



KEN PAXTON
ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS

July 6, 2020

Mr. Robert G. Schleier, Jr.
Counsel for the City of Kilgore
Law Office of Robert G. Schleier, Jr., P.C.
116 North Kilgore Street
Kilgore, Texas 75662

OR2020-16937

Dear Mr. Schleier:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 835123.

The City of Kilgore (the "city"), which you represent, received a request for information pertaining to a specified accident. The city states it has released some of the requested information, but claims some of the submitted information is excepted from disclosure under sections 552.101 and 552.130 of the Government Code. We have considered the claimed exceptions and reviewed the submitted information.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code excepts from disclosure "information considered to be confidential by law, either constitutional, statutory, or by judicial decision." Gov't Code § 552.101. This section encompasses information made confidential by other statutes. Body worn cameras are subject to chapter 1701 of the Occupations Code. Section 1701.661(a) of the Occupations Code states the information a requestor must provide when seeking a body worn camera recording. *See* Occ. Code § 1701.661(a). The requestor provided the information required by section 1701.661(a) for release of the body worn camera recording. However, section 1701.661(f) provides, in relevant part, as follows:

A law enforcement agency may not release any portion . . . of a recording involving the investigation of conduct that constitutes a misdemeanor punishable by fine only and which does not result in arrest, without written authorization from the person who is the subject of that portion of the recording or, if the person is deceased, from the person's authorized representative.

Id. § 1701.661(f). The city states the submitted body worn camera recording involves an investigation of conduct that constitutes a misdemeanor punishable by fine only and did not result in arrest. The city further states it does not have permission for release from the subject of the recording at issue. *See id.* Based on these representations, we conclude the city must withhold the submitted body worn camera recording under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 1701.661(f) of the Occupations Code.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code also encompasses chapter 772 of the Health and Safety Code, which authorizes the development of local emergency communication districts. Section 772.318 of the Health and Safety Code applies to an emergency communication district for a county with a population of more than 20,000 and makes confidential the originating telephone numbers and addresses of 9-1-1 callers that are furnished by a 9-1-1 service supplier. *See* Open Records Decision No. 649 (1996). The city represents it is part of an emergency communication district that is subject to section 772.318 of the Health and Safety Code. The city also represents the information it has marked under section 552.318 was provided to the city by a 9-1-1 service supplier. Based on these representations, we agree the city must withhold the information it has marked under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 772.318 of the Health and Safety Code.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code also encompasses the doctrine of common-law privacy. *Indus. Found. v. Tex. Indus. Accident Bd.*, 540 S.W.2d 668, 685 (Tex. 1976). Under the common-law right of privacy, an individual has a right to be free from the publicizing of private affairs in which the public has no legitimate concern. *Id.* at 682. The Third Court of Appeals has concluded public citizens' dates of birth are protected by common-law privacy pursuant to section 552.101. *See Paxton v. City of Dallas*, No. 03-13-00546-CV, 2015 WL 3394061, at *3 (Tex. App.—Austin May 22, 2015, pet. denied) (mem. op.). The requestor has a right of access to their client's dates of birth pursuant to section 552.023 of the Government Code. *See* Gov't Code § 552.023(a); Open Records Decision No. 481 at 4 (1987) (privacy theories not implicated when individuals request information concerning themselves). Nevertheless, the city must withhold the remaining dates of birth under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy.

Section 552.130 of the Government Code provides information relating to a motor vehicle operator's license, driver's license, motor vehicle title or registration, or personal identification document issued by an agency of this state or another state or country is excepted from public release. *See* Gov't Code § 552.130. Because section 552.130 protects personal privacy, the requestor has a right of access to his client's motor vehicle record information pursuant to section 552.023 of the Government Code. *See id.* § 552.023(a); ORD 481 at 4. However, the city must withhold the remaining motor vehicle record information it has marked under section 552.130 of the Government Code.

In summary, the city must withhold the following: (1) the submitted body worn camera recording under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 1701.661(f) of the Occupations Code; (2) the information it has marked under section

552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 772.318 of the Health and Safety Code; (3) with the exception of the dates of birth of the requestor's clients, the submitted dates of birth under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy; and (4) with the exception of the information to which the requestor has a right of access under section 552.023 of the Government Code, the information it has marked under section 552.130 of the Government Code. The city must release the remaining information.

This letter ruling is limited to the particular information at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other information or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For more information concerning those rights and responsibilities, please visit our website at <https://www.texasattorneygeneral.gov/open-government/members-public/what-expect-after-ruling-issued> or call the OAG's Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. Questions concerning the allowable charges for providing public information under the Public Information Act may be directed to the Cost Rules Administrator of the OAG, toll free, at (888) 672-6787.

Sincerely,

James L. Coggeshall
Assistant Attorney General
Open Records Division

JLC/be

Ref: ID# 835123

Enc. Submitted documents

c: Requestor
(w/o enclosures)