



**KEN PAXTON**  
ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS

August 18, 2020

Ms. Amy Bass-Domel  
Open Records  
Williamson County Sheriff's Office  
508 South Rock Street  
Georgetown, Texas 78626

OR2020-20645

Dear Ms. Bass-Domel:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 840643.

The Williamson County Sheriff's Office (the "sheriff's office") received a request for all information pertaining to a named individual.<sup>1</sup> You claim some of the submitted information is excepted from disclosure under sections 552.101, 552.108, 552.130, 552.136, 552.137, and 552.152 of the Government Code. We have considered the exceptions you claim and reviewed the submitted information.

Initially, section 552.301(e)(1)(D) states a governmental body asking for an attorney general decision must, within fifteen business days of receiving a request, provide the attorney general with "a copy of the specific information requested, *or submit representative samples of information if a voluminous amount of information was requested[.]*" Gov't Code § 552.301(e)(1)(D) (emphasis added). We note you have submitted a voluminous amount of information rather than a representative sample. The information submitted includes over 1,000 pages of documents and 10 compact discs of audio and video recordings. We have identified and reviewed a representative sample of the voluminous information submitted.<sup>2</sup>

---

<sup>1</sup> We note the requestor specifically excludes home addresses, personal telephone numbers, dates of birth, and social security numbers from his request.

<sup>2</sup> To the extent the city identifies confidential information subject to a provision not addressed in this ruling, the city should contact the Open Government Hotline.

Next, we note the submitted information contains grand jury subpoenas and records obtained by the sheriff's office pursuant to those subpoenas. The judiciary is expressly excluded from the requirements of the Act. Gov't Code § 552.003(1)(B). This office has determined for purposes of the Act, a grand jury is a part of the judiciary and, therefore, not subject to the Act. *See* Open Records Decision No. 411 (1984). Further, records kept by a governmental body that is acting as an agent for a grand jury are considered records in the constructive possession of the grand jury, and are also not subject to the Act. *See* Open Records Decisions Nos. 513 (1988), 411, 398 (1983). The fact that information collected or prepared by another person or entity is submitted to the grand jury does not necessarily mean such information is in the grand jury's constructive possession when the same information also is held in the other person's or entity's own capacity. Information held by another person or entity but not produced at the direction of the grand jury may well be protected under one of the Act's specific exceptions to disclosure, but such information is not excluded from the reach of the Act by the judiciary exclusion. *See* ORD 513. We understand the sheriff's office holds the information at issue solely as an agent of the grand jury. Accordingly, such information consists of records of the judiciary that are not subject to disclosure under the Act, and the sheriff's office is not required to release that information in response to the instant request.<sup>3</sup>

Section 552.101 of the Government Code excepts "information considered to be confidential by law, either constitutional, statutory, or by judicial decision." Gov't Code § 552.101. Section 552.101 of the Government Code also encompasses section 560.003 of the Government Code, which provides, "[a] biometric identifier in the possession of a governmental body is exempt from disclosure under [the Act]." *Id.* § 560.003; *see id.* § 560.001(1) ("biometric identifier" means retina or iris scan, fingerprint, voiceprint, or record of hand or face geometry). There is no indication the requestor has a right of access to the biometric identifiers under section 560.002. *See id.* § 560.002(1)(A) (governmental body may not sell, lease, or otherwise disclose individual's biometric identifier to another person unless the individual consents to disclosure). Accordingly, the sheriff's office must withhold the biometric identifiers you marked and we marked under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 560.003 of the Government Code.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code also encompasses information protected by other statutes, such as section 411.083 of the Government Code, which pertains to criminal history record information ("CHRI"). CHRI generated by the National Crime Information Center ("NCIC") or by the Texas Crime Information Center is confidential under federal and state law. CHRI means "information collected about a person by a criminal justice agency that consists of identifiable descriptions and notations of arrests, detentions, indictments, informations, and other formal criminal charges and their dispositions." *Id.* § 411.082(2). Title 28, part 20 of the Code of Federal Regulations governs the release of CHRI obtained from the NCIC network or other states. *See* 28 C.F.R. § 20.21. The federal regulations allow each state to follow its individual law with respect to CHRI it generates. Open Records Decision No. 565 at 7 (1990); *see generally* Gov't Code ch. 411 subch. F. Section 411.083 of the Government Code deems confidential CHRI the Texas Department of Public Safety ("DPS") maintains, except DPS may disseminate this information as

---

<sup>3</sup> As we are able to make this determination, we need not address your argument against disclosure of this information.

provided in chapter 411, subchapter F, or subchapter E-1, of the Government Code. *See* Gov't Code § 411.083. Sections 411.083(b)(1) and 411.089(a) authorize a criminal justice agency to obtain CHRI; however, a criminal justice agency may not release CHRI except to another criminal justice agency for a criminal justice purpose. *Id.* § 411.089(b)(1). Thus, any CHRI obtained from DPS or any other criminal justice agency must be withheld under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with Government Code chapter 411. We note, however, active warrant information or other information relating to an individual's current involvement in the criminal justice system does not constitute criminal history information for purposes of section 552.101. *See id.* § 411.081(b). We also note records relating to routine traffic violations are not considered criminal history information. *Cf. id.* § 411.082(2)(B) (criminal history record information does not include driving record information). We further note Federal Bureau of Investigation ("FBI") numbers constitute CHRI generated by the FBI. You assert section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 411.083 of the Government Code for the information you marked. Upon review, with the exception of the information we marked for release, we find the information you marked consists of CHRI which the sheriff's office must withhold under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 411.083 of the Government Code and federal law.<sup>4</sup> However, we find you have failed to demonstrate the information we marked for release consists of confidential CHRI. Therefore, the sheriff's office may not withhold any portion of the information at issue under section 552.101 of the Government Code on this basis.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code also encompasses information confidential under section 261.201 of the Family Code, which provides, in part, as follows:

(a) [T]he following information is confidential, is not subject to public release under Chapter 552, Government Code, and may be disclosed only for purposes consistent with this code and applicable federal or state law or under rules adopted by an investigating agency:

(1) a report of alleged or suspected abuse or neglect made under this chapter and the identity of the person making the report; and

(2) except as otherwise provided in this section, the files, reports, records, communications, audiotapes, videotapes, and working papers used or developed in an investigation under this chapter or in providing services as a result of an investigation.

Fam. Code § 261.201(a). Upon review, with the exception of the information we marked for release, we find the information you marked consists of files, reports, records, communications, audiotapes, videotapes, or working papers used or developed in an investigation under chapter 261 of the Family Code or in providing services as a result of an investigation. *See id.* § 261.001(1), (4) (defining "abuse" and "neglect" for purposes of chapter 261 of the Family Code); *see also id.* § 101.003(a) (defining "child" for purposes of chapter 261 of the Family Code). Accordingly, we find this information is subject to

---

<sup>4</sup> As our ruling is dispositive, we need not address your remaining argument against disclosure of this information.

section 261.201 of the Family Code. You have not indicated the sheriff's office has adopted a rule that governs the release of this type of information. Therefore, we assume no such rule exists. Given that assumption, the information at issue is confidential pursuant to section 261.201(a) of the Family Code. *See* Open Records Decision No. 440 at 2 (1986) (predecessor statute). Accordingly, with the exception of the information we marked for release, the sheriff's office must withhold the information you marked from disclosure under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 261.201(a) of the Family Code.<sup>5</sup> However, we find you have failed to demonstrate any of the information we marked for release is subject to section 261.201. Therefore, none of the information at issue may be withheld under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 261.201 of the Family Code.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code also encompasses information made confidential by statute, such as the Medical Practice Act ("MPA"), subtitle B of title 3 of the Occupations Code, which governs release of medical records. Section 159.002 of the MPA provides, in relevant part:

(a) A communication between a physician and a patient, relative to or in connection with any professional services as a physician to the patient, is confidential and privileged and may not be disclosed except as provided by this chapter.

(b) A record of the identity, diagnosis, evaluation, or treatment of a patient by a physician that is created or maintained by a physician is confidential and privileged and may not be disclosed except as provided by this chapter.

(c) A person who receives information from a confidential communication or record as described by this chapter, other than a person listed in Section 159.004 who is acting on the patient's behalf, may not disclose the information except to the extent that disclosure is consistent with the authorized purposes for which the information was first obtained.

Occ. Code § 159.002(a)-(c). Information subject to the MPA includes both medical records and information obtained from those medical records. *See id.* §§ 159.002, .004. This office has concluded the protection afforded by section 159.002 extends only to records created by either a physician or someone under the supervision of a physician. *See* Open Records Decision Nos. 487 (1987), 370 (1983), 343 (1982). Upon review, with the exception of the information we marked for release, we find the information you marked constitutes a record of the identity, diagnosis, evaluation, or treatment of a patient by a physician or that was created or is maintained by someone under the supervision of a physician. Accordingly, with the exception of the information we marked for release, the sheriff's office must withhold the information you marked under section 552.101 of the Government Code in

---

<sup>5</sup> As our ruling is dispositive, we need not address your remaining argument against disclosure of this information.

conjunction with the MPA.<sup>6</sup> However, we find none of the information we marked for release constitutes medical records subject to section 159.002. Accordingly, the sheriff's office may not withhold any of the information at issue under section 552.101 of the Government Code on that basis.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code also encompasses section 58.008 of the Family Code, which provides, in part:

(b) Except as provided by Subsection (c), law enforcement records concerning a child and information concerning a child that are stored by electronic means or otherwise and from which a record could be generated may not be disclosed to the public and shall be:

(1) if maintained on paper or microfilm, kept separate from adult records;

(2) if maintained electronically in the same computer system as adult records, accessible only under controls that are separate and distinct from the controls to access electronic data concerning adults; and

(3) maintained on a local basis only and not sent to a central state or federal depository, except as provided by Subsection (c) or Subchapter B, D, or E.

Fam. Code § 58.008(b); *see also id.* § 51.03(a) (defining "delinquent conduct" for purposes of title 3 of Family Code). Section 58.008(b) is applicable to records of juvenile conduct that occurred before, on, or after September 1, 2017. *See* Act of May 28, 2017, 85th Leg., R.S., ch. 746, § 22. The juvenile must have been at least 10 years old and less than 17 years of age when the conduct occurred. *See* Fam. Code § 51.02(2) (defining "child" for purposes of title 3 of Family Code). We find the information at issue involves a juvenile offender, so as to fall within the scope of section 58.008(b). It does not appear that any of the exceptions in section 58.008 apply; therefore, the sheriff's office must withhold the information you marked, and the additional information we marked, under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 58.008(b) of the Family Code.<sup>7</sup>

Section 552.108(b)(1) of the Government Code excepts from disclosure the internal records and notations of law enforcement agencies and prosecutors when their release would interfere with law enforcement and crime prevention. Gov't Code § 552.108(b)(1); *see also* Open Records Decision No. 531 at 2 (1989) (quoting *Ex parte Pruitt*, 551 S.W.2d 706 (Tex. 1977)). A governmental body claiming section 552.108(b)(1) must explain how and why the release of the requested information would interfere with law enforcement. *See*

---

<sup>6</sup> As our ruling is dispositive, we need not address your remaining argument against disclosure of this information.

<sup>7</sup> As our ruling is dispositive, we need not address your remaining argument against disclosure of this information.

Gov't Code §§ 552.108(b)(1), .301(e)(1)(A); *see also Ex parte Pruitt*, 551 S.W.2d 706 (Tex. 1977). Section 552.108(b)(1) is intended to protect “information which, if released, would permit private citizens to anticipate weaknesses in a police department, avoid detection, jeopardize officer safety, and generally undermine police efforts to effectuate the laws of this State.” *See City of Fort Worth v. Cornyn*, 86 S.W.3d 320 at 327 (Tex. App.—Austin 2002, no pet.). This office has concluded section 552.108(b)(1) excepts from public disclosure information relating to the security or operation of a law enforcement agency. *See, e.g.*, Open Records Decision Nos. 531 (release of detailed use of force guidelines would unduly interfere with law enforcement), 252 (1980) (section 552.108 of the Government Code is designed to protect investigative techniques and procedures used in law enforcement), 143 (1976) (disclosure of specific operations or specialized equipment directly related to investigation or detection of crime may be excepted). Section 552.108(b)(1) is not applicable, however, to generally known policies and procedures. *See, e.g.*, Open Records Decision Nos. 531 at 2–3 (Penal Code provisions, common law rules, and constitutional limitations on use of force not protected), 252 at 3 (governmental body failed to indicate why investigative procedures and techniques requested were any different from those commonly known).

The sheriff's office states portions of the remaining information, if released, would interfere with law enforcement by revealing the identities of confidential informants utilized by the sheriff's office. We understand the release of the information at issue could help offenders avoid detection of criminal activities. Based on these representations and our review, we agree the release of the information at issue, which we marked, would interfere with law enforcement. Accordingly, the sheriff's office may withhold the information we marked under section 552.108(b)(1) of the Government Code.<sup>8</sup>

We note some of the remaining information may be subject to section 552.117 of the Government Code. Section 552.117(a)(1) of the Government Code excepts from disclosure the home address and telephone number, emergency contact information, social security number, and family member information of a current or former employee or official of a governmental body who requests this information be kept confidential under section 552.024 of the Government Code.<sup>9</sup> *See* Gov't Code § 552.117(a)(1). Whether a particular item of information is protected by section 552.117(a)(1) must be determined at the time of the governmental body's receipt of the request for the information. *See* Open Records Decision No. 530 at 5 (1989). Thus, information may be withheld under section 552.117(a)(1) only on behalf of a current or former employee or official who made a request for confidentiality under section 552.024 prior to the date of the governmental body's receipt of the request for the information. Information may not be withheld under section 552.117(a)(1) on behalf of a current or former employee or official who did not timely request under section 552.024 the information be kept confidential. Therefore, to the extent the employee at issue timely requested confidentiality under section 552.024 of the

---

<sup>8</sup> As our ruling is dispositive, we need not address your remaining argument against disclosure of this information.

<sup>9</sup> The Office of the Attorney General will raise a mandatory exception on behalf of a governmental body but ordinarily will not raise other exceptions. *See* Open Records Decision Nos. 481 (1987), 480 (1987), 470 (1987).

Government Code, the sheriff's office must withhold the information we marked under section 552.117(a)(1) of the Government Code. Conversely, to the extent the employee at issue did not timely request confidentiality under section 552.024, the sheriff's office may not withhold the information under section 552.117(a)(1) of the Government Code.

Section 552.130 of the Government Code excepts from disclosure information that relates to a motor vehicle operator's license, driver's license, motor vehicle title, or registration issued by this state or another state or country. Gov't Code § 552.130(a)(1), (2). Accordingly, the sheriff's office must withhold the motor vehicle record information you marked, and the additional information we marked, under section 552.130 of the Government Code.

Section 552.136(b) of the Government Code states "[n]otwithstanding any other provision of [the Act], a credit card, debit card, charge card, or access device number that is collected, assembled, or maintained by or for a governmental body is confidential." *Id.* § 552.136(b); *see id.* § 552.136(a) (defining "access device"). Thus, the sheriff's office must withhold the access device numbers and account numbers you marked under section 552.136 of the Government Code.

Section 552.137 of the Government Code excepts from disclosure "an e-mail address of a member of the public that is provided for the purpose of communicating electronically with a governmental body" unless the member of the public consents to its release or the e-mail address is of a type specifically excluded by subsection (c). *See id.* § 552.137(a)-(c). Section 552.137 does not apply to an institutional e-mail address, the general e-mail address of a business, an e-mail address of a person who has a contractual relationship with a governmental body, an e-mail address of a vendor who seeks to contract with a governmental body, an e-mail address maintained by a governmental entity for one of its officials or employees, or an e-mail address provided to a governmental body on a letterhead. *See id.* § 552.137(c). Upon review, we find the sheriff's office must withhold the e-mail addresses you marked in the remaining information under section 552.137 of the Government Code, unless their owners affirmatively consent to their public disclosure or subsection (c) applies.

Section 552.152 of the Government Code provides:

Information in the custody of a governmental body that relates to an employee or officer of the governmental body is excepted from [required public disclosure] if, under the specific circumstances pertaining to the employee or officer, disclosure of the information would subject the employee or officer to a substantial threat of physical harm.

*Id.* § 552.152. The sheriff's office represents the release of the undercover officers' identities would subject the officers to a substantial threat of physical harm. Therefore, we find section 552.152 is applicable to the identities of the undercover officers within the information at issue. Accordingly, the sheriff's office must withhold the identifying information of the undercover officers, which you marked, under section 552.152 of the Government Code.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code also encompasses the doctrine of common-law privacy, which protects information that is (1) highly intimate or embarrassing, the publication of which would be highly objectionable to a reasonable person, and (2) not of legitimate concern to the public. *Indus. Found. v. Tex. Indus. Accident Bd.*, 540 S.W.2d 668, 685 (Tex. 1976). To demonstrate the applicability of common-law privacy, both prongs of this test must be satisfied. *Id.* at 681-82. Types of information considered intimate and embarrassing by the Texas Supreme Court are delineated in *Industrial Foundation*. *Id.* at 683. Additionally, this office has concluded some kinds of medical information are generally highly intimate or embarrassing. *See* Open Records Decision No. 455 (1987). Portions of the remaining information also pertain to reports of alleged sexual assault. In Open Records Decision No. 393 (1983), this office concluded generally, only information that either identifies or tends to identify a victim of sexual assault or other sex-related offense may be withheld under common-law privacy. ORD 393 at 2; *see* Open Records Decision No. 339 (1982); *see also Morales v. Ellen*, 840 S.W.2d 519 (Tex. App.—El Paso 1992, writ denied) (identity of witnesses to and victims of sexual harassment was highly intimate or embarrassing information and public did not have a legitimate interest in such information); Open Records Decision No. 440 (1986) (detailed descriptions of serious sexual offenses must be withheld).

Upon review, we find the information we marked and indicated satisfies the standard articulated by the Texas Supreme Court in *Industrial Foundation*. Accordingly, the sheriff's office must withhold the information we marked and indicated under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy. However, we find the sheriff's office has failed to demonstrate the remaining information it marked is highly intimate or embarrassing and not of legitimate public interest. Accordingly, the sheriff's office may not withhold the remaining information at issue under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code also encompasses the constitutional right to privacy. Constitutional privacy protects two kinds of interests. *See Whalen v. Roe*, 429 U.S. 589, 599-600 (1977); Open Records Decision Nos. 600 at 3-5 (1992), 478 at 4 (1987), 455 at 3-7. The first is the interest in independence in making certain important decisions related to the "zones of privacy," pertaining to marriage, procreation, contraception, family relationships, and child rearing and education, that have been recognized by the United States Supreme Court. *See Fado v. Coon*, 633 F.2d 1172 (5th Cir. 1981); ORD 455 at 3-7. The second constitutionally protected privacy interest is in freedom from public disclosure of certain personal matters. *See Ramie v. City of Hedwig Village, Tex.*, 765 F.2d 490 (5th Cir. 1985); ORD 455 at 6-7. This aspect of constitutional privacy balances the individual's privacy interest against the public's interest in the information. *See* ORD 455 at 7. Constitutional privacy under section 552.101 is reserved for "the most intimate aspects of human affairs." *Id.* at 8 (quoting *Ramie*, 765 F.2d at 492).

This office has applied privacy to protect certain information about incarcerated individuals. *See* Open Records Decision Nos. 430 (1985), 428 (1985), 185 (1978). Citing *State v. Ellefson*, 224 S.E.2d 666 (S.C. 1976) as authority, this office held that those individuals who correspond with inmates possess a "first amendment right . . . to maintain

communication with [the inmate] free of the threat of public exposure;” and that this right would be violated by the release of information that identifies those correspondents, because such a release would discourage correspondence. ORD 185. The information at issue in Open Records Decision No. 185 was the identities of individuals who had corresponded with inmates, and our office found that “the public’s right to obtain an inmate’s correspondence list is not sufficient to overcome the first amendment right of the inmate’s correspondents to maintain communication with him free of the threat of public exposure.” *Id.* Implicit in this holding is the fact that an individual’s association with an inmate may be intimate or embarrassing. In Open Records Decision Nos. 428 and 430, our office determined that inmate visitor and mail logs which identify inmates and those who choose to visit or correspond with inmates are protected by constitutional privacy because people who correspond with inmates have a First Amendment right to do so that would be threatened if their names were released. ORDs 428, 430. Further, we recognized that inmates had a constitutional right to visit with outsiders and outsiders could also be threatened if their names were released. *See also* ORD 185. The rights of those individuals to anonymity was found to outweigh the public’s interest in this information. *Id.*; *see* ORD 430 (list of inmate visitors protected by constitutional privacy of both inmate and visitors). In this instance, the remaining information contains telephone logs and visitor logs related to a named inmate. Upon review, we find this information is confidential under constitutional privacy. Accordingly, the sheriff’s office must withhold the information we marked under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with the constitutional right to privacy.

In summary, the sheriff’s office need not release the information we marked pursuant to section 552.003 of the Government Code. The sheriff’s office must withhold the biometric identifiers you marked and we marked under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 560.003 of the Government Code. With the exception of the information we marked for release, we find the information you marked consists of CHRI which the sheriff’s office must withhold under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 411.083 of the Government Code and federal law. With the exception of the information we marked, the sheriff’s office must withhold the information you marked from disclosure under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 261.201(a) of the Family Code. With the exception of the information we marked for release, the sheriff’s office must withhold the information you marked under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with the MPA. The sheriff’s office must withhold the information you marked, and the additional information we marked, under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 58.008(b) of the Family Code. The sheriff’s office may withhold the information we marked under section 552.108(b)(1) of the Government Code. To the extent the employee at issue timely requested confidentiality under section 552.024 of the Government Code, the sheriff’s office must withhold the information we marked under section 552.117(a)(1) of the Government Code. The sheriff’s office must withhold the motor vehicle record information you marked, and the additional information we marked, under section 552.130 of the Government Code. The sheriff’s office must withhold the access device numbers and account numbers you marked under section 552.136 of the Government Code. The sheriff’s office must withhold the e-mail addresses you marked in the remaining information under section 552.137 of the Government Code, unless their owners affirmatively consent to their

public disclosure or subsection (c) applies. The sheriff's office must withhold the identifying information of the undercover officers, which you marked, under section 552.152 of the Government Code. The sheriff's office must withhold the information we marked and indicated under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy. The sheriff's office must withhold the information we marked under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with the constitutional right to privacy. The sheriff's office must release the remaining information.

This letter ruling is limited to the particular information at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other information or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For more information concerning those rights and responsibilities, please visit our website at <https://www.texasattorneygeneral.gov/open-government/members-public/what-expect-after-ruling-issued> or call the OAG's Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. Questions concerning the allowable charges for providing public information under the Public Information Act may be directed to the Cost Rules Administrator of the OAG, toll free, at (888) 672-6787.

Sincerely,

Ashley Crutchfield  
Assistant Attorney General  
Open Records Division

AC/jm

Ref: ID# 840643

Enc. Submitted documents

c: Requestor  
(w/o enclosures)