



KEN PAXTON
ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS

July 10, 2020

Mr. Ronny H. Wall
Senior Associate General Counsel
Texas Tech University System
P.O. Box 45031
Lubbock, Texas 79409-5031

OR2020-17139

Dear Mr. Wall:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 834578.

Texas Tech University (the "university") received a request for the current contract and all submitted proposals pertaining to a specified request for proposals. Although you take no position as to whether the submitted information is excepted under the Act, you state release of this information may implicate the proprietary interests of Centerplate; ClubCorp USA, Inc. ("ClubCorp"); and Ovations Food Services, LP. Accordingly, you state, and provide documentation showing, you notified these third parties of the request for information and of their right to submit arguments to this office as to why the information at issue should not be released. *See* Gov't Code § 552.305(d); *see also* Open Records Decision No. 542 (1990) (statutory predecessor to section 552.305 permits governmental body to rely on interested third party to raise and explain applicability of exception in the Act in certain circumstances). We have considered the submitted arguments and reviewed the submitted information.

Initially, we note that you have not submitted the requested contract. To the extent any additional responsive information existed on the date the university received this request, we assume you have released it. If you have not released any such records, you must do so at this time. *See* Gov't Code §§ 552.301(a), .302; *see also* Open Records Decision No. 664 (2000) (if governmental body concludes that no exceptions apply to requested information, it must release information as soon as possible).

Next, we note an interested third party is allowed ten business days after the date of its receipt of the governmental body's notice under section 552.305(d) of the Government

Code to submit its reasons, if any, as to why information relating to that party should be withheld from public disclosure. *See* Gov't Code § 552.305(d)(2)(B). As of the date of this letter, we have not received comments from any of the remaining third parties explaining why the submitted information should not be released. Therefore, we have no basis to conclude those third parties have protected proprietary interests in the submitted information. *See, e.g., id.* § 552.110 (requiring the provision of specific factual evidence demonstrating the applicability of the exception). Accordingly, the university may not withhold any portion of the submitted information related to those remaining third parties on the basis of any proprietary interest they may have in the information.

Section 552.110(b) of the Government Code states, “[e]xcept as provided by [s]ection 552.0222, information is [excepted from required disclosure] if it is demonstrated based on specific factual evidence that the information is a trade secret.” *See id.* § 552.110(b). Section 552.110(a) defines a trade secret as all forms and types of information if:

(1) the owner of the trade secret has taken reasonable measures under the circumstances to keep the information secret; and

(2) the information derives independent economic value, actual or potential, from not being generally known to, and not being readily ascertainable through proper means by, another person who can obtain economic value from the disclosure or use of the information.

Id. § 552.110(a). Additionally, we note section 552.0222(b) lists certain types of information to which section 552.110 does not apply. *See id.* § 552.0222(b). ClubCorp argues some of its information consists of trade secrets subject to section 552.110(b). Upon review, however, we find some of the information at issue is subject to section 552.0222(b) and may not be withheld on the basis of section 552.110(b). Additionally, we find ClubCorp has failed to provide specific factual evidence demonstrating any portion of the rest of the information at issue is a trade secret. Therefore, the university may not withhold any of the information at issue under section 552.110(b) of the Government Code.

Section 552.110(c) of the Government Code states:

(c) Except as provided by Section 552.0222, commercial or financial information for which it is demonstrated based on specific factual evidence that disclosure would cause substantial competitive harm to the person from whom the information was obtained is [excepted from required disclosure].

Id. § 552.110(c). Additionally, we note section 552.0222(b) lists certain types of information to which section 552.110 does not apply. *See id.* § 552.0222(b). ClubCorp argues some of its information consists of commercial or financial information subject to section 552.110(c). Upon review, however, we find some of the information at issue is subject to section 552.0222(b) and may not be withheld on the basis of section 552.110(c). Additionally, we find ClubCorp has failed to provide specific factual evidence demonstrating any portion of the rest of the information at issue constitutes commercial or

financial information, the release of which would result in substantial competitive harm. Therefore, the university may not withhold any of the information at issue under section 552.110(c) of the Government Code.

Section 552.1101 of the Government Code provides, in relevant part:

(a) Except as provided by Section 552.0222, information submitted to a governmental body by a vendor, contractor, potential vendor, or potential contractor in response to a request for a bid, proposal, or qualification is excepted from the requirements of Section 552.021 if the vendor, contractor, potential vendor, or potential contractor that the information relates to demonstrates based on specific factual evidence that disclosure of the information would:

(1) reveal an individual approach to:

(A) work;

(B) organizational structure;

(C) staffing;

(D) internal operations;

(E) processes; or

(F) discounts, pricing methodology, pricing per kilowatt hour, cost data, or other pricing information that will be used in future solicitation or bid documents; and

(2) give advantage to a competitor.

(b) The exception to disclosure provided by Subsection (a) does not apply to:

(1) information in a voucher or contract relating to the receipt or expenditure of public funds by a governmental body; or

(2) communications and other information sent between a governmental body and a vendor or contractor related to the performance of a final contract with the governmental body or work performed on behalf of the governmental body.

Id. § 552.1101(a), (b). Additionally, we note section 552.0222(b) lists certain types of information to which section 552.1101(a) does not apply. *See id.* § 552.0222(b). ClubCorp asserts disclosure of some of its information would reveal an individual approach to work, organizational structure, operations, processes, or pricing methodology, and give advantage

to a competitor. Upon review, however, we find some of the remaining information at issue is subject to section 552.0222(b) and may not be withheld on the basis of section 552.1101(a). *See id.* §§ 552.0222(b). Additionally, we find the ClubCorp has failed to provide specific factual evidence demonstrating any portion of the rest of the information at issue is subject to section 552.1101(a). Therefore, the university may not withhold any of the information at issue under section 552.1101(a) of the Government Code. The university must release the submitted information.

This letter ruling is limited to the particular information at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other information or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For more information concerning those rights and responsibilities, please visit our website at <https://www.texasattorneygeneral.gov/open-government/members-public/what-expect-after-ruling-issued> or call the OAG's Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. Questions concerning the allowable charges for providing public information under the Public Information Act may be directed to the Cost Rules Administrator of the OAG, toll free, at (888) 672-6787.

Sincerely,

Ashley Crutchfield
Assistant Attorney General
Open Records Division

AC/rm

Ref: ID# 834578

Enc. Submitted documents

c: Requestor

3 Third Parties