portions of the information, a statutory right of access prevails over the Act's general exceptions to public disclosure. *See, e.g.*, Open Records Decision Nos. 613 at 4 (1993) (exceptions in Act cannot impinge on statutory right of access to information), 451 (1986) (specific statutory right of access provisions overcome general exception to disclosure under the Act). Because section 552.152 is a general exception under the Act, the requestor's statutory access prevails. Therefore, the sheriff's office may not withhold any of the information under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy or under section 552.152 of the Government Code.

Section 552.130 of the Government Code provides information relating to a motor vehicle operator's license, driver's license, motor vehicle title or registration, or personal identification document issued by an agency of this state or another state or country is excepted from public release. *See Gov't Code § 552.130*. Upon review, we find the sheriff's office must generally withhold the motor vehicle record information it marked under section 552.130 of the Government Code.

As previously noted, the requestor has a statutory right of access to the submitted information under section 58.008(d)(2) of the Family Code that prevails over general exceptions to disclosure under the Act. However, because section 552.130 has its own access provisions, we conclude section 552.130 is not a general exception under the Act. Therefore, we must address the conflict between the access provided under section 58.008(d)(2) and the confidentiality provided under section 552.130. Where information falls within both a general and a specific provision of law, the specific provision prevails over the general. *See Horizon/CMS Healthcare Corp. v. Auld*, 34 S.W.3d 887, 901 (Tex. 2000) ("more specific statute controls over the more general"); *Cuellar*, 521 S.W.2d 277. In this instance, section 58.008(d)(2) generally applies to all juvenile law enforcement records, while section 552.130 specifically protects motor vehicle record information. Thus, we find the confidentiality provided by section 552.130 is more specific than, and prevails over, the general right of access provided by section 58.008(d)(2). Accordingly, the sheriff's office must withhold the motor vehicle record information it marked under section 552.130 of the Government Code. The sheriff's office must release the remaining information to this requestor pursuant to section 58.008(d)(2) of the Family Code.¹

This letter ruling is limited to the particular information at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other information or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For more information concerning those rights and responsibilities, please visit our website at <https://www.texasattorneygeneral.gov/open->

¹ We note, in this instance, the requestor a right of access to the information being released. *See Fam. Code 58.008(d)(2)*. Thus, the sheriff's office must again seek a decision from this office if it receives another request for the same information from another requestor.

[government/members-public/what-expect-after-ruling-issued](#) or call the OAG's Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. Questions concerning the allowable charges for providing public information under the Public Information Act may be directed to the Cost Rules Administrator of the OAG, toll free, at (888) 672-6787.

Sincerely,

Claire V. Morris Sloan
Assistant Attorney General
Open Records Division

CVMS/jm

Ref: ID# 845790

Enc. Submitted documents

c: Requestor
(w/o enclosures)