



KEN PAXTON
ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS

May 28, 2020

Mr. Trey Qualls
Assistant Department Attorney
Department of Fort Worth
200 Texas Street, 3rd Floor
Fort Worth, Texas 76102

OR2020-14785

Dear Mr. Qualls:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 831726 (PIR# W099542).

The Fort Worth Police Department (the "department") received a request for fourteen points of information pertaining to a specified accident involving the requestor's client. You state the department has released some information. You claim the submitted information is excepted from disclosure under section 552.101 of the Government Code. We have considered the claimed exception and reviewed the submitted information.

Initially, we note the submitted information includes a body worn camera recording. Section 552.101 of the Government Code excepts from public disclosure "information considered to be confidential by law, either constitutional, statutory, or by judicial decision." Gov't Code § 552.101. This section encompasses information made confidential by other statutes. Body worn cameras are subject to chapter 1701 of the Occupations Code. Chapter 1701 provides the procedures a requestor must follow when seeking a body worn camera recording. Section 1701.661(a) of the Occupations Code provides the following:

A member of the public is required to provide the following information when submitting a written request to a law enforcement agency for information recorded by a body worn camera:

- (1) the date and approximate time of the recording;
- (2) the specific location where the recording occurred; and
- (3) the name of one or more persons known to be a subject of the recording.

Occ. Code § 1701.661(a). In this instance, the requestor provided the information required by section 1701.661(a) for release of the body worn camera recordings at issue. We note, however, section 1701.661(f) provides:

A law enforcement agency may not release any portion of a recording made in a private space, or of a recording involving the investigation of conduct that constitutes a misdemeanor punishable by fine only and does not result in arrest, without written authorization from the person who is the subject of that portion of the recording or, if the person is deceased, from the person's authorized representative.

Id. § 1701.661(f). You state the video recording at issue consists of a body worn camera recording involving an investigation of conduct that constitutes a misdemeanor punishable by fine only and which did not result in an arrest. You further state the department does not have permission for release from all of the subjects of the recordings at issue. *See id.* § 1701.661(f). Accordingly, we find the department must withhold the submitted body worn camera recording under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 1701.661(f) of the Occupations Code. We note the remaining information consists of an incident detail report. This information does not consist of a body worn camera recording. Therefore, the remaining information is not subject to chapter 1701 of the Occupations Code and the department may not withhold it on that basis.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code also encompasses information protected by other statutes, such as chapter 411 of the Government Code, which makes confidential criminal history record information (“CHRI”) generated by the National Crime Information Center or by the Texas Crime Information Center. *See* Gov’t Code § 411.083(a). CHRI means “information collected about a person by a criminal justice agency that consists of identifiable descriptions and notations of arrests, detentions, indictments, informations, and other formal criminal charges and their dispositions.” *Id.* § 411.082(2). Title 28, part 20 of the Code of Federal Regulations governs the release of CHRI obtained from the federal government or other states. *See* Open Records Decision No. 565 (1990). The federal regulations allow each state to follow its individual laws with respect to CHRI it generates. *See id.* Section 411.083 of the Government Code deems confidential CHRI the Texas Department of Public Safety (“DPS”) maintains, except DPS may disseminate this information as provided in chapter 411, subchapter F or subchapter E-1, of the Government Code. *See* Gov’t Code § 411.083(a). Sections 411.083(b)(1) and 411.089(a) authorize a criminal justice agency to obtain CHRI; however, a criminal justice agency may not release CHRI except to another criminal justice agency for a criminal justice purpose. *Id.*

§ 411.089(b)(1). Other entities specified in chapter 411 of the Government Code are entitled to obtain CHRI from DPS or another criminal justice agency; however, those entities may not release CHRI except as provided by chapter 411. *See generally id.* §§ 411.090-.127. Thus, any CHRI obtained from DPS or any other criminal justice agency must be withheld under section 552.101 in conjunction with chapter 411, subchapter F, of the Government Code. We note section 411.083 does not apply to active warrant information or other information relating to one's current involvement with the criminal justice system. *See id.* § 411.081(b) (police department allowed to disclose information pertaining to person's current involvement in the criminal justice system). We also note records relating to routine traffic violations are not considered criminal history information. *Cf. id.* § 411.082(2)(B) (criminal history record information does not include driving record information). Upon review, we find you have not demonstrated any portion of the remaining information consists of CHRI for purposes of chapter 411 of the Government Code, and the department may not withhold it under section 552.101 of the Government Code on that basis.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code also encompasses section 411.192 of the Government Code, which governs the release of information maintained by DPS concerning the licensure of an individual to carry a concealed handgun. Section 411.192 provides, in relevant part:

(a) [DPS] shall disclose to a criminal justice agency information contained in its files and records regarding whether a named individual or any individual named in a specified list is licensed under this subchapter. Information on an individual subject to disclosure under this section includes the individual's name, date of birth, gender, race, zip code, telephone number, e-mail address, and Internet website address. Except as otherwise provided by this section and by Section 411.193, all other records maintained under this subchapter are confidential and are not subject to mandatory disclosure under the [Act].

(b) An applicant or license holder may be furnished a copy of disclosable records regarding the applicant or license holder on request and the payment of a reasonable fee.

Id. § 411.192(a)-(b). The remaining information contains concealed handgun license information obtained from DPS. We note the requestor is the license holder. Therefore, except for the name, date of birth, gender, race, and zip code of the requestor, which the department must release pursuant to section 411.192(b) of the Government Code, the department must withhold the concealed handgun license information it marked under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 411.192(a) of the Government Code.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code also encompasses the doctrine of common-law privacy, which protects information that is (1) highly intimate or embarrassing, the

publication of which would be highly objectionable to a reasonable person, and (2) not of legitimate concern to the public. *Indus. Found. v. Tex. Indus. Accident Bd.*, 540 S.W.2d 668, 685 (Tex. 1976). To demonstrate the applicability of common-law privacy, both prongs of this test must be satisfied. *Id.* at 681-82. Types of information considered intimate and embarrassing by the Texas Supreme Court are delineated in *Industrial Foundation*. *Id.* at 683. Additionally, this office has concluded some kinds of medical information are generally highly intimate or embarrassing. See Open Records Decision No. 455 (1987). We note the court of appeals has concluded public citizens' dates of birth are protected by common-law privacy pursuant to section 552.101 of the Government Code. See *Paxton v. Department of Dallas*, No. 03-13-00546-CV, 2015 WL 3394061, at *3 (Tex. App.—Austin May 22, 2015, pet. denied). (mem. op.). Further, this office has found personal financial information not relating to a financial transaction between an individual and a governmental body is generally highly intimate or embarrassing. See, e.g., Open Records Decision Nos. 545 (1990) (common-law privacy protects mortgage payments, assets, bills, and credit history), 523 (1989) (common-law privacy protects credit reports, financial statements, and other personal financial information), 373 (1983) (sources of income not related to financial transaction between individual and governmental body protected under common-law privacy).

Upon review, we find some of the remaining information satisfies the standard articulated by the Texas Supreme Court in *Industrial Foundation*. We note the requestor has a right of access to his client's date of birth, and this information may not be withheld from him under common-law privacy. See Gov't Code § 552.023(a) (person or person's authorized representative has special right of access to records that contain information relating to the person that are protected from public disclosure by laws intended to protect that person's privacy interests); Open Records Decision No. 481 at 4 (1987) (privacy theories not implicated when individuals request information concerning themselves). Accordingly, with the exception of the date of birth belonging to the requestor's client, the department must withhold all public citizens' dates of birth and the information we marked under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy.

Section 552.130 of the Government Code provides information relating to a motor vehicle operator's license, driver's license, motor vehicle title or registration, or personal identification document issued by an agency of this state or another state or country is excepted from public release.¹ See Gov't Code § 552.130. We note section 552.130 protects personal privacy. Accordingly, the requestor has a right of access to her client's own motor vehicle record information under section 552.023 of the Government Code and it may not be withheld from her under section 552.130. See *id.* § 552.023(a); ORD 481 at 4. Therefore, the department must withhold the motor vehicle record information we have under section 552.130 of the Government Code.

¹ The Office of the Attorney General will raise mandatory exceptions on behalf of a governmental body, but ordinarily will not raise other exceptions. See Open Records Decision Nos. 481, 480 (1987), 470 (1987).

Section 552.136(b) of the Government Code provides, “[n]otwithstanding any other provision of [the Act], a credit card, debit card, charge card, or access device number that is collected, assembled, or maintained by or for a governmental body is confidential.” Gov’t Code § 552.136(b); *see id.* § 552.136(a) (defining “access device”). This office has determined an insurance policy number is an access device number for the purposes of section 552.136. *See* Open Records Decision No. 684 (2009). Because section 552.136 protects personal privacy, the requestor has a right of access to her client’s insurance policy number under section 552.023 of the Government Code, and this information may not be withheld from her under section 552.136. *See id.* § 552.023(a); ORD 481 at 4. Thus, the department must withhold the information we have marked under section 552.136 of the Government Code.

In summary, the department must withhold the submitted body worn camera recording under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 1701.661(f) of the Occupations Code. The department must withhold the concealed handgun license information it marked under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 411.192(a) of the Government Code. With the exception of the date of birth belonging to the requestor’s client, the department must withhold all public citizens’ dates of birth and the information we marked under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy. The department must withhold the motor vehicle record information we marked under section 552.130 of the Government Code. The department must withhold the information we have marked under section 552.136 of the Government Code. The department must release the remaining information.²

Finally, the department asks this office to issue a previous determination that would permit it to withhold body worn camera recordings of motor vehicle accidents and collisions involving the investigation of conduct that constitutes a misdemeanor punishable by fine only and that does not result in arrest and that are without written authorization from all subjects of the recordings under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 1701.661(f) of the Occupations Code without seeking a ruling from this office. *See* Gov’t Code § 552.301(a) (allowing governmental body to withhold information subject to previous determination); Open Records Decision No. 673 (2001) (listing elements of second type of previous determination under section 552.301(a) of the Government Code). We decline to issue such a previous determination at this time. Accordingly, this letter ruling is limited to the particular information at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other information or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For more information concerning those rights and

² We note the information being released contains information to which the requestor has a right of access under section 552.023 of the Government Code. *See* Gov’t Code § 552.023(a); ORD 481 at 4. Thus, if the department receives another request for this same information from a different requestor, it must again seek a ruling from this office.

responsibilities, please visit our website at <https://www.texasattorneygeneral.gov/open-government/members-public/what-expect-after-ruling-issued> or call the OAG's Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. Questions concerning the allowable charges for providing public information under the Public Information Act may be directed to the Cost Rules Administrator of the OAG, toll free, at (888) 672-6787.

Sincerely,

Jesse Harvey
Assistant Attorney General
Open Records Division

JHI/mo

Ref: ID# 831726

Enc. Submitted documents

c: Requestor
(w/o enclosures)