



KEN PAXTON
ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS

July 10, 2020

Ms. Charla Thomas
Assistant City Attorney
City of Temple
2 North Main Street, Suite 308
Temple, Texas 76501

OR2020-17256

Dear Ms. Thomas:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 838284.

The City of Temple (the "city") received a request for information pertaining to a specified incident. You claim the submitted information is excepted from disclosure under section 552.101 of the Government Code. We have considered the exception you claim and reviewed the submitted information.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code excepts from disclosure "information considered to be confidential by law, either constitutional, statutory, or by judicial decision." Gov't Code § 552.101. Section 552.101 encompasses the doctrine of common-law privacy, which protects information that is (1) highly intimate or embarrassing, the publication of which would be highly objectionable to a reasonable person, and (2) not of legitimate concern to the public. *Indus. Found., v. Tex. Indus. Accident Bd.*, 540 S.W.2d 668, 685 (Tex. 1976). To demonstrate the applicability of common-law privacy, both prongs of this test must be satisfied. *Id.* at 681-82. The types of information considered intimate and embarrassing by the Texas Supreme Court are delineated in *Industrial Foundation*. *Id.* at 683. In Open Records Decision No. 393 (1983), this office concluded information that either identifies or tends to identify a victim of sexual assault or other sex-related offense must be withheld under common-law privacy. ORD 393 at 2; *see* Open Records Decision No. 339 (1982); *see also Morales v. Ellen*, 840 S.W.2d at 519 (Tex. App.—El Paso 1992, writ denied) (identity of witnesses to and victims of sexual harassment was highly intimate or embarrassing information and public did not have a legitimate interest in such information). Further, where the requestor knows the identity of the victim, the entire report must be withheld to protect the victim's privacy. In this instance, the requestor knows the identity

of the victim. However, the requestor may have a right of access to private information pertaining to the victim pursuant to section 552.023 of the Government Code. *See* Gov't Code § 552.023(a); Open Records Decision No. 481 at 4 (1987) (privacy theories not implicated when individuals request information concerning themselves). Accordingly, to the extent the requestor does not have a section 552.023 right of access, the city must withhold the submitted information in its entirety under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy. To the extent the requestor does have a section 552.023 right of access, the submitted information may not be withheld under section 552.101 in conjunction with common law privacy. In this instance, we will determine whether the submitted information is excepted from disclosure.

Additionally, the court of appeals has concluded public citizens' dates of birth are protected by common-law privacy pursuant to section 552.101. *See Paxton v. City of Dallas*, No. 03-13-00546-CV, 2015 WL 3394061, at *3 (Tex. App.—Austin May 22, 2015, pet. denied) (mem. op.). Upon review, we find the information we marked satisfies the standard articulated by the Texas Supreme Court in *Industrial Foundation*. Thus, the city must withhold the date of birth we marked under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy. However, we find you have failed to demonstrate the remaining information is highly intimate or embarrassing and not of legitimate public concern. Thus, the city may not withhold the remaining information under section 552.101 on the basis of common-law privacy.

We note some of the remaining information is subject to section 552.130 of the Government Code.¹ Section 552.130 provides information relating to a motor vehicle operator's license, driver's license, motor vehicle title or registration, or personal identification document issued by an agency of this state or another state or country is excepted from public release. *See* Gov't Code § 552.130. Accordingly, the city must withhold the motor vehicle record information we have marked under section 552.130 of the Government Code.

In summary, to the extent the requestor does not have a section 552.023 right of access, the city must withhold the submitted information in its entirety under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy. To the extent the requestor does have a section 552.023 right of access, the city must (1) withhold the date of birth we marked under section 552.101 in conjunction with common-law privacy; (2) withhold the motor vehicle record information we marked under section 552.130; (3) release the remaining information.²

¹ The Office of the Attorney General will raise a mandatory exception on behalf of a governmental body, but ordinarily will not raise other exceptions. *See* Open Records Decision Nos. 481 (1987), 480 (1987), 470 (1987).

² We note the information being released includes a social security number. Section 552.147(b) of the Government Code authorizes a governmental body to redact a living person's social security number from public release without the necessity of requesting a decision from this office under the Act. Gov't Code § 552.147(b). Additionally, we note the requestor has a right of access to some of the information being released under section 552.023 of the Government Code. *See id.* § 552.023; ORD 481 at 4. Accordingly, if the city receives another request for this same information from a different requestor, the city must again seek a ruling from this office.

This letter ruling is limited to the particular information at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other information or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For more information concerning those rights and responsibilities, please visit our website at <https://www.texasattorneygeneral.gov/open-government/members-public/what-expect-after-ruling-issued> or call the OAG's Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. Questions concerning the allowable charges for providing public information under the Public Information Act may be directed to the Cost Rules Administrator of the OAG, toll free, at (888) 672-6787.

Sincerely,

Melanie Villars
Assistant Attorney General
Open Records Division

MJV/gw

Ref: ID# 838284

Enc. Submitted documents

c: Requestor
(w/o enclosures)