



KEN PAXTON
ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS

August 11, 2020

Ms. Catherine Zellers
City Attorney's Office
City of Weatherford
P.O. Box 255
Weatherford, Texas 76086

OR2020-20047

Dear Ms. Zellers:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 839217 (Records Center No. W001989).

The Weatherford Police Department (the "department") received a request for information pertaining to a specified arrest. You claim some of the submitted information was not properly requested pursuant to section 1701.661 of the Occupations Code. You also claim the submitted information is excepted from disclosure under sections 552.101, 552.108, 552.130, and 552.147 of the Government Code. We have considered the submitted arguments and reviewed the submitted information.

Initially, we note the submitted information includes police officers' body worn camera recordings. Body worn cameras are subject to chapter 1701 of the Occupations Code. Chapter 1701 provides the procedures a requestor must follow when seeking a body worn camera recording. Section 1701.661 provides, in relevant part, the following:

(a) A member of the public is required to provide the following information when submitting a written request to a law enforcement agency for information recorded by a body worn camera:

- (1) the date and approximate time of the recording;
- (2) the specific location where the recording occurred; and

(3) the name of one or more persons known to be a subject of the recording.

Occ. Code § 1701.661(a). In this instance, the requestor does not provide the requisite information under section 1701.661(a). As the body worn camera recordings at issue were not properly requested pursuant to chapter 1701 of the Occupations Code, our ruling does not reach this information and it need not be released.¹ However, pursuant to section 1701.661(b), a “failure to provide all the information required by [s]ubsection (a) to be part of a request for recorded information does not preclude the requestor from making a future request for the same recorded information.” *Id.* § 1701.661(b).

Next, we address your contention that article 15.26 of the Code of Criminal Procedure does not make the submitted arrest warrant and probable cause affidavit expressly public. Article 15.26 of the Code of Criminal Procedure Provides, in relevant part, the following:

The arrest warrant, and any affidavit presented to the magistrate in support of the issuance of the warrant, is public information, and beginning immediately when the warrant is executed the magistrate’s clerk shall make a copy of the warrant and the affidavit available for public inspection in the clerk’s office during normal business hours.

Crim Proc. Code art. 15.26. Thus, we interpret article 15.26 of the Code of Criminal Procedure to apply only to court clerks. Therefore, we find that article 15.26 does not make the arrest warrant and probable cause affidavit maintained by the department expressly public. Accordingly, we will address your arguments against disclosure of the remaining information.

Next, we note the requestor is a representative of the Texas Department of State Health Services (“DSHS”). In her request, the requestor states she is seeking the requested information as part of an investigation she is conducting pursuant to chapter 773 of the Health and Safety Code. Section 773.0612 of the Health and Safety Code provides DSHS or its representative “is entitled to access to records and other documents . . . that are directly related to . . . emergency medical services personnel to the extent necessary to enforce [chapter 773 of the Health and Safety Code] and the rules adopted under [chapter 773 of the Health and Safety Code].” Health & Safety Code § 773.0612(a). The requestor asserts the submitted information pertains to an emergency medical technician licensed under chapter 773 of the Health and Safety Code. She also indicates the information is needed to enforce section 157.36(b) of title 25 of the Texas Administrative Code. *See* 25 T.A.C. § 157.36(b). Because the submitted information is directly related to an emergency medical technician and the requestor is conducting an investigation under chapter 773, we conclude section 773.0612 of the Health and Safety Code applies to the submitted information. A

¹ As we are able to make this determination, we need not address your remaining arguments against disclosure of this information.

statutory right of access prevails over the Act's general exceptions to public disclosure. *See* Open Records Decision Nos. 613 at 4 (1993) (exceptions in Act cannot impinge on statutory right of access to information), 451 (1986) (specific statutory right of access provisions overcome general exception to disclosure under the Act). In addition, a statutory right of access prevails over a claim under common-law privacy. *See Collins v. Tex. Mall, L.P.*, 297 S.W.3d 409,415 (Tex. App.—Fort Worth 2009, no pet.) (statutory provision controls and pre-empts common law only when statute directly conflicts with common-law principle); *see also Center Point Energy Houston Elec. LLC v. Harris County Toll Rd. Auth.*, 436 F.3d 541, 544 (5th Cir. 2006) (common law controls only where there is no conflicting or controlling statutory law). Therefore, the department may not withhold any of the submitted information from the requestor under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy, section 552.108 of the Government Code, or 552.147 of the Government Code.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code excepts “information considered to be confidential by law, either constitutional, statutory, or by judicial decision.” Gov't Code § 552.101. Section 552.101 encompasses information protected by other statutes, such as section 411.083 of the Government Code, which pertains to criminal history record information (“CHRI”). CHRI generated by the National Crime Information Center (“NCIC”) or by the Texas Crime Information Center is confidential under federal and state law. CHRI means “information collected about a person by a criminal justice agency that consists of identifiable descriptions and notations of arrests, detentions, indictments, informations, and other formal criminal charges and their dispositions.” *Id.* § 411.082(2). Title 28, part 20 of the Code of Federal Regulations governs the release of CHRI obtained from the NCIC network or other states. *See* 28 C.F.R. § 20.21. The federal regulations allow each state to follow its individual law with respect to CHRI it generates. Open Records Decision No. 565 at 7 (1990); *see generally* Gov't Code ch. 411 subch. F. Section 411.083 of the Government Code deems confidential CHRI the Texas Department of Public Safety (“DPS”) maintains, except DPS may disseminate this information as provided in chapter 411, subchapter F, or subchapter E-1, of the Government Code. *See* Gov't Code § 411.083. Sections 411.083(b)(1) and 411.089(a) authorize a criminal justice agency to obtain CHRI; however, a criminal justice agency may not release CHRI except to another criminal justice agency for a criminal justice purpose. *Id.* § 411.089(b)(1). Thus, any CHRI obtained from DPS or any other criminal justice agency must be withheld under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with Government Code chapter 411. We note section 411.083 does not apply to active warrant information or other information relating to one's current involvement with the criminal justice system. *See id.* § 411.081(b) (police department allowed to disclose information pertaining to person's current involvement in the criminal justice system). Upon review, we find the department has not demonstrated any portion of the remaining information consists of CHRI for purposes of chapter 411 of the Government Code, and the department may not withhold any of the remaining information under section 552.101 of the Government Code on that basis.

Section 552.130 of the Government Code provides information relating to a motor vehicle operator's license, driver's license, motor vehicle title or registration, or personal

identification document issued by an agency of this state or another state or country is excepted from public release. *See id.* § 552.130. Accordingly, except for the information we marked for release, we find the motor vehicle record information you marked, and the additional information we marked and indicated, are generally confidential under section 552.130 of the Government Code. However, we find you have failed to demonstrate the information we marked for release is subject to section 552.130, and it may not be withheld on that basis.

Because section 773.0612 of the Health and Safety Code authorizes the requestor to obtain the submitted information in its entirety and section 552.130 of the Government Code excepts from disclosure portions of the submitted information, we find section 773.0612 of the Health and Safety Code is in conflict with section 552.130 of the Government Code. Where information falls within both a general and a specific provision of law, the specific provision prevails over the general. *See id.* § 311.026 (where general statutory provision conflicts with specific provision, specific provision prevails as exception to general provision unless the general provision is the later enactment and the manifest intent is that the general provision prevails); *Cuellar v. State*, 521 S.W.2d 277 (Tex. Crim. App. 1975) (under well-established rule of statutory construction, specific statutory provisions prevail over general ones). Section 773.0612 gives a general right of access to all information related to emergency medical services personnel being investigated by DSHS, while section 552.130 specifically protects motor vehicle record information. In addition, because section 552.130 has its own access provisions, we conclude section 552.130 is not a general exception under the Act. *See* ORDs 613 at 4, 451 at 4. Therefore, we find the confidentiality provided by section 552.130 is more specific than the general right of access provided by section 773.0612. Accordingly, except for the information we marked for release, the department must withhold the motor vehicle record information you marked, and the additional information we marked and indicated, under section 552.130 of the Government Code.

In summary, except for the information we marked for release, the department must withhold the motor vehicle record information you marked, and the additional information we marked and indicated, under section 552.130 of the Government Code. The department must release the remaining information pursuant to section 773.0612 of the Health and Safety Code.²

This letter ruling is limited to the particular information at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other information or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For more information concerning those rights and responsibilities, please visit our website at <https://www.texasattorneygeneral.gov/open->

² Because the requestor has a special right of access to the information being released, the department must again seek a decision from this office if it receives another request for the same information from another requestor.

[government/members-public/what-expect-after-ruling-issued](#) or call the OAG's Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. Questions concerning the allowable charges for providing public information under the Public Information Act may be directed to the Cost Rules Administrator of the OAG, toll free, at (888) 672-6787.

Sincerely,

Katie Stallcup
Assistant Attorney General
Open Records Division

AKS/be

Ref: ID# 839217

Enc. Submitted documents

c: Requestor
(w/o enclosures)