



**KEN PAXTON**  
ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS

June 3, 2020

Ms. Stacie S. White  
Counsel for the Town of Flower Mound  
Taylor, Olson, Adkins, Sralla, Elam, L.L.P.  
6000 Western Place, Suite 200  
Fort Worth, Texas 76107

OR2020-15225

Dear Ms. White:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 832855.

The Flower Mound Police Department (the "department"), which you represent, received a request for information pertaining to two named individuals and a specified address.<sup>1</sup> The department states it will withhold information pursuant to section 552.147(b) of the Government Code.<sup>2</sup> The department claims some of the submitted information is excepted from disclosure under sections 552.101 and 552.130 of the Government Code. We have considered the claimed exceptions and reviewed the submitted information.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code excepts from disclosure "information considered to be confidential by law, either constitutional, statutory, or by judicial decision." Gov't Code § 552.101. This section encompasses chapter 411 of the Government Code, which

---

<sup>1</sup> The department sought and received clarification of the information requested. *See* Gov't Code § 552.222 (if request for information is unclear, governmental body may ask requestor to clarify request); *see also* *City of Dallas v. Abbott*, 304 S.W.3d 380, 387 (Tex. 2010) (if governmental entity, acting in good faith, requests clarification of unclear or over-broad request, ten-day period to request attorney general ruling is measured from date request is clarified).

<sup>2</sup> Section 552.147(b) of the Government Code authorizes a governmental body to redact a living person's social security number from public release without the necessity of requesting a decision from this office under the Act. *See id.* § 552.147(b).

pertains to criminal history record information (“CHRI”) generated by the National Crime Information Center or by the Texas Crime Information Center. Title 28, part 20 of the Code of Federal Regulations governs the release of CHRI that states obtain from the federal government or other states. Open Records Decision No. 565 (1990). The federal regulations allow each state to follow its individual law with respect to CHRI it generates. *Id.* Section 411.083 of the Government Code makes CHRI the Texas Department of Public Safety (“DPS”) maintains confidential, except DPS may disseminate this information as provided in subchapters E-1 and F of chapter 411 of the Government Code. *See* Gov’t Code § 411.083(a). Sections 411.083(b)(1) and 411.089(a) authorize a criminal justice agency to obtain CHRI; however, a criminal justice agency may not release CHRI except to another criminal justice agency for criminal justice purposes. *See id.* § 411.083(b)(1), .089. The submitted information contains a Federal Bureau of Investigation (“FBI”) number that constitutes CHRI generated by the FBI. Therefore, the submitted FBI number is confidential under section 411.083 of the Government Code. However, the remaining information does not contain CHRI for purposes of chapter 411. Accordingly, the remaining information is not confidential under chapter 411, and the department may not withhold it under section 552.101 of the Government Code on that ground.

We note the requestor is an investigator with the Texas Department of Family and Protective Services (“DFPS”). Section 411.114 of the Government Code allows, among other things, for DFPS to obtain criminal history record information (“CHRI”) concerning an individual who is the subject of a report of abuse or neglect of a child. *See* Gov’t Code § 411.114(a)(4), (a)(2)(I). CHRI consists of “information collected about a person by a criminal justice agency that consists of identifiable descriptions and notations of arrests, detentions, indictments, informations, and other formal criminal charges and their dispositions.” *See id.* § 411.082(2). The requestor does not state whether the individual whose FBI number is at issue is a suspect in a report of abuse or neglect of a child. Therefore, we must rule conditionally. *See id.* § 411.114; *see also id.* § 411.082(2). If the individual at issue is a suspect in a report of abuse or neglect of a child, then the department must release the submitted FBI number pursuant to section 411.114 of the Government Code. *See* Open Records Decision No. 451 (1986) (specific statutory right of access provisions overcome general exceptions to disclosure under the Act). However, if the individual is not a suspect in a report of abuse or neglect of a child, then the department must withhold the submitted FBI number under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 411.083 of the Government Code.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code also encompasses the doctrine of common-law privacy, which protects information that is (1) highly intimate or embarrassing, the publication of which would be highly objectionable to a reasonable person, and (2) not of legitimate concern to the public. *Indus. Found. v. Tex. Indus. Accident Bd.*, 540 S.W.2d 668, 685 (Tex. 1976). To demonstrate the applicability of common-law privacy, both prongs of this test must be satisfied. *Id.* at 681-82. Types of information considered intimate and embarrassing by the Texas Supreme Court are delineated in the *Industrial Foundation* decision. *Id.* at 683. This office has concluded some kinds of medical information are generally highly intimate or embarrassing. *See* Open Records Decision No.

455 (1987). In addition, a compilation of an individual's criminal history is highly embarrassing information, the publication of which would be highly objectionable to a reasonable person. *Cf. U.S. Dep't of Justice v. Reporters Comm. for Freedom of the Press*, 489 U.S. 749, 764 (1989) (finding significant privacy interest in compilation of individual's criminal history by recognizing distinction between public records found in courthouse files and local police stations and compiled summary of criminal history information). Furthermore, we find a compilation of a private citizen's criminal history is generally not of legitimate concern to the public. The Third Court of Appeals has concluded public citizens' dates of birth are protected by common-law privacy pursuant to section 552.101. *See Paxton v. City of Dallas*, No. 03-13-00546-CV, 2015 WL 3394061, at \*3 (Tex. App.—Austin May 22, 2015, pet. denied) (mem. op.). The department must withhold the submitted dates of birth under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy. We also find some of the remaining information, which we have marked, satisfies the standard articulated by the Texas Supreme Court in the *Industrial Foundation* decision. Accordingly, the department must also withhold the information we have marked under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy. However, the remaining information is not confidential under common-law privacy, and the department may not withhold it under section 552.101 on that ground.

Section 552.130 of the Government Code provides information relating to a motor vehicle operator's license, driver's license, motor vehicle title or registration, or personal identification document issued by an agency of this state or another state or country is excepted from public release. *See Gov't Code § 552.130*. The department must withhold the motor vehicle record information it has marked, as well as the information we have marked, under section 552.130 of the Government Code.

In summary, the department must release the submitted FBI number pursuant to section 411.114 of the Government Code if the individual to whom it pertains is a suspect in a report of abuse or neglect of a child. If the individual is not a suspect in a report of abuse or neglect of a child, then the department must withhold the submitted FBI number under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 411.083 of the Government Code. The department must withhold the submitted dates of birth and the information we have marked under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy. The department must also withhold the information marked under section 552.130 of the Government Code. The department must release the remaining information.

This letter ruling is limited to the particular information at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other information or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For more information concerning those rights and responsibilities, please visit our website at <https://www.texasattorneygeneral.gov/open-government/members-public/what-expect-after-ruling-issued> or call the OAG's Open

Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. Questions concerning the allowable charges for providing public information under the Public Information Act may be directed to the Cost Rules Administrator of the OAG, toll free, at (888) 672-6787.

Sincerely,

James L. Coggeshall  
Assistant Attorney General  
Open Records Division

JLC/mo

Ref: ID# 832855

Enc. Submitted documents

c: Requestor  
(w/o enclosures)