



KEN PAXTON
ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS

June 12, 2020

Mr. Jeffrey Moore
Counsel for the City of Oak Point
Brown & Hofmeister, L.L.P.
740 East Campbell Road, Suite 800
Richardson, Texas 75081

OR2020-15985

Dear Mr. Moore:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 832523.

The City of Oak Point (the "city"), which you represent, received a request for all information pertaining to a named individual, including information pertaining to a specified arrest. You state the city has released some information to the requestor. You claim the submitted information is excepted from disclosure under sections 552.101, 552.103, 552.130, and 552.137 of the Government Code. We have considered the exceptions you claim and reviewed the submitted representative sample of information.¹

Initially, you state the city has withdrawn its request for a ruling in regard to a portion of the responsive information because the responsive records will be released to the requestor. Thus, this ruling does not address the public availability of information the city no longer seeks to withhold.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code excepts from disclosure "information considered to be confidential by law, either constitutional, statutory, or by judicial decision." Gov't Code § 552.101. Section 552.101 encompasses the doctrine of common-law privacy, which protects information that is (1) highly intimate or embarrassing, the publication of which would be highly objectionable to a reasonable person, and (2) not of legitimate

¹ We assume the "representative sample" of records submitted to this office is truly representative of the requested records as a whole. See Open Records Decision Nos. 499 (1988), 497 (1988). This open records letter does not reach, and therefore does not authorize the withholding of, any other requested records to the extent those records contain substantially different types of information than that submitted to this office.

concern to the public. *Indus. Found. v. Tex. Indus. Accident Bd.*, 540 S.W.2d 668, 685 (Tex. 1976). To demonstrate the applicability of common-law privacy, both prongs of this test must be satisfied. *Id.* at 681-82. Types of information considered intimate and embarrassing by the Texas Supreme Court are delineated in *Industrial Foundation*. *Id.* at 683. A compilation of an individual's criminal history is highly embarrassing information, the publication of which would be highly objectionable to a reasonable person. *Cf. U.S. Dep't of Justice v. Reporters Comm. for Freedom of the Press*, 489 U.S. 749, 764 (1989) (finding significant privacy interest in compilation of individual's criminal history by recognizing distinction between public records found in courthouse files and local police stations and compiled summary of criminal history information). Furthermore, we find that a compilation of a private citizen's criminal history is generally not of legitimate concern to the public.

The requestor asks, in part, for all information held by the city concerning a named individual. Therefore, to the extent the city maintains any unspecified law enforcement information depicting the named individual as a suspect, arrestee, or criminal defendant, such information is excepted from disclosure under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy. However, the requestor also asks for information pertaining to a specified arrest. Because the requestor specifically asks for this information, it is not part of a compilation of the individual's criminal history and may not be withheld on that basis. Therefore, this information is not confidential under common-law privacy, and the city may not withhold it under section 552.101 of the Government Code on that ground. Accordingly, we will address your arguments to withhold this information.

Next, we note the information at issue consists of a completed investigation subject to section 552.022(a)(1) of the Government Code. Pursuant to section 552.022(a)(1), completed investigations, reports, and evaluations are expressly public unless they are either excepted under section 552.108 of the Government Code or confidential under the Act or other law. Gov't Code §552.022(a)(1). Although you raise section 552.103 of the Government Code for the information at issue, section 552.103 is a discretionary exception to disclosure and does not make information confidential under the Act. *See id.* § 552.007; *Dallas Area Rapid Transit v. Dallas Morning News*, 4 S.W.3d 469, 475-76 (Tex. App.—Dallas 1999, no pet.) (governmental body may waive section 552.103); Open Records Decision Nos. 665 at 2 n.5 (discretionary exceptions generally), 663 (1999) (governmental body may waive section 552.103). Therefore, the city may not withhold the information at issue under section 552.103 of the Government Code. However, you raise sections 552.101, 552.130, and 552.137 for some of the information at issue, which make information confidential under the Act. Accordingly, we will consider the applicability of these exceptions to the information at issue.

As noted above, section 552.101 of the Government Code also encompasses the doctrine of common-law privacy. *Indus. Found.*, 540 S.W.2d at 685. Under the common-law right of privacy, an individual has a right to be free from the publicizing of private affairs in which the public has no legitimate concern. *Id.* at 682. The court of appeals has concluded public citizens' dates of birth are protected by common-law privacy pursuant to section 552.101. *Paxton v. City of Dallas*, No. 03-13-00546-CV, 2015 WL 3394061, at *3 (Tex. App.—Austin May 22, 2015, pet. denied) (mem. op.). Thus, the city must withhold the

public citizens' dates of birth under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy.

Section 552.130 of the Government Code provides information relating to a motor vehicle operator's license, driver's license, motor vehicle title or registration, or personal identification document issued by an agency of this state or another state or country is excepted from public release. Gov't Code § 552.130. Accordingly, the city must withhold the information you marked under section 552.130 of the Government Code.

Section 552.137 of the Government Code excepts from disclosure "an e-mail address of a member of the public that is provided for the purpose of communicating electronically with a governmental body" unless the member of the public consents to its release or the e-mail address is of a type specifically excluded by subsection (c). *See id.* § 552.137(a)-(c). The e-mail addresses at issue are not excluded by subsection (c). Therefore, the city must withhold the personal e-mail addresses you marked and the additional e-mail addresses we marked under section 552.137 of the Government Code, unless the owners affirmatively consent to their public disclosure.

In summary, to the extent the city maintains any unspecified law enforcement information depicting the named individual as a suspect, arrestee, or criminal defendant, such information is excepted from disclosure under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy. The city must withhold the public citizens' dates of birth under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy. The city must withhold the information you marked under section 552.130 of the Government Code. The city must withhold the personal e-mail addresses you marked and the additional e-mail addresses we marked under section 552.137 of the Government Code, unless the owners affirmatively consent to their public disclosure. The city must release the remaining information.

This letter ruling is limited to the particular information at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other information or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For more information concerning those rights and responsibilities, please visit our website at <https://www.texasattorneygeneral.gov/open-government/members-public/what-expect-after-ruling-issued> or call the OAG's Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. Questions concerning the allowable charges for providing public information under the Public Information Act may be directed to the Cost Rules Administrator of the OAG, toll free, at (888) 672-6787.

Sincerely,

Deborah Southerland
Assistant Attorney General
Open Records Division

DS/rm

Ref: ID# 832523

Enc. Submitted documents

c: Requestor
(w/o enclosures)