



**KEN PAXTON**  
ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS

June 2, 2020

Ms. Alicia K. Kreh  
Counsel for the City of Euless  
Taylor Olson Adkins Sralla Elam, L.L.P.  
6000 Western Place, Suite 200  
Fort Worth, Texas 76107

OR2020-15150

Dear Ms. Kreh:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 832690.

The City of Euless (the "city"), which you represent, received a request for case number 19-71859. The city states it is withholding motor vehicle record information pursuant to section 552.130(c) of the Government Code and social security numbers pursuant to section 552.147(b) of the Government Code.<sup>1</sup> The city further states it is withholding certain information pursuant to Open Records Decision No. 684 (2009).<sup>2</sup> The city claims the submitted information is excepted from disclosure under section 552.101 of the Government Code. We have considered the exception the city claims and reviewed the submitted information.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code excepts from disclosure "information considered to be confidential by law, either constitutional, statutory, or by judicial decision." Gov't Code § 552.101. Section 552.101 encompasses section 58.008 of the Family Code, which provides, in part:

---

<sup>1</sup> Section 552.130(c) of the Government Code allows a governmental body to redact the information described in section 552.130(a) without the necessity of seeking a decision from the attorney general. *See* Gov't Code § 552.130(c). If a governmental body redacts such information, it must notify the requestor in accordance with section 552.130(e). *See id.* § 552.130(d), (e). Section 552.147(b) of the Government Code authorizes a governmental body to redact a living person's social security number from public release without the necessity of requesting a decision from this office. *See id.* § 552.147(b).

<sup>2</sup> Open Records Decision No. 684 is a previous determination to all governmental bodies authorizing them to withhold certain information without the necessity of requesting an attorney general decision.

(b) Except as provided by Subsection (c), law enforcement records concerning a child and information concerning a child that are stored by electronic means or otherwise from which a record could be generated may not be disclosed to the public and shall be:

(1) if maintained on paper or microfilm, kept separate from adult records;

(2) if maintained electronically in the same computer system as adult records, accessible only under controls that are separate and distinct from the controls to access electronic data concerning adults; and

(3) maintained on a local basis only and not sent to a central state or federal depository, except as provided by Subsection (c) or Subchapter B, D, or E.

...

(d) Law enforcement records concerning a child may be inspected or copied by:

(1) a juvenile justice agency, as defined by Section 58.101;

(2) a criminal justice agency, as defined by Section 411.082, Government Code;

(3) the child; [or]

(4) the child's parent or guardian[.]

(e) Before a child or a child's parent or guardian may inspect or copy a record concerning the child under Subsection (d), the custodian of the record shall redact:

(1) any personally identifiable information about a juvenile suspect, offender, victim, or witness who is not the child; and

(2) any information that is excepted from required disclosure under [the Act] or any other law.

Fam. Code § 58.008(b), (d), (e); *see id.* § 51.03(a) (defining “delinquent conduct” for purposes of title 3 of Family Code). Section 58.008(b) is applicable to records of juvenile conduct that occurred before, on, or after September 1, 2017. *See* Act of May 28, 2017, 85th Leg., R.S., ch. 746, § 22. The juvenile must have been at least 10 years old and less than 17 years of age when the conduct occurred. *See* Fam Code § 51.02(2) (defining “child” for purposes of title 3 of Family Code). The submitted information involves juvenile

offenders, so as to fall within the scope of section 58.008(b). The city acknowledges the requestor is a parent or guardian of one of the juvenile offenders and has a right to inspect juvenile law enforcement records concerning his child pursuant to section 58.008(d) of the Family Code. *See id.* § 58.008(d). However, section 58.008(e)(1) provides any personally identifiable information about a juvenile suspect, offender, victim, or witness who is not the requestor's child must be redacted. *See id.* § 58.008(e)(1). Accordingly, the city must withhold the personally identifiable information about a juvenile suspect, offender, victim, or witness who is not the requestor's child, which the city marked, under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 58.008(e)(1) of the Family Code. Further, section 58.008(e)(2) provides that information subject to any other exception to disclosure under the Act or other law must also be redacted. *See id.* § 58.008(e)(2). Thus, we will consider the city's remaining argument against release of the submitted information.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code excepts from disclosure "information considered to be confidential by law, either constitutional, statutory, or by judicial decision." Gov't Code § 552.101. Section 552.101 encompasses the doctrine of common-law privacy. *Indus. Found. v. Tex. Indus. Accident Bd.*, 540 S.W.2d 668, 685 (Tex. 1976). Under the common-law right of privacy, an individual has a right to be free from the publicizing of private affairs in which the public has no legitimate concern. *Id.* at 682. The Third Court of Appeals has concluded public citizens' dates of birth are protected by common-law privacy pursuant to section 552.101. *See Paxton v. City of Dallas*, No. 03-13-00546-CV, 2015 WL 3394061, at \*3 (Tex. App.—Austin May 22, 2015, pet. denied) (mem. op.). However, we note some of the dates of birth the city seeks to withhold on this basis belong to individuals who have been de-identified and whose privacy interests are thus adequately protected. Therefore, the date of birth belonging to an individual who has been de-identified may not be withheld under section 552.101 in conjunction with common-law privacy. Accordingly, with the exception of the requestor's and his minor child's dates of birth, to which the requestor has a right of access pursuant to section 552.023 of the Government Code, the city must withhold all identified public citizens' dates of birth under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy. *See Gov't Code § 552.023(a)* ("person's authorized representative has special right of access, beyond right of general public, to information held by governmental body that relates to person and that is protected from public disclosure by laws intended to protect that person's privacy interests"); Open Records Decision No. 481 at 4 (1987) (privacy theories not implicated when individual requests information concerning herself).

In summary, the city must withhold the personally identifiable information it marked under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 58.008(e)(1) of the Family Code. With the exception of the requestor's and his minor child's dates of birth, the city must withhold all identified public citizens' dates of birth under section 552.101 in conjunction with common-law privacy. The city must release the remaining information to this requestor.<sup>3</sup>

---

<sup>3</sup> We note the requestor has a right of access to the information at issue pursuant to section 58.008(d) of the Family Code. *See Fam. Code § 58.008(d)*. If the city receives another request for this information from a

This letter ruling is limited to the particular information at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other information or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For more information concerning those rights and responsibilities, please visit our website at <https://www.texasattorneygeneral.gov/open-government/members-public/what-expect-after-ruling-issued> or call the OAG's Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. Questions concerning the allowable charges for providing public information under the Public Information Act may be directed to the Cost Rules Administrator of the OAG, toll free, at (888) 672-6787.

Sincerely,

Claire V. Morris Sloan  
Assistant Attorney General  
Open Records Division

CVMS/be

Ref: ID# 832690

Enc. Submitted documents

c: Requestor  
(w/o enclosures)