



KEN PAXTON
ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS

April 20, 2020

Ms. Stephanie Berry
Assistant City Attorney
City of Denton
215 East McKinney Street
Denton, Texas 76201-4299

OR2020-11289

Dear Ms. Berry:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 827272.

The City of Denton (the "city") received a request for all reports involving two named individuals, including a specified report. You claim the submitted information is excepted from disclosure under sections 552.101 and 552.108 of the Government Code.¹ We have considered the exceptions you claim and reviewed the submitted information.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code excepts from disclosure "information considered to be confidential by law, either constitutional, statutory, or by judicial decision." Gov't Code § 552.101. Section 552.101 encompasses the doctrine of common-law privacy, which protects information that (1) contains highly intimate or embarrassing facts the publication of which would be highly objectionable to a reasonable person, and (2) is not of legitimate concern to the public. *Indus. Found. v. Tex. Indus. Accident Bd.*, 540 S.W.2d 668, 685 (Tex. 1976). To demonstrate the applicability of common-law privacy, both prongs of this test must be satisfied. *Id.* at 681-82. A compilation of an individual's criminal history is highly embarrassing information, the publication of which would be highly objectionable to a reasonable person. *Cf. U.S. Dep't of Justice v. Reporters Comm. for Freedom of the Press*, 489 U.S. 749, 764 (1989) (finding significant privacy interest in compilation of individual's criminal history by recognizing distinction between public records found in courthouse files and local police stations and compiled summary of criminal history

¹ Although you also raise section 552.103 of the Government Code, you have not submitted arguments explaining how this exception applies to the submitted information. Therefore, we presume you have withdrawn your claim under this exception. See Gov't Code §§ 552.301, 552.302.

information). Furthermore, we find a compilation of a private citizen's criminal history is generally not of legitimate concern to the public.

The requestor asks, in part, for all information held by the city concerning two named individuals. Therefore, to the extent the city maintains any unspecified law enforcement information depicting either of the named individuals as a suspect, arrestee, or criminal defendant, such information is excepted from disclosure under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy. However, the requestor also asks for information pertaining to a specific incident. Because the requestor specifically asks for this information, it is not part of a compilation of either individual's criminal history and may not be withheld on that basis. Further, information that refers to an individual solely as a victim, witness, or involved person is not part of a compilation of the individual's criminal history and may not be withheld under section 552.101 on that basis. We note you have submitted information in which neither of the named individuals are depicted as a suspect, arrestee, or criminal defendant. Therefore, this information is not confidential under common-law privacy, and the city may not withhold it under section 552.101 of the Government Code on that basis. Accordingly, we will address your arguments against disclosure of this information.

Section 552.108(a)(2) of the Government Code excepts from disclosure information concerning an investigation that concluded in a result other than conviction or deferred adjudication. Gov't Code § 552.108(a)(2). A governmental body claiming section 552.108(a)(2) must demonstrate the information at issue relates to a criminal investigation that has concluded in a final result other than conviction or deferred adjudication. *See id.* §§ 552.108(a)(2), .301(e)(1)(A). You state the information at issue pertains to closed criminal investigations that did not result in convictions or deferred adjudications. Therefore, we agree section 552.108(a)(2) is applicable to the information at issue.

However, section 552.108 does not except from disclosure "basic information about an arrested person, an arrest, or a crime." Gov't Code § 552.108(c). Section 552.108(c) refers to the basic "front-page" information held to be public in *Houston Chronicle Publishing Co. v. City of Houston*, 531 S.W.2d 177 (Tex. Civ. App.—Houston [14th Dist.] 1975), *writ ref'd n.r.e. per curiam*, 536 S.W.2d 559 (Tex. 1976). *See also* Open Records Decision No. 127 (1976) (summarizing types of information considered to be basic information). We note basic information does not include dates of birth. *See* ORD 127 at 3-4. Thus, with the exception of basic information, the city may withhold the information at issue under section 552.108(a)(2) of the Government Code.²

In summary, to the extent the city maintains any unspecified law enforcement information depicting either of the named individuals as a suspect, arrestee, or criminal defendant, the city must withhold such information under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy. With the exception of basic information, which must be released, the city may withhold the information at issue under section 552.108(a)(2) of the Government Code.

² As our ruling is dispositive, we need not address your remaining argument against disclosure of this information.

This letter ruling is limited to the particular information at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other information or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For more information concerning those rights and responsibilities, please visit our website at <https://www.texasattorneygeneral.gov/open-government/members-public/what-expect-after-ruling-issued> or call the OAG's Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. Questions concerning the allowable charges for providing public information under the Public Information Act may be directed to the Cost Rules Administrator of the OAG, toll free, at (888) 672-6787.

Sincerely,

Kieran Hillis
Assistant Attorney General
Open Records Division

KH/jlbm

Ref: ID# 827272

Enc. Submitted documents

c: Requestor
(w/o enclosures)