



**KEN PAXTON**  
ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS

June 12, 2020

Mr. Allen M. Keller  
Counsel for Orenda Education  
Schulman, Lopez, Hoffer, & Adelstein, LLP  
845 Proton Road  
San Antonio, Texas 78258

OR2020-16035

Dear Mr. Keller:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 832509.

Orenda Education ("Orenda"), which you represent, received a request for contracts for copier and printer equipment and services, as well as related invoices for a particular time period. You claim the submitted information is excepted from disclosure under section 552.104 of the Government Code. You also state release of the submitted information may implicate the proprietary interests of Dahill, a Xerox Company and Toshiba America Business Solutions, Inc. Accordingly, you state, and provide documentation showing, you notified these third parties of the request for information and of the right to submit arguments to this office as to why the submitted information should not be released. *See* Gov't Code § 552.305 (permitting interested third party to submit to attorney general reasons why requested information should not be released); Open Records Decision No. 542 (1990) (determining statutory predecessor to section 552.305 permits governmental body to rely on interested third party to raise and explain applicability of exception in certain circumstances). We have considered your claimed exception and reviewed the submitted information.

Initially, we note an interested third party is allowed ten business days after the date of its receipt of the governmental body's notice under section 552.305(d) of the Government Code to submit its reasons, if any, as to why information relating to that party should be withheld from public disclosure. *See* Gov't Code § 552.305(d)(2)(B). As of the date of this letter, we have not received comments from either third party explaining why the submitted information should not be released. Therefore, we have no basis to conclude either third party has a protected proprietary interest in the submitted information. *See e.g., id.* § 552.110 (requiring the provision of specific factual evidence demonstrating the

applicability of the exception). Accordingly, Orenda may not withhold the submitted information on the basis of any proprietary interest either third party may have in the information.

Section 552.104(a) of the Government Code excepts from disclosure information that a governmental body demonstrates, if released, would “harm its interests by providing an advantage to a competitor or bidder in a particular ongoing competitive situation or in a particular competitive situation where the governmental body establishes the situation at issue is set to reoccur or there is a specific and demonstrable intent to enter into the competitive situation again in the future.” *Id.* § 552.104(a). The “test under section 552.104 is whether knowing another bidder’s [or competitor’s information] would be an advantage, not whether it would be a decisive advantage.” *Boeing Co. v. Paxton*, 466 S.W.3d 831, 831 (Tex. 2015). After review of the information at issue and consideration of the arguments, we find Orenda has failed to demonstrate the applicability of section 552.104 to the information at issue. Thus, we conclude Orenda may not withhold the information at issue under section 552.104(a). As no further exceptions to disclosure have been raised, Orenda must release the submitted information.

This letter ruling is limited to the particular information at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other information or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For more information concerning those rights and responsibilities, please visit our website at <https://www.texasattorneygeneral.gov/open-government/members-public/what-expect-after-ruling-issued> or call the OAG’s Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. Questions concerning the allowable charges for providing public information under the Public Information Act may be directed to the Cost Rules Administrator of the OAG, toll free, at (888) 672-6787.

Sincerely,

Erin Groff  
Assistant Attorney General  
Open Records Division

EMG/gw

Ref: ID# 832509

Enc. Submitted documents

c: Requestor  
(w/o enclosures)

c: Third Parties  
(w/o enclosures)