



KEN PAXTON
ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS

May 1, 2020

Ms. Atalia Anaya
Office Assistant
City of Dallas
1500 Marilla Street L1CS
Dallas, Texas 75201

OR2020-12414

Dear Ms. Anaya:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 831473 (Reference No. C001735).

The City of Dallas (the "city") received a request for information pertaining to a specified incident. You state the city will withhold information pursuant to Open Records Letter Nos. 2011-17075 (2011) and Open Records Decision No. 684.¹ You claim some of the submitted information is excepted from disclosure under sections 552.101 and 552.136 of the Government Code. We have considered the exceptions you claim and reviewed the submitted information.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code excepts from disclosure "information considered to be confidential by law, either constitutional, statutory, or by judicial decision." Gov't Code § 552.101. Section 552.101 encompasses the doctrine of common-law privacy, which protects information that is (1) highly intimate or embarrassing, the publication of which would be highly objectionable to a reasonable person, and (2) not of legitimate concern to the public. *Indus. Found. v. Tex. Indus. Accident Bd.*, 540 S.W.2d 668, 685 (Tex. 1976). To demonstrate the applicability of common-law privacy, both prongs of this test must be

¹ Open Records Letter No. 2011-17075 authorizes the city to withhold, under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 772.318 of the Health and Safety Code, an originating telephone number of a 9-1-1 caller furnished by a service supplier established in accordance with chapter 772 of the Health and Safety Code without the necessity of requesting a ruling from this office. See Gov't Code § 552.301(a); Open Records Decision No. 673 (2001) (listing elements of second type of previous determination under section 552.301(a) of the Government Code). Open Records Decision No. 684 is a previous determination to all governmental bodies authorizing them to withhold certain information, including e-mail addresses of members of the public subject to section 552.137 of the Government Code, without the necessity of requesting an attorney general decision.

satisfied. *Id.* at 681-82. Types of information considered intimate and embarrassing by the Texas Supreme Court are delineated in *Industrial Foundation*. *Id.* at 683. Additionally, this office has concluded some kinds of medical information are generally highly intimate or embarrassing. *See* Open Records Decision No. 455 (1987). Upon review, we find some of the information at issue satisfies the standard articulated by the Texas Supreme Court in *Industrial Foundation*. Accordingly, with the exception of the information we marked for release, the city must withhold the information you marked under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy. However, we find you have failed to demonstrate the remaining information is highly intimate or embarrassing and not of legitimate public concern. Thus, none of the remaining information may be withheld under section 552.101 in conjunction with common-law privacy.

Section 552.136(b) of the Government Code provides, “[n]otwithstanding any other provision of [the Act], a credit card, debit card, charge card, or access device number that is collected, assembled, or maintained by or for a governmental body is confidential.” Gov’t Code § 552.136(b); *see id.* § 552.136(a) (defining “access device”). We understand the employee identification numbers the city marked are used in conjunction with one additional digit to access the city’s credit union bank accounts. Upon review, we agree the city must withhold the information you marked under section 552.136 of the Government Code.

In summary, with the exception of the information we marked for release, the city must withhold the information you marked under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy. The city must withhold the information you marked under section 552.136 of the Government Code. The city must release the remaining information.

This letter ruling is limited to the particular information at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other information or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For more information concerning those rights and responsibilities, please visit our website at <https://www.texasattorneygeneral.gov/open-government/members-public/what-expect-after-ruling-issued> or call the OAG’s Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. Questions concerning the allowable charges for providing public information under the Public Information Act may be directed to the Cost Rules Administrator of the OAG, toll free, at (888) 672-6787.

Sincerely,

Jahna Ward
Assistant Attorney General
Open Records Division

JW/rm

Ms. Atalia Anaya - Page 3

Ref: ID# 831473

Enc. Submitted documents

c: Requestor
(w/o enclosures)