



**KEN PAXTON**  
ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS

April 3, 2020

Mr. Mehran Jadidi  
Assistant City Attorney  
City of Galveston  
P.O. Box 779  
Galveston, Texas 77553-0779

OR2020-10286

Dear Mr. Jadidi:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 821425 (ORR# W006991).

The City of Galveston (the "city") received a request for information related to a specified investigation. The city claims some of the submitted information is excepted from disclosure under sections 552.101, 552.1085, and 552.130 of the Government Code.<sup>1</sup> We have considered the exceptions the city claims and reviewed the submitted information.

Initially, we note the city has redacted information from the submitted documents. The city indicates it has redacted motor vehicle record information pursuant to section 552.130(c) of the Government Code.<sup>2</sup> However, the city has also redacted dates of birth from the submitted documents. The city does not assert, nor does our review of the records indicate, it has been authorized to withhold this information without seeking a ruling from this office. *See Gov't Code § 552.301(a); Open Records Decision No. 673 (2001).* Therefore, information must be submitted in a manner that enables this office to determine whether

---

<sup>1</sup> Although the city does not raise section 552.101 or section 552.130 of the Government Code in its brief, we understand the city to raise these exceptions based on its markings.

<sup>2</sup> Section 552.130(c) of the Government Code allows a governmental body to redact the information described in subsection 552.130(a) without the necessity of seeking a decision from the attorney general. *See Gov't Code § 552.130(c).* If a governmental body redacts such information, it must notify the requestor in accordance with section 552.130(e). *See id.* § 552.130(d), (e).

the information comes within the scope of an exception to disclosure. In this instance, we can discern the nature of the redacted information; thus, being deprived of this information does not inhibit our ability to make a ruling. In the future, however, the city should refrain from redacting any information it is not authorized to withhold in seeking an open records ruling. Failure to do so may result in the presumption the redacted information is public. *See* Gov't Code § 552.302.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code excepts “information considered to be confidential by law, either constitutional, statutory, or by judicial decision.” Gov't Code § 552.101. Section 552.101 encompasses the doctrine of common-law privacy, which protects information that is (1) highly intimate or embarrassing, the publication of which would be highly objectionable to a reasonable person, and (2) not of legitimate concern to the public. *Indus. Found. v. Tex. Indus. Accident Bd.*, 540 S.W.2d 668, 685 (Tex. 1976). To demonstrate the applicability of common-law privacy, both prongs of this test must be satisfied. *Id.* at 681-82. Types of information considered intimate and embarrassing by the Texas Supreme Court are delineated in *Industrial Foundation*. *Id.* at 683. Additionally, this office has concluded some kinds of medical information are generally highly intimate or embarrassing. *See* Open Records Decision No. 455 (1987). The Third Court of Appeals has concluded public citizens' dates of birth are protected by common-law privacy pursuant to section 552.101. *See Paxton v. City of Dallas*, No. 03-13-00546-CV, 2015 WL 3394061, at \*3 (Tex. App.—Austin May 22, 2015, pet. denied) (mem. op.). Upon review, we find some of the submitted information satisfies the standard articulated by the Texas Supreme Court in *Industrial Foundation*. Therefore, the city must withhold the information we marked under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy. With the exception of the requestor's date of birth, to which the requestor has a right of access pursuant to section 552.023 of the Government Code, the city must also withhold all living public citizens' dates of birth under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy. *See* Gov't Code § 552.023(a) (“person's authorized representative has special right of access, beyond right of general public, to information held by governmental body that relates to person and that is protected from public disclosure by laws intended to protect that person's privacy interests”); Open Records Decision No. 481 at 4 (1987) (privacy theories not implicated when individual requests information concerning herself).

Section 552.1085 of the Government Code provides, in relevant part, the following:

(c) A sensitive crime scene image in the custody of a governmental body is confidential and excepted from the requirements of Section 552.021 and a governmental body may not permit a person to view or copy the image except as provided by this section. This section applies to any sensitive crime scene image regardless of the date that the image was taken or recorded.

Gov't Code § 552.1085(c). For purposes of section 552.1085, “sensitive crime scene image” means “a photograph or video recording taken at a crime scene, contained in or part of a closed criminal case, that depicts a deceased person in a state of dismemberment,

decapitation, or similar mutilation or that depicts the deceased person's genitalia." *See id.* § 552.1085(a)(6). Upon review, we find the submitted photographs do not consist of sensitive crime scene images for the purposes of section 552.1085. Accordingly, the city may not withhold the submitted photographs under section 552.1085(c) of the Government Code.

Section 552.130 of the Government Code provides information relating to a motor vehicle operator's license, driver's license, motor vehicle title or registration, or personal identification document issued by an agency of this state or another state or country is excepted from public release. *See Gov't Code* § 552.130. Accordingly, the city must withhold the motor vehicle record information it marked and the additional information we marked under section 552.130 of the Government Code.

In summary, the city must withhold the information we marked under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy. With the exception of the requestor's date of birth, the city must also withhold all living public citizens' dates of birth under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy. The city must withhold the motor vehicle record information it marked and the additional information we marked under section 552.130 of the Government Code. The city must release the remaining information to this requestor.<sup>3</sup>

This letter ruling is limited to the particular information at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other information or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For more information concerning those rights and responsibilities, please visit our website at <https://www.texasattorneygeneral.gov/open-government/members-public/what-expect-after-ruling-issued> or call the OAG's Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. Questions concerning the allowable charges for providing public information under the Public Information Act may be directed to the Cost Rules Administrator of the OAG, toll free, at (888) 672-6787.

Sincerely,

Claire V. Morris Sloan  
Assistant Attorney General  
Open Records Division

CVMS/jlbm

---

<sup>3</sup> We note the requestor has a right of access to some of the information being released. *See Gov't Code* § 552.023(a); ORD 481 at 4. Thus, if the city receives another request for the same information from a different requestor, the city must again seek a decision from this office.

Mr. Mehran Jadidi - Page 4

Ref: ID# 821425

Enc. Submitted documents

c: Requestor  
(w/o enclosures)