



KEN PAXTON
ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS

April 13, 2020

Mr. John B. Strong
Assistant City Attorney
City of Fort Worth
200 Texas Street, Third Floor
Fort Worth, Texas 76102

Mr. Christopher K. Austria
Assistant City Attorney
City of Fort Worth
1000 Throckmorton Street, Third Floor
Fort Worth, Texas 76102

OR2020-10678

Dear Mr. Strong and Mr. Austria:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 821856 (ORR Nos. W096772 & W097309).¹

The Fort Worth Police Department (the "department") received two requests from the same requestor for information related to six specified incidents involving a named individual. We understand the department will redact dates of birth of members of the public pursuant to the previous determination issued in Open Records Letter No. 2016-00620 (2016).² We also understand the department will redact certain criminal history record information pursuant to the previous determination issued to the city in Open Records Letter No. 2013-

¹ This office initially assigned identification numbers 821856 and 823904 to the department's separate requests for ruling. These requests have been combined and are being issued as one ruling with the identification number noted above.

² Open Records Letter No. 2016-00620 authorizes the department to withhold public citizens' dates of birth under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy without requesting an attorney general decision. See Open Records Decision No. 673 at 7-8 (2001) (listing elements of second type of previous determination under section 552.301(a) of the Government Code).

22304 (2013).³ The department states it is releasing some of the requested information. The department claims some of the submitted information is excepted from disclosure under sections 552.101 and 552.108 of the Government Code.⁴ We have considered the exceptions the department claims and reviewed the submitted information.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code excepts from public disclosure “information considered to be confidential by law, either constitutional, statutory, or by judicial decision.” Gov’t Code § 552.101. This section encompasses information protected by section 261.201 of the Family Code, which provides, in part, as follows:

(a) [T]he following information is confidential, is not subject to public release under Chapter 552, Government Code, and may be disclosed only for purposes consistent with this code and applicable federal or state law or under rules adopted by an investigating agency:

- (1) a report of alleged or suspected abuse or neglect made under this chapter and the identity of the person making the report; and
- (2) except as otherwise provided in this section, the files, reports, records, communications, audiotapes, videotapes, and working papers used or developed in an investigation under this chapter or in providing services as a result of an investigation.

Fam. Code § 261.201(a). Case number 190078457 was used or developed in an investigation of alleged or suspected child abuse or neglect conducted by the department. *See id.* §§ 101.003(a) (defining “child” for purposes of this section as person under 18 years of age who is not and has not been married or who has not had the disabilities of minority removed for general purposes), 261.001(1), (4) (defining “abuse” and “neglect” for purposes of chapter 261 of the Family Code). Accordingly, we find this information is subject to chapter 261 of the Family Code. The department does not indicate it has adopted a rule that governs the release of this type of information and therefore we assume no such regulation exists. Given that assumption, we conclude the department must generally withhold case number 190078457 under section 552.101 of the Government Code in

³ Open Records Letter No. 2013-22304 is a previous determination issued to the department authorizing it to withhold FBI numbers under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 411.083 of the Government Code without the necessity of requesting an attorney general decision. *See* ORD 673 at 7-8.

⁴ The department acknowledges it did not comply with section 552.301 of the Government Code in requesting a ruling from this office. *See* Gov’t Code § 552.301(b), (e). Nonetheless, because section 552.101 of the Government Code can provide a compelling reason to overcome the presumption of openness, we will consider its applicability to the submitted information. *See id.* §§ 552.007, .302, .352. Further, the need of a law enforcement agency other than the agency that is seeking an open records decision to withhold information under section 552.108 of the Government Code can provide a compelling reason sufficient to overcome the presumption of openness. *See* Open Records Decision No. 586 at 3 (1991). Accordingly, we will consider whether the department may withhold the submitted information on behalf of another law enforcement agency.

conjunction with section 261.201 of the Family Code.⁵ See Open Records Decision No. 440 at 2 (1986) (predecessor statute).

Section 552.108(a)(1) of the Government Code excepts from disclosure “[i]nformation held by a law enforcement agency or prosecutor that deals with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime . . . if . . . release of the information would interfere with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime[.]” Gov’t Code § 552.108(a)(1). A governmental body claiming section 552.108(a)(1) must explain how and why the release of the requested information would interfere with law enforcement. See *id.* §§ 552.108(a)(1), .301(e)(1)(A); see also *Ex parte Pruitt*, 551 S.W.2d 706 (Tex. 1977). The department states case number 190055842 pertains to an active criminal investigation and prosecution, and informs us the Tarrant County District Attorney’s Office objects to release of the information because such release would interfere with the investigation and prosecution of the matter at issue. Based on this representation, we conclude the release of the information at issue would interfere with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime. See *Houston Chronicle Publ’g Co. v. City of Houston*, 531 S.W.2d 177 (Tex. Civ. App.—Houston [14th Dist.] 1975) (court delineates law enforcement interests that are present in active cases), *writ ref’d n.r.e. per curiam*, 536 S.W.2d 559 (Tex. 1976). Thus, section 552.108(a)(1) is applicable to case number 190055842.

However, we note section 552.108 does not except from disclosure basic information about an arrested person, an arrest, or a crime. Gov’t Code § 552.108(c). Basic information refers to the information held to be public in *Houston Chronicle*. See 531 S.W.2d at 186-88; Open Records Decision No. 127 (1976) (summarizing types of information considered to be basic information). Thus, with the exception of the basic information, the department may generally withhold case number 190055842 under section 552.108(a)(1) of the Government Code.

However, we note the requestor is a representative of the Probation and Pretrial Services Office for the United States District Court for the Northern District of Texas (the “probation office”) and may have a right of access to some of the information at issue. Section 261.201 provides information encompassed by subsection (a) may be disclosed “for purposes consistent with [the Family Code] and applicable federal or state law.” Fam. Code § 261.201(a). Chapter 411 of the Government Code constitutes “applicable state law” in this instance. Section 411.089(a) of the Government Code provides “[a] criminal justice agency is entitled to obtain from the [Texas Department of Public Safety (“DPS”)] any criminal history record information [(“CHRI”)] maintained by the [DPS] about a person.” Gov’t Code § 411.089(a); see also *id.* § 411.083(b)(1) (providing DPS shall grant criminal justice agencies access to CHRI). In addition, section 411.087(a)(2) of the Government Code provides the following:

(a) [A] person, agency, department, political subdivision, or other entity that is authorized by this subchapter or Subchapter E-1 to obtain from the [DPS

⁵ As our ruling is dispositive for this information, we need not address the remaining argument against its disclosure.

CHRI] maintained by the [DPS] that relates to another person is authorized to:

...

(2) obtain from any other criminal justice agency in this state [CHRI] maintained by that criminal justice agency that relates to that person.

Id. § 411.087(a)(2). CHRI is defined as “information collected about a person by a criminal justice agency that consists of identifiable descriptions and notations of arrests, detentions, indictments, informations, and other formal criminal charges and their dispositions.” *See id.* § 411.082(2). Thus, the submitted information contains CHRI. A criminal justice agency that receives CHRI from another criminal justice agency pursuant to section 411.087(a)(2) may only receive such information for a criminal justice purpose. *See id.* §§ 411.083(c), .087(b)); *see also* Open Records Decision No. 655 (1997) (discussing limitations on release of CHRI). Section 411.082 defines a “criminal justice agency” as including “a federal or state agency that is engaged in the administration of criminal justice under a statute or executive order and that allocates a substantial portion of its annual budget to the administration of criminal justice[.]” Gov’t Code § 411.082(3)(A). “Administration of criminal justice” has the meaning assigned by article 66.001 of the Code of Criminal Procedure. *See id.* § 411.082(1). Article 66.001 of the Code of Criminal Procedure defines “[a]dministration of criminal justice” as the “detection, apprehension, detention, pretrial release, post-trial release, prosecution, adjudication, correctional supervision, or rehabilitation of an offender. The term includes criminal identification activities and the collection, storage, and dissemination of [CHRI].” Crim. Proc. Code art. 66.001(1).

We note the probation office is a criminal justice agency as defined by section 411.082. *See* Gov’t Code § 411.082(3)(A). We also understand the probation office intends to use the information at issue for a criminal justice purpose. Thus, the requestor is generally; authorized to obtain CHRI from the department pursuant to section 411.087(a)(2) of the Government Code, however, the requestor may obtain CHRI from case number 190078457 only for purposes consistent with the Family Code. *See* Gov’t Code §§ 411.083(c), .087(a)(2); *see also* Fam. Code § 261.201(a). Accordingly, the department must generally withhold case number 190078457 under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 261.201 of the Family Code; however, if the department determines release of the CHRI is consistent with the Family Code, then the department must release CHRI from case number 190078457 pursuant to section 411.087 of the Government Code. *See* Fam. Code § 261.201(b)-(g), (k) (listing entities authorized to receive section 261.201 information); Open Records Decision Nos. 655, 440 at 2 (1986) (construing predecessor statute). With the exception of CHRI and the basic information, which must be released from case number 190055842, the department may withhold case number 190055842 under section 552.108(a)(1) of the Government Code.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code also encompasses the doctrine of common-law privacy, which protects information that is (1) highly intimate or embarrassing, the publication of which would be highly objectionable to a reasonable person, and (2) not of legitimate concern to the public. *Indus. Found. v. Tex. Indus. Accident Bd.*, 540 S.W.2d

668, 685 (Tex. 1976). To demonstrate the applicability of common-law privacy, both prongs of this test must be satisfied. *Id.* at 681-82. Types of information considered intimate and embarrassing by the Texas Supreme Court are delineated in *Industrial Foundation*. *Id.* at 683. Upon review, we agree the information the department marked in case number 13-87015 satisfies the standard articulated by the Texas Supreme Court in *Industrial Foundation*. Therefore, the department must withhold the information it marked under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy.

We note some of the remaining information is subject to section 552.130 of the Government Code.⁶ Section 552.130 provides information relating to a motor vehicle operator's license, driver's license, motor vehicle title or registration, or personal identification document issued by an agency of this state or another state or country is excepted from public release. *See* Gov't Code § 552.130. Accordingly, the department must withhold the motor vehicle record information we marked under section 552.130 of the Government Code.

In summary, the department must generally withhold case number 190078457 under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 261.201(a) of the Family Code; however, if the department determines release of the CHRI is consistent with the Family Code, then the department must release the CHRI from case number 190078457 pursuant to section 411.087 of the Government Code. With the exception of CHRI, which the department must release from case number 190055842 pursuant to section 411.087 of the Government Code, and the basic information, the department may withhold case number 190055842 under section 552.108(a)(1) of the Government Code. The department must withhold the information it marked in case number 13-87015 under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy and must withhold the motor vehicle record information we marked in case number 13-87015 under section 552.130 of the Government Code. The department must release the remaining information.⁷

This letter ruling is limited to the particular information at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other information or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For more information concerning those rights and responsibilities, please visit our website at <https://www.texasattorneygeneral.gov/open-government/members-public/what-expect-after-ruling-issued> or call the OAG's Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. Questions concerning the allowable

⁶ The Office of the Attorney General will raise a mandatory exception on behalf of a governmental body, but ordinarily will not raise other exceptions. *See* Open Records Decision Nos. 481 (1987), 480 (1987), 470 (1987).

⁷ The information being released contains social security numbers. Section 552.147(b) of the Government Code authorizes a governmental body to redact a living person's social security number from public release without the necessity of requesting a decision from this office. *See* Gov't Code § 552.147(b).

charges for providing public information under the Public Information Act may be directed to the Cost Rules Administrator of the OAG, toll free, at (888) 672-6787.

Sincerely,

Claire V. Morris Sloan
Assistant Attorney General
Open Records Division

CVMS/be

Ref: ID# 821856

Enc. Submitted documents

c: Requestor
(w/o enclosures)