



KEN PAXTON
ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS

July 31, 2020

Mr. Thomas L. McMillian
Assistant City Attorney
City of Amarillo
200 Southeast Third Avenue, Fourth Floor
Amarillo, Texas 79101

OR2020-19221

Dear Mr. McMillian:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 839150 (ORR# 20-1430).

The Amarillo Police Department (the "department") received two requests from the same requestor for records related to a named individual. The department states it is releasing some of the requested information. The department claims the submitted information is excepted from disclosure under section 552.101 of the Government Code. We have considered the exception the department claims and reviewed the submitted information.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code excepts from disclosure "information considered to be confidential by law, either constitutional, statutory, or by judicial decision." Gov't Code § 552.101. Section 552.101 encompasses section 58.008 of the Family Code, which provides, in part:

(b) Except as provided by Subsection (c), law enforcement records concerning a child and information concerning a child that are stored by electronic means or otherwise from which a record could be generated may not be disclosed to the public and shall be:

(1) if maintained on paper or microfilm, kept separate from adult records;

(2) if maintained electronically in the same computer system as adult records, accessible only under controls that are separate and distinct from the controls to access electronic data concerning adults; and

(3) maintained on a local basis only and not sent to a central state or federal depository, except as provided by Subsection (c) or Subchapter B, D, or E.

...

(d) Law enforcement records concerning a child may be inspected or copied by:

(1) a juvenile justice agency, as defined by Section 58.101;

(2) a criminal justice agency, as defined by Section 411.082, Government Code;

(3) the child; [or]

(4) the child's parent or guardian[.]

(e) Before a child or a child's parent or guardian may inspect or copy a record concerning the child under Subsection (d), the custodian of the record shall redact:

(1) any personally identifiable information about a juvenile suspect, offender, victim, or witness who is not the child; and

(2) any information that is excepted from required disclosure under [the Act] or any other law.

Fam. Code § 58.008(b), (d), (e); *see id.* § 51.03(a) (defining "delinquent conduct" for purposes of title 3 of Family Code). Section 58.008(b) is applicable to records of juvenile conduct that occurred before, on, or after September 1, 2017. *See* Act of May 28, 2017, 85th Leg., R.S., ch. 746, § 22. The juvenile must have been at least 10 years old and less than 17 years of age when the conduct occurred. *See* Fam Code § 51.02(2) (defining "child" for purposes of title 3 of Family Code). We note section 58.008(b) applies only to law enforcement records that involve a juvenile as a suspect, offender, or defendant. Section 58.008(b) does not apply to law enforcement records that relate to a juvenile only as a complainant, victim, witness, or other involved party. The department argues the submitted information falls within the scope of section 58.008(b) of the Family Code. Case number 12-0534945 involves a juvenile offender, so as to fall within the scope of section 58.008(b). In this instance, however, the requestor provided signed consent from the juvenile offender for release of the information, and thus the requestor is an authorized representative of the juvenile offender. Therefore, the requestor has a right to inspect juvenile law enforcement records concerning this juvenile pursuant to section 58.008(d) of the Family Code. *See id.*

§ 58.008(d). Accordingly, the department may not withhold case number 12-0534945 from this requestor under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 58.008(b) of the Family Code. Further, upon review, we find case number 2012-0534939 does not list a juvenile as a suspect, offender, or defendant. Thus, the department has not demonstrated case number 2012-0534939 involves juvenile conduct for purposes of section 58.008(b) of the Family Code, and the department may not withhold any portion of case number 2012-0534939 under section 552.101 of the Government Code on that basis. However, we note section 58.008(e)(2) provides information subject to any other exception to disclosure under the Act or other law must also be redacted. *See id.* § 58.008(e)(2). Accordingly, we will consider additional exceptions to disclosure of both reports.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code also encompasses information protected by section 261.201 of the Family Code, which provides, in relevant part, as follows:

(a) [T]he following information is confidential, is not subject to public release under Chapter 552, Government Code, and may be disclosed only for purposes consistent with this code and applicable federal or state law or under rules adopted by an investigating agency:

(1) a report of alleged or suspected abuse or neglect made under this chapter and the identity of the person making the report; and

(2) except as otherwise provided in this section, the files, reports, records, communications, audiotapes, videotapes, and working papers used or developed in an investigation under this chapter or in providing services as a result of an investigation.

...

(k) Notwithstanding Subsection (a), an investigating agency, other than the [Texas Department of Family and Protective Services] or the Texas Juvenile Justice Department, on request, shall provide to the parent, managing conservator, or other legal representative of a child who is the subject of reported abuse or neglect, or to the child if the child is at least 18 years of age, information concerning the reported abuse or neglect that would otherwise be confidential under this section. The investigating agency shall withhold information under this subsection if the parent, managing conservator, or other legal representative of the child requesting the information is alleged to have committed the abuse or neglect.

(l) Before a child or a parent, managing conservator, or other legal representative of a child may inspect or copy a record or file concerning the child under Subsection (k), the custodian of the record or file must redact:

(1) any personally identifiable information about a victim or witness under 18 years of age unless that victim or witness is:

- (A) the child who is the subject of the report; or
 - (B) another child of the parent, managing conservator, or other legal representative requesting the information;
- (2) any information that is excepted from required disclosure under [the Act], or other law; and
- (3) the identity of the person who made the report.

Fam. Code § 261.201(a), (k), (l). Case numbers 12-0534939 and 12-0534945 were used or developed in investigations of alleged or suspected child abuse or neglect conducted by the department. *See id.* §§ 101.003(a) (defining “child” for purposes of this section as person under 18 years of age who is not and has not been married or who has not had the disabilities of minority removed for general purposes), 261.001(1), (4) (defining “abuse” and “neglect” for purposes of chapter 261 of the Family Code). Accordingly, we find the submitted information is subject to chapter 261 of the Family Code. The department does not indicate it has adopted a rule that governs the release of this type of information and therefore we assume no such regulation exists. Given that assumption, we conclude the department must generally withhold case number 12-0534945 under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 261.201 of the Family Code. *See* Open Records Decision No. 440 at 2 (1986) (predecessor statute). Records subject to section 261.201 may be disclosed only under applicable state law and for purposes consistent with the Family Code. *See* Fam. Code § 261.201(a).

We note, however, the requestor provided signed consent for release of information from the child victim listed in case number 2012-0534939, and the child victim is now at least 18 years of age. Thus, pursuant to section 261.201(k), case number 12-0534939 may not be withheld from this requestor under section 552.101 of the Government Code on the basis of section 261.201(a). *See id.* § 261.201(k). However, section 261.201(l)(1) states any personally identifiable information about a victim or witness who is under 18 years of age and is not the child of the parent, managing conservator, or other legal representative requesting the information shall be withheld from disclosure. *Id.* § 261.201(l)(1). Accordingly, we find the department must withhold the personally identifiable information about victims or witnesses who are under 18 years of age within case number 2012-0534939, which we marked, under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 261.201(l)(1) of the Family Code. Further, section 261.201(l)(3) states the identity of the reporting party shall be withheld from disclosure. *Id.* § 261.201(l)(3). Accordingly, we find the department must withhold the identifying information of the reporting party within case number 2012-0534939, which we marked, under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 261.201(l)(3) of the Family Code. Moreover, section 261.201(l)(2) states any information that is excepted from required disclosure under the Act or other law must still be withheld from disclosure. *Id.* § 261.201(l)(2). Accordingly, we will consider additional exceptions to disclosure of case number 2012-0534939.

However, we note the requestor is a representative of the San Juan County, New Mexico, Sheriff's Office (the "sheriff's office") and may have a right of access to some of the information pursuant to chapter 411 of the Government Code. With respect to case number 12-0534945, we find chapter 411 is applicable state law for the purposes of section 261.201. Section 411.089(a) of the Government Code provides a criminal justice agency is entitled to obtain from the Texas Department of Public Safety ("DPS") any criminal history record information ("CHRI") maintained by the DPS about a person. *See* Gov't Code § 411.089(a); *see also id.* § 411.083(b)(1) (DPS shall grant criminal justice agencies access to CHRI). In addition, section 411.087(a) of the Government Code provides, in part:

(a) [A] person, agency, department, political subdivision, or other entity that is authorized by this subchapter or subchapter E-1 to obtain from [DPS CHRI] maintained by [DPS] that relates to another person is authorized to:

...

(2) obtain from any other criminal justice agency in this state [CHRI] maintained by that criminal justice agency that relates to that person.

Id. § 411.087(a)(2). CHRI is defined as "information collected about a person by a criminal justice agency that consists of identifiable descriptions and notations of arrests, detentions, indictments, informations, and other formal criminal charges and their dispositions." *See id.* § 411.082(2). Thus, case number 12-0534945 contains CHRI of the named individual. However, a criminal justice agency that receives CHRI from another criminal justice agency pursuant to section 411.087(a)(2) may receive such information only for a criminal justice purpose. *See id.* §§ 411.083(c), .087(b); *see also* Open Records Decision Nos. 655 (1997) (discussing limitations on release of CHRI). Thus, to the extent the requestor represents a "criminal justice agency," the requestor is authorized to obtain CHRI from case number 12-0534945 pursuant to section 411.087(a)(2) of the Government Code, but only for a criminal justice purpose and for purposes consistent with the Family Code. *See* Gov't Code § 411.083(c), .087(a)(2); *see also* Fam. Code § 261.201(a).

Section 411.082 of the Government Code defines a "criminal justice agency" as including "a federal or state agency that is engaged in the administration of criminal justice under a statute or executive order and that allocates a substantial portion of its annual budget to the administration of criminal justice[.]" Gov't Code § 411.082(3)(A). We understand the sheriff's office is a criminal justice agency as defined by section 411.082 and the information at issue will be used for criminal justice purposes. However, we are unable to determine whether the requestor intends to use the information related to case number 12-0534945 for purposes consistent with the Family Code. Consequently, if the department determines the requestor intends to use the CHRI in case number 12-0534945 for purposes consistent with the Family Code, then the department must release CHRI from case number 12-0534945 and must withhold the remaining information in that report under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 261.201(a) of the Family Code. However, if the department determines the requestor does not intend to use the CHRI for purposes consistent with the Family Code, then the department must withhold

case number 12-0534945 in its entirety pursuant to section 552.101 in conjunction with section 261.201(a). *See* Fam. Code § 261.201(b)-(g), (k) (listing entities authorized to receive section 261.201 information); Open Records Decision Nos. 655, 440 at 2 (1986) (construing predecessor statute).

Section 552.101 of the Government Code also encompasses the doctrine of common-law privacy, which protects information that is (1) highly intimate or embarrassing, the publication of which would be highly objectionable to a reasonable person, and (2) not of legitimate concern to the public. *Indus. Found. v. Tex. Indus. Accident Bd.*, 540 S.W.2d 668, 685 (Tex. 1976). To demonstrate the applicability of common-law privacy, both prongs of this test must be satisfied. *Id.* at 681-82. Types of information considered intimate and embarrassing by the Texas Supreme Court are delineated in *Industrial Foundation*. *Id.* at 683. The Third Court of Appeals has concluded public citizens' dates of birth are protected by common-law privacy pursuant to section 552.101. *See Paxton v. City of Dallas*, No. 03-13-00546-CV, 2015 WL 3394061, at *3 (Tex. App.—Austin May 22, 2015, pet. denied) (mem. op.). Upon review, we find portions of case number 2012-0534939, which we marked, satisfy the standard articulated by the Texas Supreme Court in *Industrial Foundation*. Therefore, the department must withhold the information we marked within case number 2012-0534939 under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy. However, we find the department has not demonstrated any of the remaining information at issue is highly intimate or embarrassing and not of legitimate public concern. Thus, the department may not withhold any portion of the remaining information under section 552.101 in conjunction with common-law privacy.

We note some of the remaining information is subject to section 552.130 of the Government Code.¹ Section 552.130 provides information relating to a motor vehicle operator's license, driver's license, motor vehicle title or registration, or personal identification document issued by an agency of this state or another state or country is excepted from public release. *See* Gov't Code § 552.130. Accordingly, the department must withhold the motor vehicle record information we marked within case number 2012-0534939 under section 552.130 of the Government Code.

In summary, the department must generally withhold case number 12-0534945 under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 261.201 of the Family Code; however, if the department determines the requestor intends to use the CHRI in case number 12-0534945 for purposes consistent with the Family Code, then the department must release CHRI from case number 12-0534945 to this requestor. The department must withhold the information we marked within case number 2012-0534939 under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 261.201(1)(1) of the Family Code, section 261.201(1)(3) of the Family Code, and common-law privacy. The department must withhold the motor vehicle record information we marked within case

¹ The Office of the Attorney General will raise a mandatory exception on behalf of a governmental body, but ordinarily will not raise other exceptions. *See* Open Records Decision Nos. 481 (1987), 480 (1987), 470 (1987).

number 2012-0534939 under section 552.130 of the Government Code. The department must release the remaining information to this requestor.²

This letter ruling is limited to the particular information at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other information or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For more information concerning those rights and responsibilities, please visit our website at <https://www.texasattorneygeneral.gov/open-government/members-public/what-expect-after-ruling-issued> or call the OAG's Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. Questions concerning the allowable charges for providing public information under the Public Information Act may be directed to the Cost Rules Administrator of the OAG, toll free, at (888) 672-6787.

Sincerely,

Claire V. Morris Sloan
Assistant Attorney General
Open Records Division

CVMS/mo

Ref: ID# 839150

Enc. Submitted documents

c: Requestor
(w/o enclosures)

² The information being released contains social security numbers. Section 552.147(b) of the Government Code authorizes a governmental body to redact a living person's social security number from public release without the necessity of requesting a decision from this office. *See* Gov't Code § 552.147(b). We note the requestor has a right of access to the information being released. Thus, if the department receives another request for the same information from a different requestor, the department must again seek a decision from this office.