



KEN PAXTON  
ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS

May 12, 2020

Ms. Courtney R. Kelly  
Public Information Assistant Coordinator  
Dallas Independent School District  
9400 North Central Expressway  
Dallas, Texas 75231

OR2020-13341

Dear Ms. Kelly:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 827770 (R019293-021920).

The Dallas Independent School District (the "district") received a request for all information regarding a named individual and specified entities during a stated time period. You state the district has released some responsive information. You claim the submitted information is excepted from disclosure under section 552.107 of the Government Code and privileged under rule 503 of the Texas Rules of Evidence. We have considered your arguments and reviewed the submitted information.

Initially, we note some of the submitted information, which we marked, is subject to section 552.022 of the Government Code. Section 552.022(a) provides, in relevant part:

(a) [T]he following categories of information are public information and not excepted from required disclosure unless made confidential under this chapter or other law:

...

(3) information in an account, voucher, or contract relating to the receipt or expenditure of public or other funds by a governmental body[.]

Gov't Code § 552.022(a)(3). The submitted information contains information in accounts, invoices, and purchase orders that is subject to section 552.022(a)(3). Information subject to section 552.022(a)(3) must be released unless such information is made confidential under the Act or other law. *See id.* You seek to withhold this information under section 552.107 of the Government Code. However, this section is a discretionary exception and does not make information confidential under the Act. *See* Open Records Decision Nos. 676 at 10-11 (attorney-client privilege under Gov't Code § 552.107(1) may be waived), 665 at 2 n.5 (2000) (discretionary exceptions generally), 663 at 5 (1999) (waiver of discretionary exceptions). Therefore, the information subject to section 552.022 we marked may not be withheld under section 552.107 of the Government Code. You also seek to withhold the information subject to section 552.022 under rule 503 of the Texas Rules of Evidence. The Texas Supreme Court has held the Texas Rules of Evidence are "other law" within the meaning of section 552.022. *See In re City of Georgetown*, 53 S.W.3d 328, 336 (Tex. 2001). We will therefore consider your assertion of the attorney-client privilege under rule 503 of the Texas Rules of Evidence for the information subject to section 552.022. We will also consider your argument against disclosure of the information not subject to section 552.022.

Texas Rule of Evidence 503(b)(1) provides the following:

A client has a privilege to refuse to disclose and to prevent any other person from disclosing confidential communications made to facilitate the rendition of professional legal services to the client:

- (A) between the client or the client's representative and the client's lawyer or the lawyer's representative;
- (B) between the client's lawyer and the lawyer's representative;
- (C) by the client, the client's representative, the client's lawyer, or the lawyer's representative to a lawyer representing another party in a pending action or that lawyer's representative, if the communications concern a matter of common interest in the pending action;
- (D) between the client's representatives or between the client and the client's representative; or
- (E) among lawyers and their representatives representing the same client.

TEX. R. EVID. 503(b)(1). A communication is "confidential" if it is not intended to be disclosed to third persons other than those to whom disclosure is made in furtherance of the rendition of professional legal services to the client or those reasonably necessary for the transmission of the communication. *Id.* 503(a)(5).

Thus, in order to withhold attorney-client privileged information from disclosure under rule 503, a governmental body must (1) show the document is a communication transmitted between privileged parties or reveals a confidential communication; (2) identify the parties involved in the communication; and (3) show the communication is confidential by explaining it was not intended to be disclosed to third persons and it was made in furtherance of the rendition of professional legal services to the client. Upon a demonstration of all three factors, the information is privileged and confidential under rule 503, provided the client has not waived the privilege or the document does not fall within the purview of the exceptions to the privilege enumerated in rule 503(d). *Huie v. DeShazo*, 922 S.W.2d 920, 923 (Tex. 1996) (privilege extends to entire communication, including facts contained therein).

You assert the information subject to section 552.022(a)(3) of the Government Code consists of privileged attorney-client communications between outside counsel for the district and district employees. You explain the information was created for the purpose of facilitating the rendition of professional legal services to the district. You state the communications were intended to be confidential and indicate that the confidentiality has been maintained. Upon review, we find you have demonstrated the information subject to section 552.022(a)(3) is part of privileged e-mail communications for purposes of rule 503. Accordingly, the district may withhold the information subject to section 552.022(a)(3) of the Government Code pursuant to rule 503 of the Texas Rules of Evidence.

Section 552.107(1) of the Government Code protects information coming within the attorney-client privilege. The elements of the privilege under section 552.107 are the same as those discussed for Texas Rule of Evidence 503. When asserting the attorney-client privilege, a governmental body has the burden of providing the necessary facts to demonstrate the elements of the privilege in order to withhold the information at issue. *See* ORD 676 at 6-7. Section 552.107(1) generally excepts an entire communication that is demonstrated to be protected by the attorney-client privilege unless otherwise waived by the governmental body. *See Huie*, 922 S.W.2d at 923.

You assert section 552.107 for the information not subject to section 552.022 of the Government Code. You state the information consists of communications between outside counsel for the district and district employees that were made for the purpose of facilitating the rendition of professional legal services to the district. You state the communications were intended to be confidential and indicate that the confidentiality has been maintained. Based upon your representations and our review, we find you have demonstrated the applicability of the attorney-client privilege to the information at issue. Accordingly, the district may withhold the information not subject to section 552.022 of the Government Code under section 552.107(1) of the Government Code.

In summary, the district may withhold the information subject to section 552.022(a)(3) of the Government Code pursuant to rule 503 of the Texas Rules of Evidence. The district may withhold the information not subject to section 552.022 of the Government Code under section 552.107(1) of the Government Code.

This letter ruling is limited to the particular information at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other information or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For more information concerning those rights and responsibilities, please visit our website at <https://www.texasattorneygeneral.gov/open-government/members-public/what-expect-after-ruling-issued> or call the OAG's Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. Questions concerning the allowable charges for providing public information under the Public Information Act may be directed to the Cost Rules Administrator of the OAG, toll free, at (888) 672-6787.

Sincerely,

James M. Graham  
Assistant Attorney General  
Open Records Division

JMG/gw

Ref: ID# 827770

Enc. Submitted documents

c: Requestor  
(w/o enclosures)