



KEN PAXTON  
ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS

April 27, 2020

Ms. Julie Pandya Doshier  
Counsel for City of Allen  
Nichols, Jackson, Dillard, Hager & Smith, LLP  
500 North Akard Street, Suite 1800  
Dallas, Texas 75201

OR2020-11891

Dear Ms. Doshier:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 829724 (File Ref. #114375).

The City of Allen (the "city"), which you represent, received a request for information pertaining to a specified incident. You claim some of the submitted information is excepted from disclosure under sections 552.108, 552.130, 552.136, and 552.147 of the Government Code. We have considered the exceptions you claim and reviewed the submitted information.

Section 552.108(a)(1) of the Government Code excepts from disclosure "[i]nformation held by a law enforcement agency or prosecutor that deals with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime . . . if . . . release of the information would interfere with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime[.]" Gov't Code § 552.108(a)(1). A governmental body claiming section 552.108(a)(1) must explain how and why the release of the requested information would interfere with law enforcement. *See id.* §§ 552.108(a)(1), .301(e)(1)(A); *see also Ex parte Pruitt*, 551 S.W.2d 706 (Tex. 1977). The city states the information at issue pertains to an active criminal investigation or prosecution. Based on this representation, we conclude the release of the information at issue would interfere with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime. *See Houston Chronicle Publ'g Co. v. City of Houston*, 531 S.W.2d 177 (Tex. Civ. App.—Houston [14th Dist.] 1975) (court delineates law enforcement interests that are present in active cases), *writ ref'd n.r.e. per curiam*, 536 S.W.2d 559 (Tex. 1976). Thus, the city may withhold the information you marked under section 552.108(a)(1) of the Government Code.

You state you will redact some information under section 552.130(c) of the Government Code.<sup>1</sup> We note some of the motor record vehicle record information you marked pertains to a deceased individual. Section 552.130 of the Government Code provides information relating to a motor vehicle operator's license, driver's license, motor vehicle title or registration, or personal identification document issued by an agency of this state or another state or country is excepted from public release. See Gov't Code § 552.130. We note section 552.130 protects personal privacy. Because the right of privacy lapses at death, motor vehicle record information pertaining solely to a deceased individual may not be withheld under section 552.130. See *Moore v. Charles B. Pierce Film Enters., Inc.*, 589 S.W.2d 489, 491 (Tex. Civ. App.—Texarkana 1979, writ ref'd n.r.e.); see also *Justice v. Belo Broad. Corp.*, 472 F. Supp. 145, 147 (N.D. Tex. 1979) (“action for invasion of privacy can be maintained only by a living individual whose privacy is invaded” (quoting RESTATEMENT (SECOND) OF TORTS § 6521 (1977))); Attorney General Opinions JM-229 (1984) (“the right of privacy lapses upon death”), H-917 (1976) (“We are . . . of the opinion that the Texas courts would follow the almost uniform rule of other jurisdictions that the right of privacy lapses upon death.”); Open Records Decision No. 272 (1981) (“the right of privacy is personal and lapses upon death”). Accordingly, the city must withhold the motor vehicle record information we marked under section 552.130 of the Government Code. However, the remaining information you marked pertains to a deceased individual and may not be withheld under section 552.130 of the Government Code.

You state you will redact certain information pursuant to section 552.136(c) of the Government Code.<sup>2</sup> Section 552.136 of the Government Code provides, “[notwithstanding any other provision of [the Act], a credit card, debit card, charge card, or access device number that is collected, assembled, or maintained by or for a governmental body is confidential.” Gov't Code § 552.136(b); see *id.* § 552.136(a) (defining “access device”). We note the purpose of section 552.136 is to protect privacy interests. As previously discussed, the right to privacy is a personal right that lapses at death and account numbers pertaining solely to a deceased individual may not be withheld under section 552.136. See *Moore*, 589 S.W.2d at 491; see also Attorney General Opinions JM-229, H-917; ORD 272. Accordingly, to the extent a living person has an interest in the account at issue, the city must withhold the information you marked under section 552.136 of the Government Code.

You state you will redact social security numbers pursuant to section 552.147(b) of the Government Code.<sup>3</sup> However, we note the social security number you marked pertains to a deceased individual. Section 552.147(a) of the Government Code excepts the social

---

<sup>1</sup> Section 552.130(c) of the Government Code allows a governmental body to redact the information described in section 552.130(a) without the necessity of seeking a decision from the attorney general. Gov't Code § 552.130(c). If a governmental body redacts such information, it must notify the requestor in accordance with section 552.130(e). See *id.* § 552.130(d), (e).

<sup>2</sup> Section 552.136 of the Government Code permits a governmental body to withhold the information described in section 552.136(b) without the necessity of seeking a decision from this office. See Gov't Code § 552.136(c). If a governmental body redacts such information, it must notify the requestor in accordance with section 552.136(e). See *id.* § 552.136(d), (e).

<sup>3</sup> Section 552.147(b) of the Government Code authorizes a governmental body to redact a living person's social security number from public release without the necessity of requesting a decision from this office. See Gov't Code § 552.147(b).

security number of a living individual from public disclosure. Gov't Code § 552.147(a). Section 552.147 does not apply to a deceased individual. The social security number you marked in the remaining information does not pertain to a living individual and the city may not withhold that information under section 552.147 of the Government Code.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code excepts from disclosure “information considered to be confidential by law, either constitutional, statutory, or by judicial decision.”<sup>4</sup> *Id.* § 552.101. Section 552.101 encompasses the doctrine of common-law privacy. *Indus. Found. v. Tex. Indus. Accident Bd.*, 540 S.W.2d 668, 685 (Tex. 1976). Under the common-law right of privacy, an individual has a right to be free from the publicizing of private affairs in which the public has no legitimate concern. *Id.* at 682. The Third Court of Appeals has concluded public citizens’ dates of birth are protected by common-law privacy pursuant to section 552.101. *See Paxton v. City of Dallas*, No. 03-13-00546-CV, 2015 WL 3394061, at \*3 (Tex. App.—Austin May 22, 2015, pet. denied) (mem. op.). Thus, the city must withhold the public citizen’s date of birth we marked under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy.

In summary, the city may withhold the information you marked under section 552.108(a)(1) of the Government Code. The city must withhold the motor vehicle record information we marked under section 552.130 of the Government Code. To the extent a living person has an interest in the account at issue, the city must withhold the information you marked under section 552.136 of the Government Code. The city must withhold the public citizen’s date of birth we marked under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy. The city must release the remaining information.

This letter ruling is limited to the particular information at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other information or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For more information concerning those rights and responsibilities, please visit our website at <https://www.texasattorneygeneral.gov/open-government/members-public/what-expect-after-ruling-issued> or call the OAG’s Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. Questions concerning the allowable charges for providing public information under the Public Information Act may be directed to the Cost Rules Administrator of the OAG, toll free, at (888) 672-6787.

Sincerely,

Meagan Hunter  
Assistant Attorney General  
Open Records Division

MH/rm

---

<sup>4</sup> The Office of the Attorney General will raise a mandatory exception on behalf of a governmental body, but ordinarily will not raise other exceptions. *See* Open Records Decision Nos. 481 (1987), 480 (1987), 470 (1987).

Ref: ID# 829724

Enc. Submitted documents

c: Requestor  
(w/o enclosures)