



KEN PAXTON
ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS

September 8, 2020

Ms. Christi Koenig Brisky
Assistant General Counsel
Texas Department of Information Resources
P.O. Box 13564
Austin, Texas 78711-3564

OR2020-22652

Dear Ms. Brisky:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 841111 (PIR No. R000845-052220).

The Texas Department of Information Resources (the "department") received a request for information pertaining to a specified request for offers.¹ Although you take no position as to whether the submitted information is excepted under the Act, you state release of the submitted information may implicate the proprietary interests of Coban Technologies, Inc. ("Coban"); Digital Ally, Inc. ("Digital"); Freeit Data Solutions, Inc.; GTS Technology Solutions, Inc.; IVS, Inc. d/b/a AngelTrax; L3 Mobile-Vision, Inc.; MoboTrex, Inc.; Supercircuits, Inc.; Teksys, Inc.; and Watchguard, Inc. ("Watchguard"). Accordingly, you state, and provide documentation showing, the department notified the third parties of the request for information and of the right to submit arguments to this office as to why the submitted information should not be released. *See* Gov't Code § 552.305(d); *see also* Open Records Decision No. 542 (1990) (statutory predecessor to section 552.305 permits governmental body to rely on interested third party to raise and explain applicability of exception in the Act in certain circumstances). We have received comments from Digital, Coban, and Watchguard. We have reviewed the submitted information.

¹ The department provides documentation showing it sought and received clarification of the information requested. *See* Gov't Code § 552.222 (providing if request for information is unclear, governmental body may ask requestor to clarify request); *see also* *City of Dallas v. Abbott*, 304 S.W.3d 380, 387 (Tex. 2010) (holding that when a governmental entity, acting in good faith, requests clarification or narrowing of an unclear or overbroad request for information, the ten-day period to request an attorney general ruling is measured from the date the request is clarified or narrowed).

Initially, we note an interested third party is allowed ten business days after the date of its receipt of the governmental body's notice to submit its reasons, if any, as to why info relating to that party should not be released. *See* Gov't Code § 552.305(d)(2)(B). As of the date of this ruling, we have not received comments from the remaining third parties. Thus, we have no basis to conclude the remaining third parties have a protected proprietary interest in the submitted information. *See, e.g., id.* § 552.110 (requiring the provision of specific factual evidence demonstrating the applicability of the exception). Accordingly, the department may not withhold any of the submitted information on the basis of any proprietary interest the remaining third parties may have in the information.

WatchGuard requests that the information it marked be kept confidential. However, information that is subject to disclosure under the Act may not be withheld simply because the party submitting it anticipates or requests that it be kept confidential. *See Indus. Found. v. Tex. Indus. Accident Bd.*, 540 S.W.2d 668, 677 (Tex. 1976). In other words, a governmental body cannot, through an agreement or contract, overrule or repeal provisions of the Act. *See* Attorney General Opinion JM-672 (1987); Open Records Decision Nos. 541 at 3 (“[T]he obligations of a governmental body under [the Act] cannot be compromised simply by its decision to enter into a contract.”), 203 at 1 (1978) (mere expectation of confidentiality by person supplying information does not satisfy requirements of statutory predecessor to section 552.110). Consequently, unless the information falls within an exception to disclosure, it must be released, notwithstanding any expectations or agreement specifying otherwise.

Section 552.110(c) of the Government Code states:

(c) Except as provided by Section 552.0222, commercial or financial information for which it is demonstrated based on specific factual evidence that disclosure would cause substantial competitive harm to the person from whom the information was obtained is [excepted from required disclosure].

Gov't Code § 552.110(c). Additionally, we note section 552.0222(b) lists certain types of information to which section 552.110 does not apply. *See id.* § 552.0222(b). Coban and Digital argue some of the information at issue consists of commercial or financial information subject to section 552.110(c). Upon review, we find these third parties have demonstrated portions of the information at issue constitute commercial or financial information, the release of which would cause substantial competitive harm. Accordingly, the department must withhold the information we marked under section 552.110(c) of the Government Code.² In addition, Coban and Digital have established their customer information constitutes commercial or financial information, the release of which would cause substantial competitive harm. Thus, to the extent Coban and Digital's customer information is not publicly available on their respective websites, the department must withhold Coban and Digital's customer information under section 552.110(c).³ However,

² As our ruling is dispositive, we need not address your remaining arguments against disclosure of this information.

³ As our ruling is dispositive, we need not address your remaining arguments against disclosure of this information.

we find some of the remaining information at issue is subject to section 552.0222(b) and may not be withheld on the basis of section 552.110(c). Additionally, we find Coban and Digital have failed to provide specific factual evidence demonstrating any portion of the rest of the remaining information at issue constitutes commercial or financial information, the release of which would result in substantial competitive harm. Therefore, the department may not withhold any of the remaining information at issue under section 552.110(c) of the Government Code.

Section 552.110(b) of the Government Code states, “[e]xcept as provided by [s]ection 552.0222, information is [excepted from required disclosure] if it is demonstrated based on specific factual evidence that the information is a trade secret.” *See id.* § 552.110(b). Section 552.110(a) defines a trade secret as all forms and types of information if:

- (1) the owner of the trade secret has taken reasonable measures under the circumstances to keep the information secret; and
- (2) the information derives independent economic value, actual or potential, from not being generally known to, and not being readily ascertainable through proper means by, another person who can obtain economic value from the disclosure or use of the information.

Id. § 552.110(a). As noted above, we note section 552.0222(b) lists certain types of information to which section 552.110 does not apply. *See id.* § 552.0222(b). Coban and Digital Ally argue some of its remaining information consists of trade secrets subject to section 552.110(b). Upon review, we find some of the remaining information at issue is subject to section 552.0222(b) and may not be withheld on the basis of section 552.110(b). Additionally, we find Coban and Digital have failed to provide specific factual evidence demonstrating any portion of the rest of the remaining information at issue is a trade secret. Therefore, the department may not withhold any of the remaining information at issue under section 552.110(b) of the Government Code.

Coban and Digital argue their remaining information is subject to section 552.1101 of the Government Code. Section 552.1101 of the Government Code provides, in relevant part:

- (a) Except as provided by Section 552.0222, information submitted to a governmental body by a vendor, contractor, potential vendor, or potential contractor in response to a request for a bid, proposal, or qualification is excepted from the requirements of Section 552.021 if the vendor, contractor, potential vendor, or potential contractor that the information relates to demonstrates based on specific factual evidence that disclosure of the information would:

- (1) reveal an individual approach to:

- (A) work;
-

(B) organizational structure;

(C) staffing;

(D) internal operations;

(E) processes; or

(F) discounts, pricing methodology, pricing per kilowatt hour, cost data, or other pricing information that will be used in future solicitation or bid documents; and

(2) give advantage to a competitor.

(b) The exception to disclosure provided by Subsection (a) does not apply to:

(1) information in a voucher or contract relating to the receipt or expenditure of public funds by a governmental body; or

(2) communications and other information sent between a governmental body and a vendor or contractor related to the performance of a final contract with the governmental body or work performed on behalf of the governmental body.

Id. § 552.1101(a), (b). Additionally, we note section 552.0222(b) lists certain types of information to which section 552.1101(a) does not apply. *See id.* § 552.0222(b). Coban and Digital assert disclosure of some of its information would reveal an individual approach to discounts, pricing methodology, cost data, work, and internal operations and give advantage to a competitor. However, we find some of the remaining information at issue is subject to section 552.0222(b) and may not be withheld on the basis of section 552.1101(a). *See id.* § 552.0222(b) (listing certain types of information not excepted under section 552.1101). Additionally, we find Coban and Digital have failed to provide specific factual evidence demonstrating any portion of the rest of the remaining information at issue is subject to section 552.1101(a). Therefore, the department may not withhold any of the remaining information at issue under section 552.1101(a).

Coban argues some of its remaining information at issue may be protected by copyright. A custodian of public records must comply with the copyright law and is not required to furnish copies of records that are copyrighted. Open Records Decision No. 180 at 3 (1977). A governmental body must allow inspection of copyrighted materials unless an exception applies to the information. *Id.*; *see* Open Records Decision No. 109 (1975). If a member of the public wishes to make copies of copyrighted materials, the person must do so unassisted by the governmental body. In making copies, the member of the public assumes the duty of compliance with the copyright law and the risk of a copyright infringement suit.

In summary, the department must withhold the information we marked under section 552.110(c) of the Government Code. In addition, to the extent Coban and Digital's customer information is not publicly available on their respective websites, the department must withhold Coban and Digital's customer information under section 552.110(c) of the Government Code. The department must release the remaining information; however, any information protected by copyright may only be released in accordance with copyright law.

This letter ruling is limited to the particular information at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other information or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For more information concerning those rights and responsibilities, please visit our website at <https://www.texasattorneygeneral.gov/open-government/members-public/what-expect-after-ruling-issued> or call the OAG's Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. Questions concerning the allowable charges for providing public information under the Public Information Act may be directed to the Cost Rules Administrator of the OAG, toll free, at (888) 672-6787.

Sincerely,

Pearlie Gault
Attorney
Open Records Division

PG/be

Ref: ID# 841111

Enc. Submitted documents

c: Requestor
(w/o enclosures)

10 Third Parties
(w/o enclosures)