



KEN PAXTON
ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS

July 23, 2020

Ms. Cecilia Gamez
Crime Records Office
McAllen Police Department
P.O. Box 220
McAllen, Texas 78501

OR2020-18360

Dear Ms. Gamez:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 838693 (ORR# 59523).

The McAllen Police Department (the "department") received a request for information pertaining to a specified address. The department claims the submitted information is excepted from disclosure under sections 552.101 and 552.108 of the Government Code. We have considered the claimed exceptions and reviewed the submitted information.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code excepts from disclosure "information considered to be confidential by law, either constitutional, statutory, or by judicial decision." Gov't Code § 552.101. Section 552.101 encompasses section 58.008 of the Family Code, which provides, in part, the following:

(b) Except as provided by Subsection (c), law enforcement records concerning a child and information concerning a child that are stored by electronic means or otherwise and from which a record could be generated may not be disclosed to the public and shall be:

(1) if maintained on paper or microfilm, kept separate from adult records;

(2) if maintained electronically in the same computer system as adult records, accessible only under controls that are separate and distinct from the controls to access electronic data concerning adults; and

(3) maintained on a local basis only and not sent to a central state or federal depository, except as provided by Subsection (c) or Subchapter B, D, or E.

...

(d) Law enforcement records concerning a child may be inspected or copied by:

(1) a juvenile justice agency, as defined by Section 58.101;

(2) a criminal justice agency, as defined by Section 411.082, Government Code;

(3) the child; or

(4) the child's parent or guardian.

(e) Before a child or a child's parent or guardian may inspect or copy a record concerning the child under Subsection (d), the custodian of the record shall redact:

(1) any personally identifiable information about a juvenile suspect, offender, victim, or witness who is not the child; and

(2) any information that is excepted from required disclosure under [the Act], or any other law.

Fam. Code § 58.008(b), (d), (e); *see also id.* § 51.03(a)-(b) (defining “delinquent conduct” and “conduct indicating a need for supervision” for purposes of title 3 of Family Code). Section 58.008(b) is applicable to records of juvenile conduct that occurred before, on, or after September 1, 2017. The juvenile must have been at least 10 years old and less than 17 years of age when the conduct occurred. *See id.* § 51.02(2) (defining “child” for purposes of title 3 of Family Code). We find the submitted information involves a juvenile offender, so as to fall within the scope of section 58.008(b). However, the requestor is a parent of the juvenile offender at issue and has access to the information pursuant to section 58.008(d). *See id.* § 58.008(d). Therefore, the department may not withhold the submitted information from the requestor under section 552.101 on the basis of section 58.008(b). *See id.* § 58.008(d). Nevertheless, the department must withhold the personally identifiable information concerning the juvenile victim at issue in the submitted information under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 58.008(e)(1) of the Family Code. *Id.* § 58.008(e)(1). In addition, section 58.008(e)(2) provides information that is subject to any other exception to disclosure under the Act or other law must be redacted. *See id.* § 58.008(e)(2). Thus, we will consider whether the remaining information is otherwise excepted from disclosure.

Section 552.108 of the Government Code provides, in part, the following:

(a) Information held by a law enforcement agency or prosecutor that deals with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime is excepted from the requirements of Section 552.021 if:

- (1) release of the information would interfere with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime;
- (2) it is information that deals with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime only in relation to an investigation that did not result in conviction or deferred adjudication;

Gov't Code §552.108(a)(1)-(2). A governmental body claiming subsection 552.108(a)(1) must explain how and why the release of the information at issue would interfere with law enforcement, and a governmental body claiming subsection 552.108(a)(2) must demonstrate the information at issue relates to a criminal investigation that has concluded in a final result other than conviction or deferred adjudication. *See id.* §§ 552.108(a)(1)-(2), .301(e)(1)(A); *see also Ex parte Pruitt*, 551 S.W.2d 706, 710 (Tex. 1977). *See id.* §§ 552.108(a)(2), .301(e)(1)(A). Upon review, we find the department has failed to establish subsection 552.108(a)(1) or 552.108(a)(2) is applicable to the remaining information. Therefore, the department may not withhold any of the remaining information on either of those grounds.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code also encompasses the doctrine of common-law privacy, which protects information that is (1) highly intimate or embarrassing, the publication of which would be highly objectionable to a reasonable person, and (2) not of legitimate concern to the public. *Indus. Found. v. Tex. Indus. Accident Bd.*, 540 S.W.2d 668, 685 (Tex. 1976). To demonstrate the applicability of common-law privacy, both prongs of this test must be satisfied. *Id.* at 681-82. Types of information considered intimate and embarrassing by the Texas Supreme Court are delineated in the *Industrial Foundation* decision. *Id.* at 683. The Third Court of Appeals has concluded public citizens' dates of birth are protected by common-law privacy pursuant to section 552.101. *See Paxton v. City of Dallas*, No. 03-13-00546-CV, 2015 WL 3394061, at *3 (Tex. App.—Austin May 22, 2015, pet. denied) (mem. op.). The department must withhold the date of birth of the adult victim at issue in the submitted information under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy.

In summary, the department must withhold the personally identifiable information concerning the juvenile victim at issue in the submitted information under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 58.008(e)(1) of the Family Code. The department must also withhold the date of birth of the adult victim at issue in the submitted information under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy. The department must release the remaining information.¹

¹ Because the requestor has a special right of access to the information being released, the department must again seek a decision from this office if it receives another request for the same information from another requestor.

This letter ruling is limited to the particular information at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other information or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For more information concerning those rights and responsibilities, please visit our website at <https://www.texasattorneygeneral.gov/open-government/members-public/what-expect-after-ruling-issued> or call the OAG's Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. Questions concerning the allowable charges for providing public information under the Public Information Act may be directed to the Cost Rules Administrator of the OAG, toll free, at (888) 672-6787.

Sincerely,

James L. Coggeshall
Assistant Attorney General
Open Records Division

JLC/jlbm

Ref: ID# 838693

Enc. Submitted documents

c: Requestor
(w/o enclosures)