



KEN PAXTON
ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS

July 28, 2020

Mr. Robert L. Drinkard
Counsel for the City of Harlingen
Denton, Navarro, Rocha, Bernal & Zech, P.C.
701 East Harrison, Suite 100
Harlingen, Texas 78550-9165

OR2020-18826

Dear Mr. Drinkard:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 836729.

The City of Harlingen (the "city"), which you represent, received two requests for several categories of information pertaining to the city's 9-1-1 ambulance service provider for a specified period of time.¹ You state you have released some information. You claim the submitted information is excepted from disclosure under sections 552.101, 552.108, and 552.148 of the Government Code. We have considered the exceptions you claim and reviewed the submitted information.²

Section 552.101 of the Government Code excepts "information considered to be confidential by law, either constitutional, statutory, or by judicial decision." Gov't Code § 552.101. Section 552.101 encompasses the doctrine of common-law privacy, which protects information that is (1) highly intimate or embarrassing, the publication of which

¹ We note the city received clarification of the information requested. *See* Gov't Code § 552.222 (providing if request for information is unclear, governmental body may ask requestor to clarify request); *see also City of Dallas v. Abbott*, 304 S.W.3d 380, 387 (Tex. 2010) (holding that when a governmental entity, acting in good faith, requests clarification or narrowing of an unclear or overbroad request for information, the ten-day period to request an attorney general ruling is measured from the date the request is clarified or narrowed).

² We assume the "representative sample" of records submitted to this office is truly representative of the requested records as a whole. *See* Open Records Decision Nos. 499 (1988), 497 (1988). This open records letter does not reach, and therefore does not authorize the withholding of, any other requested records to the extent those records contain substantially different types of information than that submitted to this office.

would be highly objectionable to a reasonable person, and (2) not of legitimate concern to the public. *Indus. Found. v. Tex. Indus. Accident Bd.*, 540 S.W.2d 668, 685 (Tex. 1976). To demonstrate the applicability of common-law privacy, both prongs of this test must be satisfied. *Id.* at 681-82. Types of information considered intimate and embarrassing by the Texas Supreme Court are delineated in *Industrial Foundation. Id.* at 683. Upon review, we find the city has failed to demonstrate the submitted information is highly intimate or embarrassing and of no legitimate public interest. Thus, the city may not withhold the submitted information under section 552.101 in conjunction with common-law privacy.

Section 552.108(a) of the Government Code excepts from disclosure “[information held by a law enforcement agency or prosecutor that deals with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime... if: (1) release of the information would interfere with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime[.]” Gov’t Code § 552.108(a)(1). A governmental body claiming section 552.108(a)(1) must explain how and why the release of the information at issue would interfere with law enforcement. *See id.* §§ 552.108(a)(1), .301(e)(1)(A); *see also Ex parte Pruitt*, 551 S.W.2d 706, 710 (Tex. 1977). Upon review, we find the city has failed to establish section 552.108(a)(1) is applicable to the submitted information. Therefore, the city may not withhold any of the submitted information on that ground.

Section 552.148 of the Government Code provides the following:

- (a) In this section, “minor” means a person younger than 18 years of age.
- (b) The following information maintained by a municipality for purposes related to the participation by a minor in a recreational program or activity is excepted from [required disclosure]:
 - (1) the name, age, home address, home telephone number, or social security number of the minor;
 - (2) a photograph of the minor; and
 - (3) the name of the minor’s parent or legal guardian.

Gov’t Code § 552.148. Section 552.148 specifically applies to information maintained by a municipality “for purposes related to the participation by a minor in a recreational program or activity[.]” *Id.* § 552.148(b). Because the information at issue is not related to participation in a recreational program or activity, section 552.148 of the Government Code does not apply, and the city may not withhold any of the submitted information on that basis. The city must release the submitted information.

This letter ruling is limited to the particular information at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other information or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For more information concerning those rights and responsibilities, please visit our website at <https://www.texasattorneygeneral.gov/open-government/members-public/what-expect-after-ruling-issued> or call the OAG's Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. Questions concerning the allowable charges for providing public information under the Public Information Act may be directed to the Cost Rules Administrator of the OAG, toll free, at (888) 672-6787.

Sincerely,

Paige Lay
Assistant Attorney General
Open Records Division

PL/gw

Ref: ID# 836729

Enc. Submitted documents

c: Requestor
(w/o enclosures)