



KEN PAXTON
ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS

August 6, 2020

Mr. Eric C. Farrar
Counsel for the Memorial Villages Police Department
Olson & Olson, L.L.P.
2727 Allen Parkway, Suite 600
Houston, Texas 77019-2133

OR2020-19620

Dear Mr. Farrar:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 837761(MVPD20-006).

The Memorial Villages Police Department (the "department"), which you represent, received a request for information pertaining to a named department officer, including video recordings and audio recordings of traffic stops made by the named department officer during a specified period of time. You state the department will withhold information pursuant to section 552.147(b) of the Government Code and Open Records Decision No. 684 (2009).¹ You claim some of the submitted information was not properly requested pursuant to section 1701.661 of the Occupations Code. You further claim the submitted information is excepted from disclosure under sections 552.101, 552.102, 552.108, and 552.119 of the Government Code. We have considered your arguments and reviewed the submitted information.

Initially, we note the submitted information contains peace officers' Texas Commission on Law Enforcement ("TCOLE") identification numbers. Section 552.002(a) of the Government Code defines "public information" as information that is written, produced,

¹ Section 552.147(b) of the Government Code authorizes a governmental body to redact a living person's social security number from public release without the necessity of requesting a decision from this office under the Act. *See* Gov't Code § 552.147(b). Open Records Decision No. 684 is a previous determination to all governmental bodies authorizing them to withhold certain categories of information without the necessity of requesting an attorney general opinion.

collected, assembled, or maintained under a law or ordinance or in connection with the transaction of official business:

- (1) by a governmental body;
- (2) for a governmental body and the governmental body:
 - (A) owns the information;
 - (B) has a right of access to the information; or
 - (C) spends or contributes public money for the purpose of writing, producing, collecting, assembling, or maintaining the information;
or
- (3) by an individual officer or employee of a governmental body in the officer's or employee's official capacity and the information pertains to official business of the governmental body.

Gov't Code § 552.002(a). In Open Records Decision No. 581 (1990), this office determined certain computer information, such as source codes, documentation information, and other computer programming, that has no significance other than its use as a tool for the maintenance, manipulation, or protection of public property is not the kind of information made public under section 552.021 of the Government Code. We understand an officer's TCOLE identification number is a unique computer-generated number assigned to peace officers for identification in TCOLE's electronic database, and may be used as an access device number on the TCOLE website. Thus, we find the TCOLE identification numbers in the submitted information do not constitute public information under section 552.002 of the Government Code. Therefore, the submitted TCOLE identification numbers are not subject to the Act and need not be released to the requestor.

Next, we note some of the remaining information consists of an officer's body worn camera recordings. Body worn cameras are subject to chapter 1701 of the Occupations Code. Chapter 1701 provides the procedures a requestor must follow when seeking a body worn camera recording. Section 1701.661(a) provides:

A member of the public is required to provide the following information when submitting a written request to a law enforcement agency for information recorded by a body worn camera:

- (1) the date and approximate time of the recording;
- (2) the specific location where the recording occurred; and
- (3) the name of one or more persons known to be a subject of the recording.

Occ. Code § 1701.661(a). In this instance, the requestor does not give the requisite information under section 1701.661(a). As the requestor did not properly request the body worn camera recordings at issue pursuant to chapter 1701, our ruling does not reach this information and it need not be released.² However, pursuant to section 1701.661(b), a “failure to provide all the information required by Subsection (a) to be part of a request for recorded information does not preclude the requestor from making a future request for the same recorded information.” *Id.* § 1701.661(b). We note the remaining video recording is not subject to the requirements of section 1701.661 of the Occupations Code. Accordingly, we will consider whether the remaining video recording is otherwise excepted from disclosure under the Act.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code excepts from disclosure “information considered to be confidential by law, either constitutional, statutory, or by judicial decision.” Gov’t Code § 552.101. Section 552.101 of the Government Code encompasses section 58.008 of the Family Code, which provides, in part:

(b) Except as provided by Subsection (c), law enforcement records concerning a child and information concerning a child that are stored by electronic means or otherwise and from which a record could be generated may not be disclosed to the public and shall be:

(1) if maintained on paper or microfilm, kept separate from adult records;

(2) if maintained electronically in the same computer system as adult records, accessible only under controls that are separate and distinct from the controls to access electronic data concerning adults; and

(3) maintained on a local basis only and not sent to a central state or federal depository, except as provided by Subsection (c) or Subchapter B, D, or E.

Fam. Code § 58.008(b); *see also id.* § 51.03(a)-(b) (defining “delinquent conduct” and “conduct indicating a need for supervision” for purposes of title 3 of Family Code). Section 58.008(b) is applicable to records of juvenile conduct that occurred before, on, or after September 1, 2017. *See* Act of May 28, 2017, 85th Leg., R.S., ch. 746, § 22, 2017 Tex. Sess. Law Serv. 3173, 3187. The juvenile must have been at least 10 years old and less than 17 years of age when the conduct occurred. *See* Fam. Code § 51.02(2) (defining “child” for purposes of title 3 of Family Code). You state the information you marked involves a child engaged in delinquent conduct or conduct indicating a need for supervision. However, upon our review, we find the information at issue does not identify a suspect or offender who is ten years of age or older and under seventeen years of age. As such, section

² As we are able to make this determination, we need not address the argument against disclosure of this information.

58.008(b) is not applicable and the department may not withhold the information you marked under section 552.101 on this basis.

Section 552.102(a) of the Government Code excepts from disclosure “information in a personnel file, the disclosure of which would constitute a clearly unwarranted invasion of personal privacy.” Gov’t Code § 552.102(a). The Texas Supreme Court held section 552.102(a) excepts from disclosure the dates of birth of state employees in the payroll database of the Texas Comptroller of Public Accounts. *Tex. Comptroller of Pub. Accounts v. Attorney Gen. of Tex.*, 354 S.W.3d 336 (Tex. 2010). Accordingly, the department must withhold the employees’ dates of birth you marked under section 552.102(a) of the Government Code.

Section 552.108 provides, in relevant part:

(a) Information held by a law enforcement agency or prosecutor that deals with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime is excepted from the requirements of 552.021 if:

(1) release of the information would interfere with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime; [or]

(2) it is information that deals with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime only in relation to an investigation that did not result in conviction or deferred adjudication[.]

(b) An internal record or notation of a law enforcement agency or prosecutor that is maintained for internal use in matters relating to law enforcement or prosecution is excepted from the [required public disclosure] if:

...

(2) the internal record or notation relates to law enforcement only in relation to an investigation that did not result in a conviction or deferred adjudication[.]

Gov’t Code § 552.108(a)(1)-(2), (b)(2). A governmental body claiming section 552.108(a)(1) must explain how and why the release of the requested information would interfere with law enforcement. *See id.* §§ 552.108(a)(1), .301(e)(1)(A); *see also Ex parte Pruitt*, 551 S.W.2d 706 (Tex. 1977). The information you seek to withhold under section 552.108(a)(1) pertains to internal affairs investigations. Section 552.108 is generally not applicable to information relating to an administrative investigation that did not involve a criminal investigation or prosecution. *See Morales v. Ellen*, 840 S.W.2d 519, 525-26 (Tex. Civ. App.—El Paso 1992, writ denied) (statutory predecessor to section 552.108 not applicable to internal investigation that did not result in criminal investigation or prosecution); *see also City of Fort Worth v. Cornyn*, 86 S.W.3d 320, 329 (Tex. App.—Austin 2002, no pet.) (section 552.108 generally not applicable to law enforcement agency’s personnel records); Open Records Decision No. 350 at 3-4 (1982). However, you

state the information at issue relates to pending criminal investigations or prosecutions. Based upon this representation and our review, we find release of the information you have marked would interfere with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime. *See Houston Chronicle Publ'g Co. v. City of Houston*, 531 S.W.2d 177 (Tex. Civ. App.—Houston [14th Dist.] 1975) (delineating law enforcement interests present in active cases), *writ ref'd n.r.e. per curiam*, 536 S.W.2d 559 (Tex. 1976). Accordingly, we find section 552.108(a)(1) is applicable to the information you have marked.

Sections 552.108(a)(2) and (b)(2) protect information relating to a concluded criminal investigation that did not result in a conviction or deferred adjudication. A governmental body that raises sections 552.108(a)(2) and (b)(2) must demonstrate the requested information relates to a criminal investigation that has concluded in a final result other than a conviction or deferred adjudication. *See Gov't Code § 552.301(e)* (governmental body must provide comments explaining why exceptions raised should apply to information requested). As noted above, section 552.108 is generally not applicable to the records of an internal affairs investigation that is purely administrative in nature and does not involve the investigation or prosecution of crime. *See Cornyn*, 86 S.W.3d 320; *Ellen*, 840 S.W.2d 519; *see also* ORD 350 at 3-4.

You represent the information at issue relates to closed criminal investigations by the department that did not result in convictions or deferred adjudications. Upon review, we find section 552.108(a)(2) of the Government Code is applicable to the information we marked. However, we note the remaining information pertains to internal investigations conducted by the department and is not information that deals with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime only in relation to a criminal investigation that did not result in conviction or deferred adjudication. Therefore, the department failed to demonstrate the applicability of section 552.108(a)(2) or section 552.108(b)(2) to the remaining information, and the department may not withhold the remaining information on those bases.

However, section 552.108 does not except from disclosure basic information about an arrested person, an arrest, or a crime. Gov't Code § 552.108(c). Basic information refers to the information held to be public in *Houston Chronicle Publishing Co. v. City of Houston*, 531 S.W.2d 177 (Tex. Civ. App.—Houston [14th Dist.] 1975), *writ ref'd n.r.e. per curiam*, 536 S.W.2d 559 (Tex. 1976). *See* Open Records Decision No. 127 (1976) (summarizing types of information made public by *Houston Chronicle*). Thus, with the exception of basic information, which must be released, the department may withhold the information you have marked under section 552.108(a)(1) of the Government Code and the information we marked under section 552.108(a)(2) of the Government Code.³

Section 552.108(b)(1) of the Government Code excepts from disclosure the internal records and notations of law enforcement agencies and prosecutors when their release would

³ As our ruling on this information is dispositive, we need not address your remaining arguments against its disclosure.

interfere with law enforcement and crime prevention. Gov't Code § 552.108(b)(1); *see also* Open Records Decision No. 531 at 2 (1989) (quoting *Ex parte Pruitt*, 551 S.W.2d 706 (Tex. 1977)). A governmental body claiming section 552.108(b)(1) must explain how and why the release of the requested information would interfere with law enforcement. *See* Gov't Code §§ 552.108(b)(1), .301(e)(1)(A); *see also Ex parte Pruitt*, 551 S.W.2d 706. Section 552.108(b)(1) is intended to protect "information which, if released, would permit private citizens to anticipate weaknesses in a police department, avoid detection, jeopardize officer safety, and generally undermine police efforts to effectuate the laws of this State." *See City of Fort Worth v. Cornyn*, 86 S.W.3d 320, 327 (Tex. App.—Austin 2002, no pet.). This office has concluded section 552.108(b)(1) excepts from public disclosure information relating to the security or operation of a law enforcement agency. *See, e.g.*, Open Records Decision Nos. 531 (release of detailed use of force guidelines would unduly interfere with law enforcement), 252 (1980) (section 552.108 of the Government Code is designed to protect investigative techniques and procedures used in law enforcement), 143 (1976) (disclosure of specific operations or specialized equipment directly related to investigation or detection of crime may be excepted). Section 552.108(b)(1) is not applicable, however, to generally known policies and procedures. *See, e.g.*, ORDs 531 at 2–3 (Penal Code provisions, common law rules, and constitutional limitations on use of force not protected), 252 at 3 (governmental body failed to indicate why investigative procedures and techniques requested were any different from those commonly known).

The department asserts release of some of the remaining information would "permit a private citizen to anticipate a weakness in the police department that would disarm current peace officers." The department also asserts release of the submitted firearm serial numbers would interfere with law enforcement because they could be used on an illegal firearm or in a missing weapons report. Upon review, we agree release of the submitted firearm serial numbers would interfere with law enforcement. Accordingly, the department may withhold the submitted firearm serial numbers under section 552.108(b)(1) of the Government Code. However, we find you have not demonstrated release of the remaining information would interfere with law enforcement or crime prevention. Accordingly, the department may not withhold the remaining information under section 552.108(b)(1).

Section 552.101 of the Government Code also encompasses laws that make criminal history record information ("CHRI") confidential. CHRI generated by the National Crime Information Center or by the Texas Crime Information Center is confidential under federal and state law. Title 28, part 20 of the Code of Federal Regulations governs the release of CHRI that states obtain from the federal government or other states. Open Records Decision No. 565 at 7 (1990). The federal regulations allow each state to follow its individual law with respect to CHRI it generates. *Id.* Section 411.083 of the Government Code deems confidential CHRI the Department of Public Safety ("DPS") maintains, except DPS may disseminate this information as provided in chapter 411, subchapter E-1 and subchapter F of the Government Code. *See* Gov't Code § 411.083. Sections 411.083(b)(1) and 411.089(a) authorize a criminal justice agency to obtain CHRI; however, a criminal justice agency may not release CHRI except to another criminal justice agency for a criminal justice purpose. *Id.* § 411.089(b)(1). Other entities specified in chapter 411 of the Government Code are entitled to obtain CHRI from DPS or another criminal justice agency; however, those entities may not release CHRI except as provided by chapter 411. *See*

generally id. §§ 411.090-.127. Similarly, any CHRI obtained from DPS or any other criminal justice agency must be withheld under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with Government Code chapter 411, subchapter F. *See id.* § 411.082(2)(B) (term CHRI does not include driving record information). Accordingly, the department must withhold the remaining information you marked under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 411.083 of the Government Code.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code also encompasses the doctrine of common-law privacy, which protects information that is (1) highly intimate or embarrassing, the publication of which would be highly objectionable to a reasonable person, and (2) not of legitimate concern to the public. *Indus. Found. v. Tex. Indus. Accident Bd.*, 540 S.W.2d 668, 685 (Tex. 1976). To demonstrate the applicability of common-law privacy, both prongs of this test must be satisfied. *Id.* at 681-82. Types of information considered intimate and embarrassing by the Texas Supreme Court are delineated in *Industrial Foundation*. *Id.* at 683. Additionally, this office has found personal financial information not relating to a financial transaction between an individual and a governmental body is excepted from required public disclosure under common-law privacy. *See* Open Records Decision Nos. 523 (1989) (common-law privacy protects credit reports, financial statements, and other personal financial information), 373 (1983) (sources of income not related to financial transaction between individual and governmental body protected under common-law privacy). However, this office has noted the public has a legitimate interest in information that relates to public employees and their conduct in the workplace. *See, e.g.*, Open Records Decision Nos. 562 at 10 (1990) (personnel file information does not involve most intimate aspects of human affairs but in fact touches on matters of legitimate public concern), 470 at 4 (job performance does not generally constitute public employee's private affairs), 444 at 3 (1986) (public has obvious interest in information concerning qualifications and performance of government employees), 405 at 2 (1983) (manner in which public employee's job was performed cannot be said to be of minimal public interest), 329 (1982) (reasons for employee's resignation ordinarily not private).

Upon review, we find some of the remaining information satisfies the standard articulated by the Texas Supreme Court in *Industrial Foundation*. Thus, the department must withhold the information we marked under section 552.101 in conjunction with common-law privacy. However, we find you have failed to demonstrate any of the remaining information is highly intimate or embarrassing and not of legitimate public concern. Therefore, the department may not withhold the remaining information under section 552.101 in conjunction with common-law privacy.

You also state the department will withhold information subject to section 552.117(a)(2) of the Government Code in accordance with Open Records Decision No. 670 (2001).⁴ Section 552.117(a)(2) of the Government Code applies to records a governmental body holds in an employment capacity and excepts from public disclosure a peace officer's home address

⁴ Open Records Decision No. 670 authorizes all governmental bodies to withhold the current and former home addresses and telephone numbers, personal cellular telephone and pager numbers, social security numbers, and family member information of peace officers under section 552.117(a)(2) of the Government Code without the necessity of requesting an attorney general decision. *See* ORD 670 at 6.

and telephone number, social security number, emergency contact information, and family member information regardless of whether the peace officer made an election under section 552.024 of the Government Code. Gov't Code § 552.117(a)(2). Section 552.117(a)(2) applies to peace officers as defined by article 2.12 of the Code of Criminal Procedure. Accordingly, the department must withhold the information you marked and the information we marked under section 552.117(a)(2) of the Government Code.

Section 552.119 of the Government Code provides as follows:

(a) A photograph that depicts a peace officer as defined by Article 2.12, Code of Criminal Procedure, the release of which would endanger the life or physical safety of the officer, is excepted from [required public disclosure] unless:

- (1) the officer is under indictment or charged with an offense by information;
- (2) the officer is a party in a civil service hearing or a case in arbitration; or
- (3) the photograph is introduced as evidence in a judicial proceeding.

(b) A photograph exempt from disclosure under Subsection (a) may be made public only if the peace officer or security officer gives written consent to the disclosure.

Id. § 552.119. Under section 552.119, a governmental body must demonstrate, if the documents do not demonstrate on their face, release of the photograph would endanger the life or physical safety of a peace officer. Upon review, we find the department has not demonstrated that release of the peace officer's photograph in this instance would endanger the life or physical safety of the officer. Therefore, the department may not withhold the submitted photograph under section 552.119 of the Government Code from the requestor.

You state you will redact the motor vehicle record information you have marked under section 552.130(c) of the Government Code.⁵ We note the video recording we have indicated contains additional information subject to section 552.130. Section 552.130 of the Government Code excepts from public disclosure information relating to a motor vehicle operator's or driver's license, motor vehicle title or registration, or personal identification document issued by an agency of this state or another state or country. *See id.* § 552.130. Thus, the department must withhold the motor vehicle record information you marked and the visible license plates and audible license plate number in the video recording we have indicated under section 552.130 of the Government Code.

⁵ Section 552.130(c) of the Government Code allows a governmental body to redact the information described in section 552.130(a) without the necessity of seeking a decision from the attorney general. *See* Gov't Code § 552.130(c). If a governmental body redacts such information, it must notify the requestor in accordance with section 552.130(e). *See id.* § 552.130(d), (e).

You state the department will withhold information pursuant to section 552.136(c) of the Government Code.⁶ Section 552.136 provides as follows:

(a) In this section, “access device” means a card, plate, code, account number, personal identification number, electronic serial number, mobile identification number, or other telecommunications service, equipment, or instrument identifier or means of account access that alone or in conjunction with another access device may be used to:

(1) obtain money, goods, services, or another thing of value; or

(2) initiate a transfer of funds other than a transfer originated solely by paper instrument.

(b) Notwithstanding any other provision of this chapter, a credit card, debit card, charge card, or access device number that is collected, assembled, or maintained by or for a governmental body is confidential.

Id. § 552.136. Upon review, we find most of the information you have marked is subject to section 552.136. However, you have not explained how the submitted “PID” numbers constitute access device numbers for purposes of section 552.136. According, with the exception of the “PID” numbers, the department may withhold the information you marked under section 552.136 of the Government Code.

In summary, the submitted TCOLE identification numbers are not subject to the Act and need not be released to the requestor. As the requestor did not properly request the body worn camera recordings at issue pursuant to chapter 1701 of the Occupations Code, our ruling does not reach this information and it need not be released. The department must withhold the employees’ dates of birth you marked under section 552.102(a) of the Government Code. With the exception of basic information, which must be released, the department may withhold the information you have marked under section 552.108(a)(1) of the Government Code and the information we marked under section 552.108(a)(2) of the Government Code. The department may withhold the submitted firearm serial numbers under section 552.108(b)(1) of the Government Code. The department must withhold the CHRI you marked under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 411.083 of the Government Code. The department must withhold the information we marked under section 552.101 in conjunction with common-law privacy. The department must withhold the information you marked and the information we marked under section 552.117(a)(2) of the Government Code. The department must withhold the motor vehicle record information you marked and the visible license plates and audible license plate number in the video recording we have indicated under section 552.130 of the

⁶ Section 552.136(c) of the Government Code allows a governmental body to redact the information described in section 552.136(b) without the necessity of seeking a decision from the attorney general. *See* Gov’t Code § 552.136(c). If a governmental body redacts such information, it must notify the requestor in accordance with section 552.136(e). *See id.* § 552.136(d), (e).

Government Code. With the exception of the “PID” numbers, the department may withhold the information you marked under section 552.136 of the Government Code. The department must release the remaining information.

This letter ruling is limited to the particular information at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other information or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For more information concerning those rights and responsibilities, please visit our website at <https://www.texasattorneygeneral.gov/open-government/members-public/what-expect-after-ruling-issued> or call the OAG’s Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. Questions concerning the allowable charges for providing public information under the Public Information Act may be directed to the Cost Rules Administrator of the OAG, toll free, at (888) 672-6787.

Sincerely,

Jennifer Copeland
Assistant Attorney General
Open Records Division

JC/jxd

Ref: ID# 837761

Enc. Submitted documents

c: Requestor
(w/o enclosures)