



KEN PAXTON
ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS

July 15, 2020

Ms. Krystal Temple
Records Division
Hood County Sheriff's Office
400 Deputy Larry Miller Drive
Granbury, Texas 76048

OR2020-17614

Dear Ms. Temple:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 835993.

The Hood County Sheriff's Office (the "sheriff's office") received a request for information pertaining to a specified incident. You state you have released some information to the requestor. You claim the submitted information is excepted from disclosure under section 552.101 and 552.108 of the Government Code. We have considered the exceptions you claim and reviewed the submitted information.

Initially, we note the submitted information includes police officers' body worn camera recordings. Body worn cameras are subject to chapter 1701 of the Occupations Code. Chapter 1701 provides the procedures a requestor must follow when seeking a body worn camera recording. Section 1701.661(a) provides:

A member of the public is required to provide the following information when submitting a written request to a law enforcement agency for information recorded by a body worn camera:

- (1) the date and approximate time of the recording;
- (2) the specific location where the recording occurred; and

(3) the name of one or more persons known to be a subject of the recording.

Occ. Code § 1701.661(a). In this instance, the requestor does not give the requisite information under section 1701.661(a). As the requestor did not properly request the body worn camera recordings at issue pursuant to chapter 1701, our ruling does not reach this information and it need not be released.¹ However, pursuant to section 1701.661(b), a “failure to provide all the information required by Subsection (a) to be part of a request for recorded information does not preclude the requestor from making a future request for the same recorded information.” *Id.* § 1701.661(b).

Section 552.108(a)(2) of the Government Code excepts from disclosure information concerning an investigation that concluded in a result other than conviction or deferred adjudication. Gov’t Code § 552.108(a)(2). A governmental body claiming section 552.108(a)(2) must demonstrate that the requested information relates to a criminal investigation that concluded in a final result other than a conviction or deferred adjudication. You state the submitted information relates to a criminal case that did not result in a conviction or deferred adjudication. However, you also inform us the submitted information relate to a pending criminal trial. Based on your conflicting representations and our review of the submitted documents, we are unable to determine that the case at issue concluded in a final result other than conviction or deferred adjudication. Therefore, we find that you have failed to demonstrate the applicability of section 552.108(a)(2) to the submitted information, and it may not be withheld on this basis.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code excepts “information considered to be confidential by law, either constitutional, statutory, or by judicial decision.” *Id.* § 552.101. Section 552.101 encompasses information made confidential by other statutes, such as chapter 772 of the Health and Safety Code, which authorizes the development of local emergency communication districts. Section 772.318 of the Health and Safety Code applies to an emergency communication district for a county with a population of more than 20,000 and makes confidential the originating telephone numbers and addresses of 9-1-1 callers that are furnished by a 9-1-1 service supplier. *See* Open Records Decision No. 649 (1996). You seek to withhold the remaining information under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 772.318 of the Health and Safety Code. We understand you to assert Hood County is part of an emergency communication district that is subject to section 772.318 of the Health and Safety Code. Upon review, we find the sheriff’s office must withhold the telephone number and address we have marked under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 772.318 of the Health and Safety Code if the information consists of the originating telephone number and address of a 9-1-1 caller furnished by a 9-1-1 service supplier. If the information at issue does not consist of the originating telephone number or address of a 9-1-1 caller provided by a 9-1-1 service supplier, then it may not be withheld under section 552.101 in conjunction with

¹ As we are able to make this determination, we need not address your arguments against disclosure of this information.

section 772.318. In either event, we find the sheriff's office has failed to demonstrate the remaining information consists of the originating telephone number or address of a 9-1-1 caller that was furnished by a 9-1-1 service supplier. Accordingly, the sheriff's office may not withhold any of the remaining information under section 552.101 in conjunction with section 772.318 of the Health and Safety Code.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code also encompasses the doctrine of common-law privacy. *Indus. Found. v. Tex. Indus. Accident Bd.*, 540 S.W.2d 668, 685 (Tex. 1976). Under the common-law right of privacy, an individual has a right to be free from the publicizing of private affairs in which the public has no legitimate concern. *Id.* at 682. The court of appeals has concluded public citizens' dates of birth are protected by common-law privacy pursuant to section 552.101. *Paxton v. City of Dallas*, No. 03-13-00546-CV, 2015 WL 3394061, at *3 (Tex. App.—Austin May 22, 2015, pet. denied) (mem. op.). We note the requestor has a right of access to his own date of birth. *See* Gov't Code § 552.023(a) ("person or a person's authorized representative has special right of access, beyond right of general public, to information held by governmental body that relates to person and that is protected from public disclosure by laws intended to protect that person's privacy interests"); Open Records Decision No. 481 at 4 (1987) (privacy theories not implicated when individual requests information concerning herself). Thus, with the exception of the requestor's date of birth, the sheriff's office must withhold all public citizens' dates of birth under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy. However, we find no portion of the remaining information is highly intimate or embarrassing and of no legitimate public concern, and the sheriff's office may not withhold any of the remaining information under section 552.101 of the Government Code on the basis of common-law privacy.

You assert a portion of the remaining information should be withheld under article 2.1396 of the Code of Criminal Procedure. Article 2.1396 of the Code of Criminal Procedure provides,

A person stopped or arrested on suspicion of an offense under Section 49.04, 49.045, 49.07, or 49.08, Penal Code, is entitled to receive from a law enforcement agency employing the peace officer who made the stop or arrest a copy of any video made by or at the direction of the officer that contains footage of:

- (1) the stop;
 - (2) the arrest;
 - (3) the conduct of the person stopped during any interaction with the officer, including during the administration of a field sobriety test;
- or

(4) a procedure in which a specimen of the person's breath or blood is taken.

Crim Proc. Code art 2.1396. We note, therefore, article 2.1396 governs a right of access to certain video recordings. *See id.* Article 2.1396 does not expressly make information confidential for purposes of the Act. *See* Open Records Decision Nos. 658 at 4 (1998) (statutory confidentiality under section 552.101 must be express, and confidentiality requirement will not be implied from statutory structure), 478 at 2 (1978) (statutory confidentiality requires express language making certain information confidential or stating that information shall not be released to public); *see also* Open Records Decision No. 575 at 2 (1990) (explicitly stating discovery privileges are not covered by statutory predecessor to section 552.101). Therefore, we conclude the sheriff's office may not withhold any of the remaining information under article 2.1396 of the Code of Criminal Procedure.

Section 552.130 of the Government Code provides information relating to a motor vehicle operator's license, driver's license, motor vehicle title or registration, or personal identification document issued by an agency of this state or another state or country is excepted from public release.² *See* Gov't Code § 552.130. Accordingly, the sheriff's office must withhold the motor vehicle record information we have marked and indicated under section 552.130 of the Government Code.

In summary, as the requestor did not properly request the body worn camera recordings at issue pursuant to chapter 1701 of the Occupations Code, our ruling does not reach this information and it need not be released. The sheriff's office must withhold the telephone number and address we have marked under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 772.318 of the Health and Safety Code if the information consists of the originating telephone number and address of a 9-1-1 caller furnished by a 9-1-1 service supplier. With the exception of the requestor's date of birth, the sheriff's office must withhold all public citizens' dates of birth under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy. The sheriff's office must withhold the motor vehicle record information we have marked and indicated under section 552.130 of the Government Code. The sheriff's office must release the remaining information.

This letter ruling is limited to the particular information at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other information or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For more information concerning those rights and responsibilities, please visit our website at <https://www.texasattorneygeneral.gov/open-government/members-public/what-expect-after-ruling-issued> or call the OAG's Open

² The Office of the Attorney General will raise a mandatory exception on behalf of a governmental body, but ordinarily will not raise other exceptions. *See* Open Records Decision Nos. 481 (1987), 480 (1987), 470 (1987).

Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. Questions concerning the allowable charges for providing public information under the Public Information Act may be directed to the Cost Rules Administrator of the OAG, toll free, at (888) 672-6787.

Sincerely,

Meredith L. Coffman
Assistant Attorney General
Open Records Division

MLC/mo

Ref: ID# 835993

Enc. Submitted documents

c: Requestor
(w/o enclosures)