



KEN PAXTON
ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS

April 23, 2020

Ms. Atalia Anaya
Office Assistant
City of Dallas
1500 Marilla Street, L1CS
Dallas, Texas 75201

OR2020-11593

Dear Ms. Anaya:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 829958 (Reference No. C002241).

The City of Dallas (the "city") received a request for information pertaining to a specified incident. You claim the submitted information is excepted from disclosure under sections 552.101, 552.130, and 552.136 of the Government Code.¹ We have considered the exceptions you claim and reviewed the submitted information.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code excepts from disclosure "information considered to be confidential by law, either constitutional, statutory, or by judicial decision." Gov't Code § 552.101. Section 552.101 encompasses the doctrine of common-law privacy, which protects information that is (1) highly intimate or embarrassing, the publication of which would be highly objectionable to a reasonable person, and (2) not of legitimate concern to the public. *Indus. Found. v. Tex. Indus. Accident Bd.*, 540 S.W.2d 668, 685 (Tex. 1976). To demonstrate the applicability of common-law privacy, both prongs of this test must be satisfied. *Id.* at 681-82. Types of information considered intimate and embarrassing by the Texas Supreme Court are delineated in *Industrial Foundation*. *Id.* at 683. Additionally, this office has concluded some kinds of medical information are generally highly intimate or embarrassing. See Open Records Decision No. 455 (1987). The court of appeals has concluded public citizens' dates of birth are protected by common-law privacy pursuant to section 552.101. See *Paxton v. City of Dallas*, No. 03-13-00546-CV, 2015 WL 3394061, at *3 (Tex. App.—Austin May 22, 2015, pet. denied) (mem. op.). This office has also found personal financial information not relating to a financial transaction between an

¹ We understand you to raise sections 552.130 and 552.136 of the Government Code based on your markings.

individual and a governmental body is excepted from required public disclosure under common-law privacy. See Open Records Decision Nos. 600 (1992) (designation of beneficiary of employee's retirement benefits, direct deposit authorization, and forms allowing employee to allocate pretax compensation to group insurance, health care or dependent care), 545 (1990) (deferred compensation information, participation in voluntary investment program, election of optional insurance coverage, mortgage payments, assets, bills, and credit history). Upon review, we find portions of the submitted information satisfy the standard articulated by the Texas Supreme Court in *Industrial Foundation*. Thus, with the exception of the information we marked for release, the city must withhold the information you marked under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy. However, we find you have failed to demonstrate the remaining information is highly intimate or embarrassing and not of legitimate public concern. Thus, none of the remaining information may be withheld under section 552.101 in conjunction with common-law privacy.

Section 552.130 of the Government Code provides information relating to a motor vehicle operator's license, driver's license, motor vehicle title or registration, or personal identification document issued by an agency of this state or another state or country is excepted from public release. Gov't Code § 552.130. Accordingly, with the exception we marked for release, the city must withhold the motor vehicle record information you marked under section 552.130 of the Government Code. However, we find you have failed to demonstrate the remaining information at issue is subject to section 552.130. Thus, the city may not withhold the remaining information at issue on that basis.

Section 552.136 of the Government Code provides, "[notwithstanding any other provision of [the Act], a credit card, debit card, charge card, or access device number that is collected, assembled, or maintained by or for a governmental body is confidential." *Id.* § 552.136(b); *see id.* § 552.136(a) (defining "access device"). This office has concluded insurance policy numbers constitute access device numbers for purposes of section 552.136. Open Records Decision No. 684 (2009). We understand the submitted employee identification numbers are used in conjunction with one additional digit to access city credit union bank accounts. We therefore conclude the city must withhold the insurance policy number and all employee identification numbers in the remaining information under section 552.136 of the Government Code.

In summary, with the exception of the information we marked for release, the city must withhold the information you marked under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy. With the exception we marked for release, the city must withhold the motor vehicle record information you marked under section 552.130 of the Government Code. The city must withhold the insurance policy number and all employee identification numbers in the remaining information under section 552.136 of the Government Code. The city must release the remaining information.

This letter ruling is limited to the particular information at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other information or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For more information concerning those rights and responsibilities, please visit our website at <https://www.texasattorneygeneral.gov/open-government/members-public/what-expect-after-ruling-issued> or call the OAG's Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. Questions concerning the allowable charges for providing public information under the Public Information Act may be directed to the Cost Rules Administrator of the OAG, toll free, at (888) 672-6787.

Sincerely,

Jahnna Ward
Assistant Attorney General
Open Records Division

JW/rm

Ref: ID# 829958

Enc. Submitted documents

c: Requestor
(w/o enclosures)