



KEN PAXTON
ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS

June 4, 2020

Mr. Mark G. Mann
Senior Assistant City Attorney
City of Garland
P.O. Box 469002
Garland, Texas 75046-9002

OR2020-15334

Dear Mr. Mann:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 832431 (GCA No. 20-0307).

The Garland Police Department (the "department") received a request for all information regarding the requestor's client. You state the department released some information. The department states it will redact dates of birth of members of the public pursuant to the previous determination issued in Open Records Letter No. 2017-22182 (2017).¹ You claim some of the submitted information is excepted from disclosure under sections 552.108 and 552.130 of the Government Code. We have considered the exceptions you claim and reviewed the submitted information.

Section 552.108(a)(1) of the Government Code excepts from disclosure "[i]nformation held by a law enforcement agency or prosecutor that deals with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime . . . if . . . release of the information would interfere with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime[.]" Gov't Code § 552.108(a)(1). A governmental body claiming section 552.108(a)(1) must explain how and why this exception is applicable to the information at issue. *See id.* §§ 552.108(a)(1), .301(e)(1)(A); *see also Ex parte Pruitt*, 551 S.W.2d 706 (Tex. 1977). The department states the submitted information relates to a pending criminal investigation or prosecution. Based on this representation, we conclude release of the information the department marked will interfere with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime. *See Houston Chronicle Publ'g Co. v. City of Houston*, 531 S.W.2d 177 (Tex. Civ. App.—Houston [14th Dist.] 1975) (court delineates

¹ Open Records Letter No. 2017-22182 authorizes the department to withhold public citizens' dates of birth under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy without requesting an attorney general decision. *See* Open Records Decision No. 673 at 7-8 (2001) (listing elements of second type of previous determination under section 552.301(a) of the Government Code).

law enforcement interests that are present in active cases), *writ ref'd n.r.e. per curiam*, 536 S.W.2d 559 (Tex. 1976). Accordingly, we find the department may generally withhold the information it marked under section 552.108(a)(1) of the Government Code.²

However, we note the requestor is a representative of the Regional Public Defender for Capital Cases for Hunt County (the “public defender’s office”). Section 411.1272 of the Government Code provides:

The office of capital and forensic writs and a public defender’s office are entitled to obtain from the [Texas Department of Public Safety (“DPS”)] criminal history record information [(“CHRI”)] maintained by the [DPS] that relates to a criminal case in which an attorney compensated . . . by the public defender’s office has been appointed.

Gov’t Code § 411.1272. In addition, section 411.087(a) of the Government Code provides:

(a) Unless otherwise authorized by Subsection (e), a person, agency, department, political subdivision, or other entity that is authorized by this subchapter or Subchapter E-1 to obtain from the [DPS CHRI] maintained by the [DPS] that relates to another person is authorized to:

...

(2) obtain from any other criminal justice agency in this state CHRI maintained by that criminal justice agency that relates to that person.

Id. § 411.087(a)(2). CHRI is defined as “information collected about a person by a criminal justice agency that consists of identifiable descriptions and notations of arrests, detentions, indictments, informations, and other formal criminal charges and their dispositions.” *See id.* § 411.082(2).

Accordingly, the requestor is authorized to obtain the CHRI in the information at issue from the department pursuant to sections 411.087(a)(2) and 411.1272 of the Government Code if it relates to a criminal case in which an attorney compensated by the public defender’s office is appointed. *See id.* §§ 411.087(a)(2), .1272. Although the department raises section 552.108 of the Government Code for this information, we note a statutory right of access generally prevails over the Act’s general exceptions to disclosure. *See* Open Records Decision Nos. 623 at 3 (1994), 525 at 3 (1989), 451 at 4 (1986) (specific statutory right of access provisions overcome general exception to disclosure under the Act). Therefore, if the department determines the information at issue relates to a criminal case in which an attorney compensated by the public defender’s office is appointed, then the department must release the information that shows the type of allegations made and whether there was an arrest, information, indictment, detention, conviction, or other formal charges and their dispositions. In that instance, the department may withhold the remaining information at

² As our ruling is dispositive, we need not address your remaining argument against disclosure of this information.

issue under section 552.108(a)(1). Conversely, if the department determines the information at issue does not relate to a criminal case in which an attorney compensated by the public defender's office is appointed, then the department may withhold the information it marked under section 552.108(a)(1) of the Government Code.

In summary, the department may generally withhold the information it marked under section 552.108(a)(1) of the Government Code, and must release the remaining information; however, if the department determines the information at issue relates to a criminal case in which an attorney compensated by the public defender's office is appointed, then the department must also release the information that shows the type of allegations made and whether there was an arrest, information, indictment, detention, conviction, or other formal charges and their dispositions pursuant to sections 411.1272 and 411.087 of the Government Code.

This letter ruling is limited to the particular information at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other information or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For more information concerning those rights and responsibilities, please visit our website at <https://www.texasattorneygeneral.gov/open-government/members-public/what-expect-after-ruling-issued> or call the OAG's Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. Questions concerning the allowable charges for providing public information under the Public Information Act may be directed to the Cost Rules Administrator of the OAG, toll free, at (888) 672-6787.

Sincerely,

Britni Ramirez
Assistant Attorney General
Open Records Division

BR/rm

Ref: ID# 832431

Enc. Submitted documents

c: Requestor
(w/o enclosures)