



KEN PAXTON
ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS

July 15, 2020

Ms. Guadalupe Garcia
Administrative Sergeant
Pharr Police Department
1900 South Cage Boulevard
Pharr, Texas 78577

OR2020-17613

Dear Ms. Garcia:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 835702 (Ref. No. P001197-050420).

The City of Pharr (the "city") received a request for all reports involving the requestor and another named individual.¹ You state you have released some information to the requestor. You claim the submitted information is excepted from disclosure under section 552.108 of the Government Code. We have considered the exception you claim and reviewed the submitted information.

Initially, we must address the city's obligations under section 552.301 of the Government Code, which prescribes the procedures a governmental body must follow in asking this office to decide whether requested information is excepted from public disclosure. *See* Gov't Code § 552.301. Pursuant to section 552.301(e), a governmental body must submit to this office within fifteen business days of receiving an open records request (1) written comments stating the reasons why the stated exceptions apply that would allow the information to be withheld, (2) a copy of the written request for information, (3) a signed statement or sufficient evidence showing the date the governmental body received the written request, and (4) a copy of the specific information requested or representative samples, labeled to indicate which exceptions apply to which parts of the documents. *See id.* § 552.301(e). You state the city received the instant request for information on May 4, 2020. However, as of the date of this ruling, you have not provided to this office a copy of

¹ As you have not submitted a copy of the written request for information, we take our description of the request from your brief.

the written request for information. Accordingly, we conclude the city failed to comply with the procedural requirements mandated by section 552.301 of the Government Code with respect to the submitted information.

Pursuant to section 552.302 of the Government Code, a governmental body's failure to comply with the procedural requirements of section 552.301 results in the legal presumption the requested information is public and must be released unless there is a compelling reason to withhold the information from disclosure. *See id.* § 552.302; *Simmons v. Kuzmich*, 166 S.W.3d 342 (Tex. App.—Fort Worth 2005, no pet.); *Hancock v. State Bd. of Ins.*, 797 S.W.2d 379, 381-82 (Tex. App.—Austin 1990, no writ). Although you claim section 552.108 of the Government Code for the submitted information, we find you have failed to establish a compelling reason to address this exception. However, because sections 552.101 and 552.130 of the Government Code can provide compelling reasons to overcome the presumption of openness, we will address the applicability of these exceptions to the submitted information.²

Section 552.101 of the Government Code excepts from public disclosure “information considered to be confidential by law, either constitutional, statutory, or by judicial decision.” Gov't Code § 552.101. This section encompasses the doctrine of common-law privacy. *Indus. Found. v. Tex. Indus. Accident Bd.*, 540 S.W.2d 668, 685 (Tex. 1976). Under the common-law right of privacy, an individual has a right to be free from the publicizing of private affairs in which the public has no legitimate concern. *Id.* at 682. The court of appeals has concluded public citizens' dates of birth are protected by common-law privacy pursuant to section 552.101. *See Paxton v. City of Dallas*, No. 03-13-00546-CV, 2015 WL 3394061, at *3 (Tex. App.—Austin May 22, 2015, pet. denied) (mem. op.). However, we note the requestor has a right of access to his own date of birth and the dates of birth of his minor children, and this information may not be withheld from him under common-law privacy. *See* Gov't Code § 552.023(a) (person or person's authorized representative has special right of access to records that contain information relating to the person that are protected from public disclosure by laws intended to protect that person's privacy interests); ORD 481 at 4 (privacy theories not implicated when individuals request information concerning themselves). Accordingly, with the exception of the dates of birth belonging to the requestor and his minor children, the city must withhold the public citizens' dates of birth under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy.

Section 552.130 excepts from public disclosure information relating to a motor vehicle operator's or driver's license, motor vehicle title or registration, or personal identification document issued by an agency of this state or another state or country. *See* Gov't Code § 552.130. We note, because section 552.130 protects privacy interests, the requestor has a right of access to his own motor vehicle record information pursuant to section 552.023 of the Government Code. *See id.* § 552.023(a); ORD 481 at 4. Accordingly, the city must withhold the information we have marked under section 552.130 of the Government Code.

² The Office of the Attorney General will raise mandatory exceptions on behalf of a governmental body but ordinarily will not raise other exceptions. *See* Open Records Decision Nos. 481 (1987), 480 (1987), 470 (1987).

In summary, the city must: (1) withhold the public citizens' dates of birth, with the exception of the dates of birth belonging to the requestor and his minor children, under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy; (2) withhold the information we have marked under section 552.130 of the Government Code; and (3) release the remaining information to this requestor.³

This letter ruling is limited to the particular information at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other information or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For more information concerning those rights and responsibilities, please visit our website at <https://www.texasattorneygeneral.gov/open-government/members-public/what-expect-after-ruling-issued> or call the OAG's Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. Questions concerning the allowable charges for providing public information under the Public Information Act may be directed to the Cost Rules Administrator of the OAG, toll free, at (888) 672-6787.

Sincerely,

Tim Neal
Assistant Attorney General
Open Records Division

TN/mo

Ref: ID# 835702

Enc. Submitted documents

c: Requestor
(w/o enclosures)

³ We note the information being released contains information to which the requestor has a right of access under section 552.023 of the Government Code. See Gov't Code § 552.023(a); ORD 481 at 4. Thus, if the city receives another request for this same information from a different requestor, it must again seek a ruling from this office.