



KEN PAXTON
ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS

April 30, 2020

Mr. Eric Gutierrez
Assistant City Attorney
City of El Paso
P.O. Box 1890
El Paso, Texas 79950-1890

OR2020-12263

Dear Mr. Gutierrez:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 825271 (20-1026-11159).

The El Paso Police Department (the "department") received two requests from the same requestor for information pertaining to two specified incidents. You claim the submitted information is excepted from disclosure under sections 552.101, 552.103, 552.108, and 552.152 of the Government Code.¹ We have considered the exceptions you claim and reviewed the submitted information.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code excepts from disclosure "information considered to be confidential by law, either constitutional, statutory, or by judicial decision." Gov't Code § 552.101. Section 552.101 encompasses section 261.201(a) of the Family Code, which provides as follows:

(a) [T]he following information is confidential, is not subject to public release under [the Act] and may be disclosed only for purposes consistent

¹ Although you also raise section 552.101 in conjunction with common-law privacy and constitutional privacy for the submitted information, you provide no arguments explaining how these doctrines are applicable to the information at issue. Therefore, we assume you no longer assert these doctrines. *See* Gov't Code §§ 552.301, .302.

with this code and applicable federal or state law or under rules adopted by an investigating agency:

- (1) a report of alleged or suspected abuse or neglect made under this chapter and the identity of the person making the report; and
- (2) except as otherwise provided in this section, the files, reports, records, communications, audiotapes, videotapes, and working papers used or developed in an investigation under this chapter or in providing services as a result of an investigation.

Fam. Code § 261.201(a). You state report number 96-041136 was used or developed in an investigation of alleged child abuse or neglect. Based on your representations and our review of the information at issue, we agree report number 96-041136 is subject to section 261.201 of the Family Code. *See id.* § 261.001(1), (4) (defining “abuse” and “neglect” for purposes of Family Code ch. 261); *see also id.* § 101.003(a) (defining “child” for purposes of this section as person under 18 years of age who is not and has not been married or who has not had the disabilities of minority removed for general purposes). As you do not indicate the department has adopted a rule that governs the release of this type of information, we assume no such rule exists. Given that assumption, we conclude the department must withhold report number 96-041136 in its entirety under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 261.201(a) of the Family Code. *See* Open Records Decision No. 440 at 2 (1986) (addressing predecessor statute).

Section 552.108(a)(1) of the Government Code excepts from disclosure “[i]nformation held by a law enforcement agency or prosecutor that deals with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime . . . if . . . release of the information would interfere with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime[.]” Gov’t Code § 552.108(a)(1). A governmental body claiming section 552.108(a)(1) must explain how and why the release of the requested information would interfere with law enforcement. *See id.* §§ 552.108(a)(1), .301(e)(1)(A); *see also Ex parte Pruitt*, 551 S.W.2d 706 (Tex. 1977). You state the remaining information relates to a pending criminal investigation or prosecution. Based upon this representation and our review, we find release of the information at issue would interfere with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime. *See Houston Chronicle Publ’g Co. v. City of Houston*, 531 S.W.2d 177 (Tex. Civ. App.—Houston [14th Dist.] 1975) (delineating law enforcement interests present in active cases), *writ ref’d n.r.e. per curiam*, 536 S.W.2d 559 (Tex. 1976).

However, section 552.108 does not except from disclosure basic information about an arrested person, an arrest, or a crime. Gov’t Code § 552.108(c). Basic information refers to the information held to be public in *Houston Chronicle*. *See* 531 S.W.2d at 186-88; Open Records Decision No. 127 at 3-4 (1976) (summarizing types of information deemed public by *Houston Chronicle*). We note basic information includes, among other items, a detailed

description of the offense, the names of the arresting and investigating officers, and identity of the complainant. *See* ORD 127 at 3-4. However, we note basic information does not include the identities of any witnesses or victims who are not complainants, or the address or telephone number of the complainant, unless the address is the location of the crime. *See id.* Thus, with the exception of basic information, you may withhold the remaining information under section 552.108(a)(1) of the Government Code.²

Section 552.152 of the Government Code provides:

Information in the custody of a governmental body that relates to an employee or officer of the governmental body is excepted from [required public disclosure] if, under the specific circumstances pertaining to the employee or officer, disclosure of the information would subject the employee or officer to a substantial threat of physical harm.

Gov't Code § 552.152. Upon review, we find the department has failed to demonstrate release of any of the information at issue would subject an employee or officer of the department to a substantial threat of physical harm. Therefore, the department may not withhold any of the remaining information under section 552.152 of the Government Code.

In summary, the department must withhold report number 96-041136 under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 261.201(a) of the Family Code. With the exception of basic information, which must be released, the department may withhold the remaining information under section 552.108(a)(1) of the Government Code.³

This letter ruling is limited to the particular information at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other information or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For more information concerning those rights and responsibilities, please visit our website at <https://www.texasattorneygeneral.gov/open-government/members-public/what-expect-after-ruling-issued> or call the OAG's Open

² As we are able to resolve this issue under section 552.108, we do not address your remaining claim against disclosure of the submitted information, except to note basic information may not be withheld from public disclosure under section 552.103 of the Government Code. Open Records Decision No. 597 (1991).

³ We note basic information includes the arrestee's social security number. Section 552.147(b) of the Government Code authorizes a governmental body to redact a living person's social security number without the necessity of requesting a decision from this office under the Act. Gov't Code § 552.147(b). However, in this instance, the requestor has a right of access to his own social security number and it must be released to him. *See generally id.* § 552.023(b) (governmental body may not deny access to person to whom information relates or person's agent on ground that information is considered confidential by privacy principles); Open Records Decision No. 481 at 4 (1987) (privacy theories not implicated when individuals request information concerning themselves).

Mr. Eric Gutierrez - Page 4

Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. Questions concerning the allowable charges for providing public information under the Public Information Act may be directed to the Cost Rules Administrator of the OAG, toll free, at (888) 672-6787.

Sincerely,

Jennifer Copeland
Assistant Attorney General
Open Records Division

JC/mo

Ref: ID# 825271

Enc. Submitted documents

c: Requestor
(w/o enclosures)