



KEN PAXTON
ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS

May 19, 2020

Mr. Carlos G. Madrid
Assistant County Attorney
El Paso County Attorney's Office
500 East San Antonio Room 503
El Paso, Texas 79901

OR2020-13986

Dear Mr. Madrid:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 829151.

The El Paso County Sheriff's Office (the "sheriff's office") received a request for personnel records for ten named former employees of the sheriff's office. The sheriff's office states it is releasing some of the requested information. The sheriff's office claims the submitted information is excepted from disclosure under section 552.101 of the Government Code. We have considered the exception the sheriff's office claims and reviewed the submitted information.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code excepts from disclosure "information considered to be confidential by law, either constitutional, statutory, or by judicial decision." Gov't Code § 552.101. Section 552.101 encompasses section 58.008 of the Family Code, which provides, in part:

(b) Except as provided by Subsection (c), law enforcement records concerning a child and information concerning a child that are stored by electronic means or otherwise and from which a record could be generated may not be disclosed to the public and shall be:

(1) if maintained on paper or microfilm, kept separate from adult records;

(2) if maintained electronically in the same computer system as adult records, accessible only under controls that are separate and distinct from the controls to access electronic data concerning adults; and

(3) maintained on a local basis only and not sent to a central state or federal depository, except as provided by Subsection (c) or Subchapter B, D, or E.

Fam. Code § 58.008(b); *see also id.* § 51.03(a) (defining “delinquent conduct” for purposes of title 3 of Family Code). Section 58.008(b) is applicable to records of juvenile conduct that occurred before, on, or after September 1, 2017. *See* Act of May 28, 2017, 85th Leg., R.S., ch. 746, § 22. The juvenile must have been at least 10 years old and less than 17 years of age when the conduct occurred. *See* Fam. Code § 51.02(2) (defining “child” for purposes of title 3 of Family Code). The information submitted as Attachment B involves a juvenile offender, so as to fall within the scope of section 58.008(b). It does not appear any of the exceptions in section 58.008 apply. Accordingly, the sheriff’s office must withhold Attachment B under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 58.008(b) of the Family Code.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code also encompasses section 1701.454 of the Occupations Code, which governs the public availability of information submitted to the Texas Commission on Law Enforcement (the “commission”) under subchapter J of chapter 1701 of the Occupations Code.¹ Section 1701.454 provides as follows:

- (a) All information submitted to the commission under this subchapter is confidential and is not subject to disclosure under Chapter 552, Government Code, unless the person resigned or was terminated due to substantiated incidents of excessive force or violations of the law other than traffic offenses.
- (b) Except as provided by this subchapter, a commission member or other person may not release information submitted under this subchapter.

Occ. Code § 1701.454. The information submitted as Attachment D includes information that was submitted to the commission pursuant to subchapter J of chapter 1701 of the Occupations Code. Furthermore, the information at issue does not indicate the officers at issue resigned or were terminated due to substantiated incidents of excessive force or violations of the law other than traffic offenses. Therefore, the sheriff’s office must withhold the portions of Attachment D that were created after the effective date of the amendment of section 1701.454 under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 1701.454 of the Occupations Code. *See* Act of May 25, 2005, 79th Leg., R.S., ch. 1298, § 4, 2005 Tex. Gen. Laws 4094, 4096.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code also includes F-5 forms that were created prior to the effective date of the amendment of section 1701.454 by the Seventy-ninth Legislature. *See* Act of May 25, 2005, 79th Leg., R.S., ch. 1298, § 4, 2005 Tex. Gen.

¹ The Texas Commission on Law Enforcement Officer Standards and Education was renamed the Texas Commission on Law Enforcement by the 83rd Legislature. *See* Act of May 6, 2013, 83rd Leg., R.S., ch. 93, § 1.01, 2013 Tex. Gen. Laws 174, 174.

Laws 4094, 4096. Thus, the F-5 forms at issue are governed by the previous version of section 1701.454. *See* Act of May 25, 2005, 79th Leg., R.S., ch. 1298, § 6, 2005 Tex. Gen. Laws 4094, 4096.² Former section 1701.454 provides as follows:

(a) A report or statement submitted to the commission under this subchapter is confidential and is not subject to disclosure under [the Act] unless the person resigned or was terminated due to substantiated incidents of excessive force or violations of the law other than traffic offenses.

(b) Except as provided by this subsection, a commission member or other person may not release the contents of a report or statement submitted under this subchapter. The report or statement may be released only by the commission employee having the responsibility to maintain the report or statement and only if:

(1) the head of a law enforcement agency or the agency head's designee makes a written request on the agency's letterhead for the report or statement accompanied by the agency head's or designee's signature; and

(2) the person who is the subject of the report or statement authorizes the release by providing a sworn statement on a form supplied by the commission that includes the person's waiver of liability regarding an agency head who is responsible for or who takes action based on the report or statement.

Occ. Code. § 1701.454 (repealed 2005). Upon review, we find the remaining information in Attachment D consists of F-5 reports that were created prior to the effective date of the amendment of section 1701.454. This information is not subject to release under the provisions of former section 1701.454. Therefore, the sheriff's office must withhold the remainder of Attachment D under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with former section 1701.454 of the Occupations Code.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code also encompasses information protected by chapter 411 of the Government Code, which makes confidential criminal history record information ("CHRI") generated by the National Crime Information Center or by the Texas Crime Information Center. *See id.* § 411.083(a). Title 28, part 20 of the Code of Federal Regulations governs the release of CHRI that states obtain from the federal government or other states. Open Records Decision No. 565 (1990). The federal regulations allow each state to follow its individual laws with respect to the CHRI it generates. *See id.* Section 411.083 of the Government Code deems confidential CHRI that the Department of Public

² Section 6 of the amending legislation states "[t]he changes in law made by this Act in relation to employment termination reports apply only to an employment termination report under Subchapter J, Chapter 1701, Occupations Code, regarding a resignation or termination that occurs on or after the effective date of this Act. An employment termination report regarding a resignation or termination that occurs before the effective date of this Act is governed by the law as it existed immediately before the effective date and that law is continued in effect for that purpose." Act of May 25, 2005, 79th Leg., R.S., ch. 1298, § 6, 2005 Tex. Gen. Laws 4094, 4096.

Safety (“DPS”) maintains, except that DPS may disseminate this information as provided in chapter 411, subchapter F, or subchapter E-1 of the Government Code. *See* Gov’t Code § 411.083(a). Sections 411.083(b)(1) and 411.089(a) authorize a criminal justice agency to obtain CHRI; however, a criminal justice agency may not release CHRI except to another criminal justice agency for a criminal justice purpose. *Id.* § 411.089(b)(1). Other entities specified in chapter 411 of the Government Code are entitled to obtain CHRI from DPS or another criminal justice agency; however, those entities may not release CHRI except as provided by chapter 411. *See generally id.* §§ 411.090-.127. Thus, any CHRI obtained from DPS or any other criminal justice agency must be withheld under section 552.101 in conjunction with chapter 411, subchapter F, of the Government Code. We note section 411.083 does not apply to active warrant information or other information relating to one’s current involvement with the criminal justice system. *See id.* § 411.081(b) (police department allowed to disclose information pertaining to person’s current involvement in the criminal justice system). Further, CHRI does not include driving record information. *See id.* § 411.082(2)(B). Upon review, we find portions of the information submitted as Attachment C, which we marked, consists of CHRI that is confidential under section 411.083 and federal law. Thus, the sheriff’s office must withhold the information we marked in Attachment C under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 411.083 of the Government Code. However, we find the sheriff’s office has not demonstrated any portion of the remaining information at issue consists of CHRI for purposes of chapter 411 of the Government Code, and the sheriff’s office may not withhold any of the remainder of Attachment C under section 552.101 of the Government Code on that basis.

We note some of the remaining information in Attachment C is subject to sections 552.102 and 552.130 of the Government Code.³ Section 552.102(a) excepts from disclosure “information in a personnel file, the disclosure of which would constitute a clearly unwarranted invasion of personal privacy.” Gov’t Code § 552.102(a). The Texas Supreme Court held section 552.102(a) excepts from disclosure the dates of birth of state employees in the payroll database of the Texas Comptroller of Public Accounts. *Tex. Comptroller of Pub. Accounts v. Attorney Gen. of Tex.*, 354 S.W.3d 336 (Tex. 2010). Accordingly, the sheriff’s office must withhold the employees’ dates of birth we marked in Attachment C under section 552.102(a) of the Government Code.

Section 552.130 of the Government Code provides information relating to a motor vehicle operator’s license, driver’s license, motor vehicle title or registration, or personal identification document issued by an agency of this state or another state or country is excepted from public release. *See* Gov’t Code § 552.130. Accordingly, the sheriff’s office must withhold the motor vehicle record information we marked in Attachment C under section 552.130 of the Government Code.

In summary, the sheriff’s office must withhold Attachment B under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 58.008(b) of the Family Code. The sheriff’s

³ The Office of the Attorney General will raise mandatory exceptions on behalf of a governmental body, but ordinarily will not raise other exceptions. *See* Open Records Decision Nos. 481 (1987), 480 (1987), 470 (1987).

office must withhold the portions of Attachment D that were created after the effective date of the amendment of section 1701.454 under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 1701.454 of the Occupations Code and must withhold the remainder of Attachment D under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with former section 1701.454 of the Occupations Code. The sheriff's office must withhold the information we marked in Attachment C under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 411.083 of the Government Code. The sheriff's office must withhold the employees' dates of birth we marked in Attachment C under section 552.102(a) of the Government Code. The sheriff's office must withhold the motor vehicle record information we marked in Exhibit C under section 552.130 of the Government Code. The sheriff's office must release the remainder of Attachment C.⁴

This letter ruling is limited to the particular information at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other information or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For more information concerning those rights and responsibilities, please visit our website at <https://www.texasattorneygeneral.gov/open-government/members-public/what-expect-after-ruling-issued> or call the OAG's Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. Questions concerning the allowable charges for providing public information under the Public Information Act may be directed to the Cost Rules Administrator of the OAG, toll free, at (888) 672-6787.

Claire V. Morris Sloan
Assistant Attorney General
Open Records Division

CVMS/mo

Ref: ID# 829151

Enc. Submitted documents

c: Requestor
(w/o enclosures)

⁴ The information being released contains social security numbers. Section 552.147(b) of the Government Code authorizes a governmental body to redact a living person's social security number from public release without the necessity of requesting a decision from this office. See Gov't Code § 552.147(b).