



**KEN PAXTON**  
ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS

July 1, 2020

Ms. Marisa Martinez  
Open Records Specialist  
City of Richardson  
P.O. Box 830178  
Richardson, Texas 75083-1078

OR2020-16795

Dear Ms. Martinez:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 834019 (File No. P004658).

The City of Richardson (the "city") received a request for all calls involving a specified address and a named individual made during a specified time period. You state you have released some information to the requestor. You state you will redact motor vehicle record information under section 552.130(c) of the Government Code, account numbers under section 552.136(c) of the Government Code, certain dates of birth pursuant to Open Records Letter No. 2017-00069 (2017), and e-mail addresses belonging to members of the public under section 552.137 of the Government Code pursuant to Open Records Decision No. 684 (2009).<sup>1</sup> You claim the submitted information is excepted from

---

<sup>1</sup> Section 552.130(c) of the Government Code allows a governmental body to redact the information described in subsection 552.130(a) without the necessity of seeking a decision from the attorney general. *See Gov't Code* § 552.130(c). If a governmental body redacts such information, it must notify the requestor in accordance with section 552.130(e). *See id.* § 552.130(d), (e). Section 552.136(c) of the Government Code allows a governmental body to redact the information described in section 552.136(b) without the necessity of seeking a decision from the attorney general. *See id.* § 552.136(c). If a governmental body redacts such information, it must notify the requestor in accordance with section 552.136(e). *See id.* § 552.136(d), (e). Open Records Letter No. 2017-00069 authorizes the city to withhold the dates of birth of public citizens under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy without requesting a decision from this office. Open Records Decision No. 684 is a previous determination to all governmental bodies authorizing them to withhold certain categories of information, including an e-mail address of a member of the public under section 552.137 of the Government Code, without the necessity of requesting an attorney general opinion.

disclosure under sections 552.101 and 552.108 of the Government Code. We have considered the exceptions you claim and reviewed the submitted information.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code excepts from disclosure “information considered to be confidential by law, either constitutional, statutory, or by judicial decision.” Gov’t Code § 552.101. This section encompasses the doctrine of common-law privacy, which protects information that (1) contains highly intimate or embarrassing facts, the publication of which would be highly objectionable to a reasonable person, and (2) is not of legitimate concern to the public. *Indus. Found. v. Tex. Indus. Accident Bd.*, 540 S.W.2d 668, 685 (Tex. 1976). To demonstrate the applicability of common-law privacy, both elements of the test must be established. *Id.* at 681-82. A compilation of an individual’s criminal history is highly embarrassing information, the publication of which would be highly objectionable to a reasonable person. *Cf. U. S. Dep’t of Justice v. Reporters Comm. for Freedom of the Press*, 489 U.S. 749, 764 (1989) (finding significant privacy interest in compilation of individual’s criminal history by recognizing distinction between public records found in courthouse files and local police stations and compiled summary of criminal history information). Furthermore, we find a compilation of a private citizen’s criminal history is generally not of legitimate concern to the public. However, information that refers to an individual solely as a victim, witness, or involved person is not private and may not be withheld under section 552.101 on that basis.

Upon review, we find the present request seeks unspecified law enforcement records pertaining to the named individual. The request requires the city to compile the named individual’s criminal history and implicates the named individual’s right to privacy. Accordingly, to the extent the city maintains law enforcement records involving the named individual as a suspect, arrestee, or criminal defendant, the city must withhold such information under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy. However, we note you have submitted information that does not list the named individual as a suspect, arrestee, or criminal defendant. This information does not constitute part of a criminal history compilation and may not be withheld on that basis. Accordingly, we will address your remaining arguments against disclosure of this information.

Section 552.108(a)(2) of the Government Code excepts from disclosure information concerning an investigation that did not result in conviction or deferred adjudication. *See* Gov’t Code § 552.108(a)(2). A governmental body claiming section 552.108(a)(2) must demonstrate the requested information relates to a criminal investigation that has concluded in a final result other than a conviction or deferred adjudication. *See id.* § 552.301(e)(1)(A) (governmental body must provide comments explaining why exceptions raised should apply to information requested). You state the information you have marked in Exhibit C pertains to a concluded investigation that did not result in conviction or deferred adjudication. Based on your representation and our review, we agree section 552.108(a)(2) is applicable to the information at issue.

However, section 552.108 does not except from disclosure “basic information about an arrested person, an arrest, or a crime.” *Id.* § 552.108(c). Basic information refers to the information held to be public in *Houston Chronicle Publishing Co. v. City of Houston*, 531

S.W.2d 177 (Tex. Civ. App.—Houston [14th Dist.] 1975), *writ ref'd n.r.e. per curiam*, 536 S.W.2d 559 (Tex. 1976). *See also* Open Records Decision No. 127 (1976) (summarizing types of information considered to be basic information). We note basic information includes a detailed description of the offense. *See* ORD 127 at 3-4. Accordingly, with the exception of basic information, the city may withhold the information you have marked in Exhibit C under section 552.108(a)(2) of the Government Code.<sup>2</sup>

As stated above, section 552.101 of the Government Code encompasses the doctrine of common-law privacy, which is subject to the two-part test discussed above. *Indus. Found.*, 540 S.W.2d at 685. Types of information considered intimate and embarrassing by the Texas Supreme Court are delineated in *Industrial Foundation*. *Id.* at 683. Additionally, this office has concluded some kinds of medical information are generally highly intimate or embarrassing. *See* Open Records Decision No. 455 (1987). Generally, only highly intimate or embarrassing information implicating the privacy of an individual is withheld. However, in certain situations where the requestor knows the identity of the individual involved, as well as the nature of certain incidents, an entire report must be withheld to protect the individual's privacy. You argue to withhold the basic information within the report you have marked in Exhibit C in its entirety under common-law privacy. Upon review, we find you have not demonstrated, and the information at issue does not reflect, this is a situation in which this basic information must be withheld in its entirety to protect an individual's privacy interest. However, we find the some of the information at issue, as well as some of the remaining information, satisfies the standard articulated by the Texas Supreme Court in *Industrial Foundation*. Therefore, the city must withhold the basic information we have marked and the remaining information you have marked under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy. However, we find you have failed to demonstrate any of the remaining information is highly intimate or embarrassing and not of legitimate concern to the public or it pertains solely to a deceased individual. Therefore, the city may not withhold any of the remaining information under section 552.101 in conjunction with common-law privacy.

In summary, to the extent the city maintains law enforcement records involving the named individual as a suspect, arrestee, or criminal defendant, the city must withhold such information under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy. With the exception of basic information, the city may withhold the information you have marked in Exhibit C under section 552.108(a)(2) of the Government Code. The city must withhold the basic information we have marked and the remaining information you have marked under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy. The city must release the remaining information.

This letter ruling is limited to the particular information at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other information or any other circumstances.

---

<sup>2</sup> As our ruling is dispositive, we need not address your remaining argument against disclosure of this information.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For more information concerning those rights and responsibilities, please visit our website at <https://www.texasattorneygeneral.gov/open-government/members-public/what-expect-after-ruling-issued> or call the OAG's Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. Questions concerning the allowable charges for providing public information under the Public Information Act may be directed to the Cost Rules Administrator of the OAG, toll free, at (888) 672-6787.

Sincerely,

Tim Neal  
Assistant Attorney General  
Open Records Division

TN/rm

Ref: ID# 834019

Enc. Submitted documents

c: Requestor  
(w/o enclosures)