



**KEN PAXTON**  
ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS

April 16, 2020

Ms. Amy L. Sims  
Assistant City Attorney  
City of Lubbock  
P.O. Box 2000  
Lubbock, Texas 79457

OR2020-11092

Dear Ms. Sims:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 822705 (ORR# 2695).

The Lubbock Police Department (the "department") received a request for information related to a specified incident. You claim the submitted information is excepted from disclosure under sections 552.101, 552.108, and 552.1175 of the Government Code. We have considered the exceptions you claim and reviewed the submitted representative sample of information.<sup>1</sup>

Initially, we note the submitted information includes grand jury subpoenas and information obtained pursuant to grand jury subpoenas. The Act applies only to information that is "written, produced, collected, assembled, or maintained under a law or ordinance or in connection with the transaction of official business . . . by a governmental body[.]" Gov't Code § 552.002(a)(1). The judiciary is expressly excluded from the requirements of the Act. *Id.* § 552.003(1)(B). This office has determined for purposes of the Act, a grand jury is a part of the judiciary and therefore not subject to the Act. *See* Open Records Decision No. 411 (1984). Further, records kept by a governmental body that is acting as an agent for

---

<sup>1</sup> We assume the representative sample of records submitted to this office is truly representative of the requested records as a whole. *See* Open Records Decision Nos. 499 (1988), 497 (1988). This open records letter does not reach, and therefore does not authorize the withholding of, any other requested records to the extent those records contain substantially different types of information than that submitted to this office.

a grand jury are considered records in the constructive possession of the grand jury, and are also not subject to the Act. *See* Open Records Decisions Nos. 513 (1988), 411, 398 (1983). Thus, to the extent the department holds the information at issue solely as an agent of the grand jury, such information consists of records of the judiciary that are not subject to disclosure under the Act and the department is not required to release that information in response to the instant request. To the extent the department holds the information at issue in its own capacity and not solely as an agent of the grand jury, we will address the department's argument against its disclosure.

Next, we note the remaining information includes court-filed documents. Section 552.022(a)(17) of the Government Code provides for required public disclosure of "information that is also contained in a public court record[,]" unless the information is expressly made confidential under the Act or other law. Gov't Code § 552.022(a)(17). The department seeks to withhold the information at issue under section 552.108 of the Government Code. However, this section is a discretionary exception to disclosure that protects a governmental body's interests and does not make information confidential under the Act. *See id.* § 552.007; Open Records Decision Nos. 665 at 2 n.5 (2000) (discretionary exceptions generally), 177 at 3 (1977) (statutory predecessor to section 552.108 subject to waiver). Therefore, the department may not withhold the court-filed documents, which we marked, under section 552.108. We also note common-law privacy is not applicable to information contained in public court records. *See Star-Telegram v. Walker*, 834 S.W.2d 54 (Tex. 1992). Therefore, no portion of the submitted court-filed documents may be withheld under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy. However, because sections 552.1175, and 552.130 of the Government Code make information confidential for purposes of section 552.022, we will address the applicability of these sections to the court-filed documents subject to section 552.022(a)(17).<sup>2</sup> Further, we will address your arguments against disclosure of the remaining information.

We also note the submitted information includes CR-3 accident reports that are subject to chapter 550 of the Transportation Code. Section 550.065 applies only to a written report of an accident required under section 550.061, 550.062, or 601.004. *See* Transp. Code § 550.065(a)(1). Chapter 550 requires the creation of a written report when the accident resulted in injury to or the death of a person or damage to the property of any person to the apparent extent of \$1,000 or more. *Id.* §§ 550.061 (operator's accident report), .062 (officer's accident report). An accident report is privileged and for the confidential use of the Texas Department of Transportation or a local governmental agency of Texas that has use for the information for accident prevention purposes. *Id.* § 550.065(b). However, a governmental entity shall release an accident report in accordance with subsections (c) and (c-1). *Id.* § 550.065(c), (c-1). Section 550.065(c) provides a governmental entity shall release an accident report to a person or entity listed under this subsection. *Id.* § 550.065(c).

In this instance, the requestor is a person listed under section 550.065(c). Although you assert sections 552.108 and 552.1175 to withhold the information, a statutory right of access prevails over the Act's general exceptions to public disclosure. *See, e.g.,* Open Records

---

<sup>2</sup> The Office of the Attorney General will raise mandatory exceptions on behalf of a governmental body, but ordinarily will not raise other exceptions. Open Records Decision Nos. 481 (1987), 480 (1987), 470 (1987).

Decision Nos. 613 at 4 (1993) (exceptions in Act cannot impinge on statutory right of access to information), 451 (1986) (specific statutory right of access provisions overcome general exception to disclosure under the Act). Because section 552.108 and section 552.1175 are general exception under the Act, the requestor's statutory access under section 550.065(c) prevails, and the department may not withhold the information at issue under section 552.108 or section 552.1175 of the Government Code. Further, although the department also raises section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy for the information at issue, we note a statutory right of access prevails over the common law. *See Collins v. Tex. Mall, L.P.*, 297 S.W.3d 409, 415 (Tex. App.—Fort Worth, 2009, no pet.) (statutory provision controls and preempts common law only when statute directly conflicts with common-law principle). Thus, the department must release the CR-3 accident reports in their entirety to the requestor pursuant to section 550.065(c) of the Transportation Code.

Section 552.108(a)(1) of the Government Code excepts from disclosure “[i]nformation held by a law enforcement agency or prosecutor that deals with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime . . . if . . . release of the information would interfere with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime[.]” Gov’t Code § 552.108(a)(1). Generally, a governmental body claiming section 552.108(a)(1) must explain how and why the release of the requested information would interfere with law enforcement. *See id.* §§ 552.108(a)(1), .301(e)(1)(A); *see also Ex parte Pruitt*, 551 S.W.2d 706 (Tex. 1977). You state the information at issue relates to a pending criminal prosecution, and release of the information would interfere with the investigation and prosecution of the case. Based upon your representation, we conclude release of the information you have marked would interfere with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime. *See Houston Chronicle Publ’g Co. v. City of Houston*, 531 S.W.2d 177 (Tex. Civ. App.—Houston [14th Dist.] 1975) (court delineates law enforcement interests that are present in active cases), *writ ref’d n.r.e. per curiam*, 536 S.W.2d 559 (Tex. 1976). Thus, we find section 552.108(a)(1) is applicable to the remaining information at issue.

However, section 552.108 does not except from disclosure “basic information about an arrested person, an arrest, or a crime.” Gov’t Code § 552.108(c). Section 552.108(c) refers to the basic “front-page” information held to be public in *Houston Chronicle*. *See* 531 S.W.2d at 186-187. *See also* Open Records Decision No. 127 (1976) (summarizing types of information considered basic information). Accordingly, with the exception of the basic information and the information subject to section 552.022(a)(17) of the Government Code, the department may withhold the remaining information under section 552.108(a)(1) of the Government Code.<sup>3</sup>

Section 552.101 of the Government Code excepts “information considered to be confidential by law, either constitutional, statutory, or by judicial decision.” Gov’t Code § 552.101. Section 552.202 of the Government Code encompasses the doctrine of common-

---

<sup>3</sup> As we are able to make this determination, we do not address the applicability of section 1701.661(a) of the Occupations Code to the submitted body worn camera video recordings. *See generally* Occ. Code § 1701.661(a), (e). We also note as our ruling is dispositive, we need not address the remaining arguments against disclosure of this information.

law privacy, which protects information that is (1) highly intimate or embarrassing, the publication of which would be highly objectionable to a reasonable person, and (2) not of legitimate concern to the public. *Indus. Found. v. Tex. Indus. Accident Bd.*, 540 S.W.2d 668, 685 (Tex. 1976). To demonstrate the applicability of common-law privacy, both prongs of this test must be satisfied. *Id.* at 681-82. Types of information considered intimate and embarrassing by the Texas Supreme Court are delineated in *Industrial Foundation*. *Id.* at 683. Upon review, we find the department has not demonstrated any of the basic information at issue is highly intimate or embarrassing and not of legitimate public concern. Thus, the department may not withhold any portion of the basic information under section 552.101 in conjunction with common-law privacy.

Section 552.1175 of the Government Code protects the home address, home telephone number, emergency contact information, date of birth, social security number, and family member information of certain individuals, when that information is held by a governmental body in a non-employment capacity and the individual elects to keep the information confidential. Gov't Code § 552.1175. Upon review, we find the department has failed to demonstrate the applicability of section 552.1175 to any portion of the basic information, and the department may not withhold it on that basis.

Section 552.130 of the Government Code excepts from disclosure information relating to a motor vehicle operator's or driver's license, motor vehicle title or registration, or personal identification document issued by an agency of this state or another state or country. *See Id.* § 552.130. Accordingly, the department must withhold the motor vehicle record information we marked under section 552.130 of the Government Code.

In summary, to the extent the department holds the information at issue solely as an agent of the grand jury, such information consists of records of the judiciary that are not subject to disclosure under the Act and the department is not required to release that information in response to the instant request. The department must release the CR-3 accident reports in their entireties to the requestor pursuant to section 550.065(c) of the Transportation Code. With the exception of the basic information and the information subject to section 552.022(a)(17) of the Government Code, which must be released, the department may withhold the remaining information under section 552.108(a)(1) of the Government Code. In releasing the information subject to section 552.022(a)(17) of the Government Code, the city must withhold the motor vehicle record information we marked under section 552.130 of the Government Code.

This letter ruling is limited to the particular information at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other information or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For more information concerning those rights and responsibilities, please visit our website at <https://www.texasattorneygeneral.gov/open-government/members-public/what-expect-after-ruling-issued> or call the OAG's Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. Questions concerning the allowable

charges for providing public information under the Public Information Act may be directed to the Cost Rules Administrator of the OAG, toll free, at (888) 672-6787.

Sincerely,

Sean McCormick  
Attorney  
Open Records Division

SMC/eb

Ref: ID# 822705

Enc. Submitted documents

c: Requestor  
(w/o enclosures)