



KEN PAXTON
ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS

May 15, 2020

Ms. Cynthia Tynan
Assistant General Counsel & Public Information Coordinator
The University of Texas System
210 West 7th Street
Austin, Texas 78701

OR2020-13809

Dear Ms. Tynan:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 828920 (OGC# 195882).

The University Health Science Center at San Antonio (the "university") received a request for information pertaining to specified agreements. You claim the submitted information is excepted from disclosure under sections 552.101 and 552.104 of the Government Code. We have considered the exceptions you claim and reviewed the submitted information.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code excepts from disclosure "information considered to be confidential by law, either constitutional, statutory, or by judicial decision." Gov't Code § 552.101. Section 552.101 encompasses section 51.914 of the Education Code, which provides, in relevant part, the following:

(a) In order to protect the actual or potential value, the following information is confidential and is not subject to disclosure under [the Act], or otherwise:

(1) all information relating to a product, device, or process, the application or use of such a product, device, or process, and all technological and scientific information (including computer programs) developed in whole or in part at a state institution of higher education, regardless of whether patentable or capable of being registered under copyright or trademark laws, that have a potential for being sold, traded, or licensed for a fee; [or]

(2) any information relating to a product, device, or process, the application or use of such product, device, or process, and any technological and scientific information (including computer programs) that is the proprietary information of a person, partnership, corporation, or federal agency that has been disclosed to an institution of higher education solely for the purposes of a written research contract or grant that contains a provision prohibiting the institution of higher education from disclosing such proprietary information to third persons or parties[.]

...

(b) Information maintained by or for an institution of higher education that would reveal the institution's plans or negotiations for commercialization or a proposed research agreement, contract, or grant, or that consists of unpublished research or data that may be commercialized, is not subject to [the Act], unless the information has been published, is patented, or is otherwise subject to an executed license, sponsored research agreement, or research contract or grant. In this subsection, "institution of higher education" has the meaning assigned by Section 61.003 [of the Education Code].

Educ. Code § 51.914(a)(1)-(2), (b). As noted in Open Records Decision No. 651 (1997), the legislature is silent as to how this office or a court is to determine whether particular scientific information has "a potential for being sold, traded, or licensed for a fee." ORD 651 at 9-10. Furthermore, whether particular scientific information has such a potential is a question of fact that this office is unable to resolve in the opinion process. *See id.* at 10. Thus, this office has stated in considering whether requested information has "a potential for being sold, traded, or licensed for a fee," we will rely on a governmental body's assertion that the information has this potential. *See id.* However, a governmental body's determination that information has a potential for being sold, traded, or licensed for a fee is subject to judicial review. *See id.* We note section 51.914 is not applicable to working titles of experiments or other information that does not reveal the details of the research. *See* Open Records Decision Nos. 557 at 3 (1990), 497 at 6-7 (1988).

You seek to withhold some of the submitted information under section 51.914(a). You state the university is an institution of higher education. *See* Educ. Code § 61.003(8). You state the information at issue reveals details of a university research project. You inform us the information at issue has the potential to be sold, traded, or licensed for a fee. Based on these representations, we conclude the information you marked is confidential under section 51.914(a)(1) of the Education Code. Therefore, the university must withhold the information you have marked under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 51.914(a)(1) of the Education Code.

Section 552.104(a) of the Government Code excepts from disclosure information that a governmental body demonstrates, if released, would "harm its interests by providing an advantage to a competitor or bidder in a particular ongoing competitive situation or in a

particular competitive situation where the governmental body establishes the situation at issue is set to reoccur or there is a specific and demonstrable intent to enter into the competitive situation again in the future.” Gov’t Code § 552.104(a). The “test under section 552.104 is whether knowing another bidder’s [or competitor’s information] would be an advantage, not whether it would be a decisive advantage.” *Boeing Co. v. Paxton*, 466 S.W.3d 831, 841 (Tex. 2015). You explain the information at issue pertains to an agreement for grant funding of a certain university program. You assert the university has specific marketplace interests in the information at issue because the university competes for, among other things, research funding. You explain, “[t]he [u]niversity, as a research and public health institution, will continue to compete with other public and private entities for research and program funding again in the future[.]” You argue release of the information at issue would provide a competitive advantage to the university’s competitors by “reveal[ing] details of the university’s receipt of grant funding for [the program] . . . and would damage the [u]niversity’s current and future ability to obtain additional grant funding for these and similar programs.” Based upon your representations and our review, we find you have demonstrated the university has specific marketplace interests and may be considered a “competitor” for purposes of section 552.104. We also find you have demonstrated release of the information at issue would give advantage to a competitor or bidder. Accordingly, the university may withhold the remaining information under section 552.104(a) of the Government Code.

In summary, the university must withhold the information you have marked under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 51.914(a)(1) of the Education Code. The university may withhold the remaining information under section 552.104(a) of the Government Code.

This letter ruling is limited to the particular information at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other information or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For more information concerning those rights and responsibilities, please visit our website at <https://www.texasattorneygeneral.gov/open-government/members-public/what-expect-after-ruling-issued> or call the OAG’s Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. Questions concerning the allowable charges for providing public information under the Public Information Act may be directed to the Cost Rules Administrator of the OAG, toll free, at (888) 672-6787.

Sincerely,

Alexandra C. Burks
Attorney
Open Records Division

ACB/jxd

Ref: ID# 828920

Enc. Submitted documents

c: Requestor
(w/o enclosures)