



KEN PAXTON
ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS

April 23, 2020

Mr. Christopher Duncan
Counsel for the City of Clute
Duncan Law Firm
104 West Myrtle, Suite 218
Angleton, Texas 77515

OR2020-11592

Dear Mr. Duncan:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 829819.

The City of Clute (the "city"), which you represent, received a request for information pertaining to a specified incident. You claim the submitted information is excepted from disclosure under section 552.108 of the Government Code. We have considered the exception you claim and reviewed the submitted information.

Initially, we must address the city's obligations under section 552.301 of the Government Code, which prescribes the procedures a governmental body must follow in asking this office to decide whether requested information is excepted from public disclosure. *See* Gov't Code § 552.301. Pursuant to section 552.301(b), a governmental body must ask for a decision from this office and state the exceptions that apply within ten business days of receiving the written request. *See id.* § 552.301(b). In this instance, the city received the instant request for information on February 26, 2020. Accordingly, the city's ten-business-day deadline was March 11, 2020. However, the envelope in which the city provided the information required by section 552.301(b) was postmarked March 17, 2020. *See id.* § 552.308(a)(1) (describing rules for calculating submission dates of documents sent via first class United States mail, common or contract carrier, or interagency mail). Accordingly, we conclude the city failed to comply with the procedural requirements mandated by section 552.301 of the Government Code.

Pursuant to section 552.302 of the Government Code, a governmental body's failure to comply with the procedural requirements of section 552.301 results in the legal presumption that the requested information is public and must be released unless there is a

compelling reason to withhold the information from disclosure. *See id.* § 552.302; *Simmons v. Kuzmich*, 166 S.W.3d 342, 350 (Tex. App.—Fort Worth 2005, no pet.); *Hancock v. State Bd. of Ins.*, 797 S.W.2d 379, 381 (Tex. App.—Austin 1990, no writ). The need of a governmental body, other than the governmental body that failed to timely seek an open records decision, to withhold information under section 552.108 of the Government Code can provide a compelling reason sufficient to overcome the presumption of openness. *See* Open Records Decision No. 586 (1991). Because you inform us, and provide documentation showing, the Brazoria County District Attorney's Office (the "district attorney's office") objects to the release of the information at issue, we will consider whether the city may withhold the submitted information under section 552.108 of the Government Code on behalf of the district attorney's office. Additionally, section 552.101 can provide a compelling reason to overcome the presumption of openness. Accordingly, we will also address the applicability of this section to the information at issue.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code excepts from disclosure "information considered to be confidential by law, either constitutional, statutory, or by judicial decision." Gov't Code § 552.101. Section 552.101 encompasses information subject to chapter 550 of the Transportation Code. Section 550.065 applies only to a written report of an accident required under section 550.061, 550.062, or 601.004. Transp. Code § 550.065(a)(1). Chapter 550 requires the creation of a written report when the accident resulted in injury to or the death of a person or damage to the property of any person to the apparent extent of \$1,000 or more. *Id.* §§ 550.061 (operator's accident report), .062 (officer's accident report). An accident report is privileged and for the confidential use of the Texas Department of Transportation or a local governmental agency of Texas that has use for the information for accident prevention purposes. *Id.* § 550.065(b). However, a governmental entity shall release an accident report in accordance with subsections (c) and (c-1). *Id.* 550.065(c), (c 1). Section 550.065(c) provides a governmental entity shall release an accident report to a person or entity listed under this subsection. *Id.* § 550.065(c).

The submitted information includes a CR-3 peace officer's crash report. In this instance, we note the requestor may be the authorized representative of a person involved in the accident at issue. *See id.* § 550.065(c)(4)(A) (B). As we are unable to determine whether the requestor is a person listed under section 550.065(c), we must rule conditionally. If the requestor is a person listed under section 550.065(c), then the requestor has a right of access to the submitted CR 3 accident report. Although you assert section 552.108 to withhold the information, a statutory right of access prevails over the Act's general exceptions to public disclosure. *See, e.g.,* Open Records Decision Nos. 613 at 4 (1993) (exceptions in Act cannot impinge on statutory right of access to information), 451 (1986) (specific statutory right of access provisions overcome general exception to disclosure under the Act). Because section 552.108 is a general exception under the Act, the requestor's statutory access under section 550.065(c) prevails and the city may not withhold the CR 3 accident report under section 552.108 of the Government Code. Thus, if the requestor is a person listed under section 550.065(c), then the city must release the CR 3 accident report to the requestor pursuant to section 550.065(c).

If the requestor is not a person listed under section 550.065(c), then the submitted accident report is confidential under section 550.065(b), and the city must withhold it under section

552.101 of the Government Code. However, section 550.065(c 1) requires the city to create a redacted accident report that may be requested by any person. Transp. Code § 550.065(c 1). The redacted accident report may not include the information listed in subsection (c)(2). *Id.* Therefore, in that instance, the requestor has a right of access to the redacted accident report. As noted above, although you assert section 552.108 to withhold the information, a statutory right of access prevails over the Act's general exceptions to public disclosure, and the city may not withhold the information under section 552.108 of the Government Code. *See, e.g.,* ORDs 613 at 4, 451. Thus, if the requestor is not a person listed under section 550.065(c), then the city must release the redacted accident report pursuant to section 550.065(c 1) of the Transportation Code.

Section 552.108(a)(1) of the Government Code excepts from disclosure “[i]nformation held by a law enforcement agency or prosecutor that deals with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime . . . if . . . release of the information would interfere with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime[.]” Gov’t Code § 552.108(a)(1). A governmental body that claims an exception to disclosure under section 552.108(a)(1) must explain how and why this exception is applicable to the information at issue. *See id.* §§ 552.108(a)(1), .301(e)(1)(A); *ex parte Pruitt*, 551 S.W.2d 706 (Tex. 1977). You state, and provide documentation showing, the district attorney’s office asserts the information at issue relates to a pending criminal investigation. Based upon your representation and our review, we find release of the information at issue would interfere with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime. *See Houston Chronicle Publ’g Co. v. City of Houston*, 531 S.W.2d 177 (Tex. Civ. App.—Houston [14th Dist.] 1975) (court delineates law enforcement interests that are present in active cases), *writ ref’d n.r.e. per curiam*, 536 S.W.2d 559 (Tex. 1976). Thus, section 552.108(a)(1) is applicable to the remaining information.

However, section 552.108 does not except from disclosure basic information about an arrested person, an arrest, or a crime. *Id.* § 552.108(c). Basic information refers to the information held to be public in *Houston Chronicle*. *See* 531 S.W.2d at 186-88; *see also* Open Records Decision No. 127 at 3-4 (1976) (summarizing types of information deemed public by *Houston Chronicle*). Thus, with the exception of basic information, the city may withhold the remaining information under section 552.108(a)(1) of the Government Code.

In summary, if the requestor is a person listed under section 550.065(c) of the Transportation Code, then the city must release the CR 3 accident report pursuant to section 550.065(c) of the Transportation Code. If the requestor is not a person listed under section 550.065(c), then the city must withhold the CR-3 accident report under section 552.101 in conjunction with section 550.065(c) of the Transportation Code, but must release the redacted accident report pursuant to section 550.065(c 1) of the Transportation Code. With the exception of basic information, which must be released, the city may withhold the remaining information under section 552.108(a)(1) of the Government Code on behalf of the district attorney’s office.

This letter ruling is limited to the particular information at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other information or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For more information concerning those rights and responsibilities, please visit our website at <https://www.texasattorneygeneral.gov/open-government/members-public/what-expect-after-ruling-issued> or call the OAG's Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. Questions concerning the allowable charges for providing public information under the Public Information Act may be directed to the Cost Rules Administrator of the OAG, toll free, at (888) 672-6787.

Sincerely,

Jahna Ward
Assistant Attorney General
Open Records Division

JW/rm

Ref: ID# 829819

Enc. Submitted documents

c: Requestor
(w/o enclosures)