



KEN PAXTON
ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS

July 7, 2020

Mr. Michael Muscarello
Interim City Secretary
City of Webster
101 Pennsylvania Avenue
Webster, Texas 77598

OR2020-16980

Dear Mr. Muscarello:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 834755 (CH-87-2020).

The City of Webster (the "city") received a request for the civil drawings for a specified property.¹ You claim the submitted information is excepted from disclosure under section 552.101 of the Government Code. In addition, you state release of the submitted information may implicate the proprietary interests of Davis Stokes Collaborative P.C. Accordingly, you state, and provide documentation showing, the city notified the third party of the request for information and of its right to submit arguments to this office as to why the submitted information should not be released. *See* Gov't Code § 552.305(d); *see also* Open Records Decision No. 542 (1990) (statutory predecessor to section 552.305 permits governmental body to rely on interested third party to raise and explain applicability of exception in the Act in certain circumstances). We have considered the submitted argument and reviewed the submitted representative sample of information.²

¹ We note we asked the city to provide additional information pursuant to section 552.303 of the Government Code. *See* Gov't Code § 552.303(c)-(d) (if attorney general determines information in addition to that required by section 552.301 is necessary to render decision, written notice of that fact shall be given to governmental body and requestor, and governmental body shall submit necessary additional information to attorney general not later than seventh calendar day after date of receipt of notice). We have received and considered the information submitted by the city pursuant to that request.

² We assume the representative sample of records submitted to this office is truly representative of the requested records as a whole. *See* Open Records Decision Nos. 499 (1988), 497 (1988). This open records

Section 552.101 of the Government Code excepts from disclosure “information considered to be confidential by law, either constitutional, statutory, or by judicial decision.” Gov’t Code § 552.101. This section encompasses information protected by other statutes. Sections 418.176 through 418.182 were added to chapter 418 of the Government Code as part of the Texas Homeland Security Act (“HSA”). The city claims the submitted information is excepted from disclosure under section 418.181 of the Government Code. Section 418.181 provides “[t]hose documents or portions of documents in the possession of a governmental entity are confidential if they identify the technical details of particular vulnerabilities of critical infrastructure to an act of terrorism.” *Id.* § 418.181; *see also id.* § 421.001 (defining critical infrastructure to include “all public or private assets, systems, and functions vital to the security, governance, public health and safety, and functions vital to the state or the nation”). The fact that information may relate to a governmental body’s security concerns or emergency management activities does not make the information *per se* confidential under the HSA. *See* Open Records Decision No. 649 at 3 (1996) (language of confidentiality provision controls scope of its protection). Furthermore, the mere recitation by a governmental body of a statute’s key terms is not sufficient to demonstrate the applicability of a claimed provision. As with any exception to disclosure, a governmental body asserting one of the confidentiality provisions of the HSA must adequately explain how the responsive records fall within the scope of the claimed provision. *See* Gov’t Code § 552.301(e)(1)(A) (governmental body must explain how claimed exception to disclosure applies).

You state the submitted information consists of architectural and engineering plans related to a medical facility. Upon review, we agree the medical facility is a part of the city’s critical infrastructure. *See id.* § 421.001(2). You argue public disclosure of the information would reveal vulnerabilities of the medical facility. Thus, we understand the city to claim the information could be used to identify the technical details of particular vulnerabilities of the medical facility at issue to an act of terrorism. Based on these representations and our review, we agree the requested information identifies the technical details of particular vulnerabilities of critical infrastructure to an act of terrorism. Therefore, the city must withhold the submitted information under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 418.181 of the Government Code.³

This letter ruling is limited to the particular information at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other information or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For more information concerning those rights and responsibilities, please visit our website at <https://www.texasattorneygeneral.gov/open-government/members-public/what-expect-after-ruling-issued> or call the OAG’s Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. Questions concerning the allowable

letter does not reach, and therefore does not authorize the withholding of, any other requested records to the extent those records contain substantially different types of information than that submitted to this office.

³ As our ruling is dispositive, we need not address the remaining arguments against disclosure.

charges for providing public information under the Public Information Act may be directed to the Cost Rules Administrator of the OAG, toll free, at (888) 672-6787.

Sincerely,

Jennifer Copeland
Assistant Attorney General
Open Records Division

JC/eb

Ref: ID# 834755

Enc. Submitted documents

c: 2 Requestors
(w/o enclosures)