



KEN PAXTON
ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS

April 24, 2020

Ms. Susan Camp-Lee
Counsel for City of Round Rock
Sheets & Crossfield, P.L.L.C.
309 East Main Street
Round Rock, Texas 78664-5246

OR2020-11686

Dear Ms. Camp-Lee:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 824251 (ORR# W011280-020320).

The City of Round Rock (the "city"), which you represent, received a request for a specified bid proposal. Although the city takes no position as to whether the submitted information is excepted under the Act, the city states release of the submitted information may implicate the proprietary interests of Star Shuttle, Inc. ("Star Shuttle"). Accordingly, the city states, and provides documentation showing, it notified Star Shuttle of the request for information and of the right to submit arguments to this office as to why the submitted information should not be released. *See* Gov't Code § 552.305(d); *see also* Open Records Decision No. 542 (1990) (statutory predecessor to section 552.305 permits governmental body to rely on interested third party to raise and explain applicability of exception in the Act in certain circumstances). We received comments from Star Shuttle. We have reviewed the submitted arguments and the submitted information.

Initially, we note Star Shuttle seeks to withhold information not submitted to this office by the city. By statute, this office may only rule on the public availability of information submitted by the governmental body requesting the ruling. *See* Gov't Code § 552.301(e)(1)(D) (governmental body requesting decision from Attorney General must submit copy of specific information requested). Because this information was not submitted by the city, this ruling does not address this information and is limited to the information submitted as responsive by the city.¹

¹ Although Star Shuttle also raises section 552.101 of the Government Code, it makes no arguments to support this exception. Therefore, we assume Star Shuttle has withdrawn its claim that this section applies to the submitted information. *See* Gov't Code §§ 552.301, .302.

Section 552.110(b) of the Government Code states “information is [excepted from required disclosure] if it is demonstrated based on specific factual evidence that the information is a trade secret.” *See* Gov’t Code § 552.110(b). Section 552.110(a) defines a trade secret as all forms and types of information if:

(1) the owner of the trade secret has taken reasonable measures under the circumstances to keep the information secret; and

(2) the information derives independent economic value, actual or potential, from not being generally known to, and not being readily ascertainable through proper means by, another person who can obtain economic value from the disclosure or use of the information.

Id. § 552.110(a). Star Shuttle argues some of its information consists of trade secrets subject to section 552.110(b). Upon review, we find Star Shuttle has demonstrated portions of the information at issue constitute trade secrets. Accordingly, to the extent Star Shuttle’s customer information is not publicly available on its website, the city must withhold Star Shuttle’s customer information under section 552.110(b) of the Government Code. However, we find Star Shuttle has failed to provide specific factual evidence demonstrating any portion of the remaining information at issue is a trade secret. Therefore, the city may not withhold any of the remaining information at issue under section 552.110(b) of the Government Code.

Section 552.136 of the Government Code provides, “Notwithstanding any other provision of [the Act], a credit card, debit card, charge card, or access device number that is collected, assembled, or maintained by or for a governmental body is confidential.”¹ *Id.* § 552.136(b); *see id.* § 552.136(a) (defining “access device”). This office has determined insurance policy numbers are access device numbers for purposes of section 552.136. Accordingly, the city must withhold the insurance policy numbers within the submitted information under section 552.136 of the Government Code.

Star Shuttle also argues the materials at issue are protected by copyright. A custodian of public records must comply with the copyright law and is not required to furnish copies of records that are copyrighted. Open Records Decision No. 180 at 3 (1977). A governmental body must allow inspection of copyrighted materials unless an exception applies to the information. *Id.*; *see* Open Records Decision No. 109 (1975). If a member of the public

¹The Office of the Attorney General will raise a mandatory exception on behalf of a governmental body, but ordinarily will not raise other exceptions. *See* Open Records Decision Nos. 481 (1987), 480 (1987), 470 (1987).

wishes to make copies of copyrighted materials, the person must do so unassisted by the governmental body. In making copies, the member of the public assumes the duty of compliance with the copyright law and the risk of a copyright infringement suit.

In summary, to the extent Star Shuttle's customer information is not publicly available on its website, the city must withhold Star Shuttle's customer information under section 552.110(b) of the Government Code. The city must withhold the insurance policy numbers within the submitted information under section 552.136 of the Government Code. The city must release the remaining information; however, any information that is subject to copyright may be released only in accordance with copyright law.

This letter ruling is limited to the particular information at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other information or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For more information concerning those rights and responsibilities, please visit our website at <https://www.texasattorneygeneral.gov/open-government/members-public/what-expect-after-ruling-issued> or call the OAG's Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. Questions concerning the allowable charges for providing public information under the Public Information Act may be directed to the Cost Rules Administrator of the OAG, toll free, at (888) 672-6787.

Sincerely,

Katie Stallcup
Attorney
Open Records Division

AKS/mo

Ref: ID# 824251

Enc. Submitted documents

c: Requestor
(w/o enclosures)

Third Party
(w/o enclosures)