



KEN PAXTON
ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS

March 19, 2020

Mr. Adam Anderson
Assistant County Attorney
Montgomery County
501 North Thompson, Suite 300
Conroe, Texas 77301

OR2020-08638

Dear Mr. Anderson:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 817463 (File No. 19PIA543).

The Montgomery County Constable's Office, Precinct 4 (the "constable's office") received a request for specified information related to the Vacation Watch program and a named officer's complete personnel file. You claim some of the submitted information is not subject to the Act. You claim the remaining information is excepted from disclosure under sections 552.101, 552.102, 552.108, 552.115, 552.117, and 552.130 of the Government Code. We have considered the submitted arguments and reviewed the submitted information.

The submitted information includes officers' Texas Commission on Law Enforcement ("TCOLE") identification numbers. Section 552.002(a) of the Government Code defines "public information" as the following:

[] Information that is written, produced, collected, assembled, or maintained under a law or ordinance or in connection with the transaction of official business:

(1) by a governmental body;

(2) for a governmental body and the governmental body:

(A) owns the information;

(B) has a right of access to the information; or

(C) spends or contributes public money for the purpose of writing, producing, collecting, assembling, or maintaining the information; or

(3) by an individual officer or employee of a governmental body in the officer's or employee's official capacity and the information pertains to official business of the governmental body.

Gov't Code § 552.002(a). In Open Records Decision No. 581 (1990), this office determined certain computer information, such as source codes, documentation information, and other computer programming, that has no significance other than its use as a tool for the maintenance, manipulation, or protection of public property is not the kind of information made public under section 552.021 of the Government Code. You state an officer's TCOLE identification number is a unique computer-generated number assigned to peace officers for identification in TCOLE's electronic database, and may be used as an access device number on the TCOLE website. Thus, we find the officers' TCOLE numbers do not constitute public information under section 552.002 of the Government Code. Therefore, the officers' TCOLE numbers are not subject to the Act and need not be released to the requestor.

Next, we note the constable's office has not submitted information responsive to the request for information related to the Vacation Watch program. To the extent any information responsive to this portion of the request existed on the date the constable's office received the request, we assume the constable's office has released it. If the constable's office has not released any such information, it must do so at this time. *See id.* §§ 552.301(a), .302; *see also* Open Records Decision No. 664 (2000) (if governmental body concludes no exceptions apply to requested information, it must release information as soon as possible).

Section 552.101 of the Government Code excepts from disclosure "information considered to be confidential by law, either constitutional, statutory, or by judicial decision." Gov't Code § 552.101. This section encompasses information protected by other statutes. Section 1701.306 of the Occupations Code makes confidential L-2 Declaration of Medical Condition and L-3 Declaration of Psychological and Emotional Health forms required by TCOLE. Section 1701.306 provides, in part:

(a) [TCOLE] may not issue a license to a person as an officer or county jailer unless the person is examined by:

(1) a licensed psychologist or by a psychiatrist who declares in writing that the person is in satisfactory psychological and emotional health to serve as the type of officer for which a license is sought; and

(2) a licensed physician who declares in writing that the person does not show any trace of drug dependency or illegal drug use after a physical examination, blood test, or other medical test.

(b) An agency hiring a person for whom a license as an officer or county jailer is sought shall select the examining physician and the examining psychologist or psychiatrist. The agency shall prepare a report of each declaration required by Subsection (a) and shall maintain a copy of the report on file in a format readily accessible to [TCOLE]. A declaration is not public information.

Occ. Code § 1701.306(a)-(b). Therefore, the constable's office must withhold the submitted L-2 and L-3 declaration forms we marked under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 1701.306 of the Occupations Code.¹

Section 552.101 of the Government Code also encompasses information protected by chapter 411 of the Government Code, which makes confidential criminal history record information ("CHRI") generated by the National Crime Information Center or by the Texas Crime Information Center. *See* Gov't Code § 411.083(a). Title 28, part 20 of the Code of Federal Regulations governs the release of CHRI that states obtain from the federal government or other states. Open Records Decision No. 565 (1990). The federal regulations allow each state to follow its individual laws with respect to the CHRI it generates. *See id.* Section 411.083 of the Government Code deems confidential CHRI that the Department of Public Safety ("DPS") maintains, except that DPS may disseminate this information as provided in chapter 411, subchapter F, or subchapter E-1 of the Government Code. *See* Gov't Code § 411.083(a). Sections 411.083(b)(1) and 411.089(a) authorize a criminal justice agency to obtain CHRI; however, a criminal justice agency may not release CHRI except to another criminal justice agency for a criminal justice purpose. *Id.* § 411.089(b)(1). Other entities specified in chapter 411 of the Government Code are entitled to obtain CHRI from DPS or another criminal justice agency; however, those entities may not release CHRI except as provided by chapter 411. *See generally id.* §§ 411.090-.127. Thus, any CHRI obtained from DPS or any other criminal justice agency must be withheld under section 552.101 in conjunction with chapter 411, subchapter F, of the Government Code. Upon review, we find a portion of the remaining information consists of CHRI that is confidential under section 411.083. Thus, the constable's office must withhold the information we marked under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 411.083 of the Government Code.²

Section 552.101 of the Government Code also encompasses section 1324a of title 8 of the United States Code. Section 1324a governs I-9 forms and their related documents. This section provides an I-9 form and "any information contained in or appended to such form, may not be used for purposes other than for enforcement of this chapter" and for

¹ As our ruling is dispositive, we need not address your remaining arguments against disclosure of this information.

² As our ruling is dispositive, we need not address your remaining arguments against disclosure of this information.

enforcement of other federal statutes governing crime and criminal investigations. *See* 8 U.S.C. § 1324a(b)(5); *see also* 8 C.F.R. § 274a.2(b)(4). Accordingly, the constable's office must withhold the submitted I-9 form under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 1324a of title 8 of the United States Code.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code also encompasses information protected by other statutes, such as section 6103(a) of title 26 of the United States Code, which renders federal tax return information confidential. *See* Attorney General Opinion H-1274 (1978) (tax returns); Open Records Decision No. 600 (1992) (W-4 forms), 226 (1979) (W-2 forms). Section 6103(b) defines the term "return information" as follows:

a taxpayer's identity, the nature, source, or amount of his income, payments, receipts, deductions, exemptions, credits, assets, liabilities, net worth, tax liability, tax withheld, deficiencies, overassessments, or tax payments . . . or any other data, received by, recorded by, prepared by, furnished to, or collected by the Secretary [of the Treasury] with respect to a return or with respect to the determination of the existence, or possible existence, of liability . . . for any tax, penalty, interest, fine, forfeiture, or other imposition, or offense[.]

26 U.S.C. § 6103(b)(2)(A). Federal courts have construed the term "return information" expansively to include any information gathered by the Internal Revenue Service regarding a taxpayer's liability under title 26 of the United States Code. *See Mallas v. Kolak*, 721 F.Supp. 748, 754 (M.D.N.C. 1989), *dismissed in part, aff'd in part, vacated in part, and remanded*, 993 F.2d 1111 (4th Cir. 1993). Accordingly, the constable's office must withhold the W-4 form under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 6103(a) of title 26 of the United States Code.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code also encompasses section 1701.454 of the Occupations Code, which governs the public availability of information submitted to TCOLE under subchapter J of chapter 1701 of the Occupations Code. Section 1701.454 provides as follows:

(a) All information submitted to [TCOLE] under this subchapter is confidential and is not subject to disclosure under [the Act], unless the person resigned or was terminated due to substantiated incidents of excessive force or violations of the law other than traffic offenses.

(b) Except as provided by this subchapter, a [TCOLE] member or other person may not release information submitted under this subchapter.

Occ. Code. § 1701.454. The remaining information contains an F-5 Report of Separation of Licensee. The information at issue does not indicate the officer at issue resigned or was terminated due to substantiated incidents of excessive force or violations of the law other than traffic offenses. Therefore, the constable's office must withhold the F-5 report we

marked under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 1701.454 of the Occupations Code.³

Section 552.101 of the Government Code also encompasses information protected by section 560.003 of the Government Code, which provides, “[a] biometric identifier in the possession of a governmental body is exempt from disclosure under [the Act].” Gov’t Code § 560.003; *see id.* § 560.001(1) (“biometric identifier” means retina or iris scan, fingerprint, voiceprint, or record of hand or face geometry). There is no indication the requestor has a right of access to the submitted fingerprints under section 560.002. *See id.* § 560.002(1)(A) (governmental body may not sell, lease, or otherwise disclose individual’s biometric identifier to another person unless the individual consents to disclosure). Accordingly, the constable’s office must withhold the fingerprints we marked under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 560.003 of the Government Code.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code also encompasses information made confidential by the Medical Practice Act (“MPA”), subtitle B of title 3 of the Occupations Code, which governs release of medical records. Section 159.002 of the MPA provides, in relevant part:

(a) A communication between a physician and a patient, relative to or in connection with any professional services as a physician to the patient, is confidential and privileged and may not be disclosed except as provided by this chapter.

(b) A record of the identity, diagnosis, evaluation, or treatment of a patient by a physician that is created or maintained by a physician is confidential and privileged and may not be disclosed except as provided by this chapter.

(c) A person who receives information from a confidential communication or record as described by this chapter, other than a person listed in Section 159.004 who is acting on the patient’s behalf, may not disclose the information except to the extent that disclosure is consistent with the authorized purposes for which the information was first obtained.

Occ. Code § 159.002(a)-(c). Information subject to the MPA includes both medical records and information obtained from those medical records. *See id.* §§ 159.002, .004. This office has concluded the protection afforded by section 159.002 extends only to records created by either a physician or someone under the supervision of a physician. *See Open Records Decision Nos. 487 (1987), 370 (1983), 343 (1982).*

Upon review, we find a portion of the remaining information, which we marked, constitutes records of the identity, diagnosis, evaluation, or treatment of a patient by a physician that were created or are maintained by a physician and information obtained from a patient’s

³As our ruling is dispositive, we need not address your remaining arguments against disclosure of this information.

medical records. Accordingly, the constable's office must withhold the information we marked under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with the MPA.

Section 552.102(a) of the Government Code excepts from disclosure "information in a personnel file, the disclosure of which would constitute a clearly unwarranted invasion of personal privacy." Gov't Code § 552.102(a). The Texas Supreme Court has considered the applicability of section 552.102, and has held section 552.102(a) excepts from disclosure the dates of birth of state employees in the payroll database of the Texas Comptroller of Public Accounts. *Tex. Comptroller of Pub. Accounts v. Attorney Gen. of Tex.*, 354 S.W.3d 336, 348 (Tex. 2010). Upon review, we find the constable's office must withhold the date of birth you marked under section 552.102(a) of the Government Code.⁴

Section 552.101 of the Government Code also encompasses the doctrine of common-law privacy, which protects information that is (1) highly intimate or embarrassing, the publication of which would be highly objectionable to a reasonable person, and (2) not of legitimate concern to the public. *Indus. Found. v. Tex. Indus. Accident Bd.*, 540 S.W.2d 668, 685 (Tex. 1976). To demonstrate the applicability of common-law privacy, both prongs of this test must be satisfied. *Id.* at 681-82. Types of information considered intimate and embarrassing by the Texas Supreme Court are delineated in *Industrial Foundation*. *Id.* at 683. This office has found personal financial information not relating to a financial transaction between an individual and a governmental body is generally highly intimate or embarrassing. See Open Records Decision Nos. 523 (1989) (common-law privacy protects credit reports, financial statements, and other personal financial information), 373 (1983) (sources of income not related to financial transaction between individual and governmental body protected under common-law privacy). Additionally, this office has concluded some kinds of medical information are generally highly intimate or embarrassing. See Open Records Decision No. 455 (1987). Upon review, we find the information we marked satisfies the standard articulated by the Texas Supreme Court in *Industrial Foundation*. Accordingly, the constable's office must withhold the information we marked under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy. However, we find the constable's office has failed to demonstrate the remaining information is highly intimate or embarrassing and of no legitimate public interest. Thus, the constable's office may not withhold the remaining information under section 552.101 in conjunction with common-law privacy.

Section 552.108(b)(1) of the Government Code excepts from disclosure "[a]n internal record or notation of a law enforcement agency or prosecutor that is maintained for internal use in matters relating to law enforcement or prosecution . . . if (1) release of the internal record or notation would interfere with law enforcement or prosecution[.]" Gov't Code § 552.108(b)(1). This section is intended to protect "information which, if released, would permit private citizens to anticipate weaknesses in a police department, avoid detection, jeopardize officer safety, and generally undermine police efforts to effectuate the laws of this State." *City of Fort Worth v. Cornyn*, 86 S.W.3d 320, 327 (Tex. App.—Austin 2002, no pet.). This office has concluded this provision protects certain kinds of information, the

⁴ As our ruling is dispositive, we need not address your remaining argument against disclosure of this information.

disclosure of which might compromise the security or operations of a law enforcement agency. *See, e.g.*, Open Records Decision Nos. 531 at 3-4 (1989) (detailed guidelines regarding police department's use of force policy), 508 at 3-4 (1988) (information relating to future transfers of prisoners), 413 (1984) (sketch showing security measures for forthcoming execution). However, to claim this aspect of section 552.108 protection a governmental body must meet its burden of explaining how and why release of the information at issue would interfere with law enforcement and crime prevention. Open Records Decision No. 562 at 10 (1990). Further, commonly known policies and techniques may not be withheld under section 552.108. *See, e.g.*, Open Records Decision Nos. 531 at 2-3 (former section 552.108 does not protect Penal Code provisions, common-law rules, and constitutional limitations on use of force), 252 at 3 (1980) (governmental body did not meet burden because it did not indicate why investigative procedures and techniques submitted were any different from those commonly known with law enforcement and crime prevention). To prevail on its claim that section 552.108(b)(1) excepts information from disclosure, a law-enforcement agency must do more than merely make a conclusory assertion that releasing the information would interfere with law enforcement. The determination of whether the release of particular records would interfere with law enforcement is made on a case-by-case basis. Open Records Decision No. 409 at 2 (1984).

The constable's office asserts release of the submitted firearm serial numbers would interfere with law enforcement because they could be used on an illegal firearm or in a missing weapons report. Upon review, we agree release of the information at issue would interfere with law enforcement. Accordingly, the constable's office may withhold the submitted firearm serial numbers under section 552.108(b)(1) of the Government Code.

Section 552.115 of the Government Code excepts from disclosure "[a] birth or death record maintained by the bureau of vital statistics of the Texas Department of Health or a local registration official[.]" Gov't Code § 552.115(a). Section 552.115 is applicable only to information maintained by the bureau of vital statistics or local registration officials. *See* Open Records Decision No. 338 (1982) (finding that statutory predecessor to section 552.115 excepted only those birth and death records which are maintained by the bureau of vital statistics and local registration officials). Because section 552.115 of the Government Code does not apply to information held by the constable's office, the constable's office may not withhold the birth certificate in the remaining information on this basis.

Section 552.117(a)(2) of the Government Code excepts from public disclosure the home address, home telephone number, emergency contact information, and social security number of a peace officer, as well as information that reveals whether the peace officer has family members, regardless of whether the peace officer complies with sections 552.024 and 552.1175 of the Government Code. *See* Gov't Code § 552.117(a)(2). We note section 552.117 also encompasses a personal cellular telephone number, unless the cellular service is paid for by a governmental body. *See* Open Records Decision No. 506 at 5-7 (1988) (statutory predecessor to section 552.117 not applicable to cellular telephone numbers provided and paid for by governmental body and intended for official use). Section 552.117(a)(2) applies to peace officers as defined by article 2.12 of the Code of Criminal Procedure. The information that we marked under section 552.117 consists of the personal information of individuals who were employed by the constable's office and the

information is held in the employment context. You state the individual whose information is at issue is a currently licensed peace officer as defined by article 2.12 of the Code of Criminal Procedure. Accordingly, the constable's office must withhold the information we marked under section 552.117(a)(2) of the Government Code; however, the constable's office may only withhold the cellular telephone numbers at issue if a governmental body did not pay for the cellular telephone service.

Some of the remaining information may be subject to section 552.1175 of the Government Code. Section 552.1175 of the Government Code protects the home address, home telephone number, emergency contact information, date of birth, social security number, and family member information of certain individuals, when that information is held by a governmental body in a non-employment capacity and the individual elects to keep the information confidential.⁵ Gov't Code § 552.1175. Section 552.1175 applies, in part, to "peace officers as defined by Article 2.12, Code of Criminal Procedure[.]" *Id.* § 552.1175(a)(1). Thus, to the extent the information we marked relates to licensed peace officers who elect to restrict access to their information in accordance with section 552.1175(b), it must be withheld from disclosure under section 552.1175 of the Government Code. If the individuals whose information is at issue are not currently licensed peace officers or do not elect to restrict access to their information in accordance with section 552.1175(b), the indicated information may not be withheld under section 552.1175.

Section 552.130 of the Government Code provides information relating to a motor vehicle operator's license, driver's license, motor vehicle title or registration, or personal identification document issued by an agency of this state or another state or country is excepted from public release. *See id.* § 552.130. The constable's office must withhold the information we marked under section 552.130 of the Government Code.

Section 552.136 of the Government Code provides, "[n]otwithstanding any other provision of [the Act], a credit card, debit card, charge card, or access device number that is collected, assembled, or maintained by or for a governmental body is confidential." *Id.* § 552.136(b); *see id.* § 552.136(a) (defining "access device"). This office has determined insurance policy numbers are access device numbers for purposes of section 552.136. Accordingly, the constable's office must withhold the insurance policy numbers we marked under section 552.136 of the Government Code.

Section 552.137 of the Government Code excepts from disclosure "an e-mail address of a member of the public that is provided for the purpose of communicating electronically with a governmental body" unless the member of the public consents to its release or the e-mail address is of a type specifically excluded by subsection (c). *Id.* § 552.137(a)-(c). The e-mail addresses at issue are not of a type specifically excluded by section 552.137(c) of the Government Code. Accordingly, the constable's office must withhold the e-mail

⁵ The Office of the Attorney General will raise mandatory exceptions on behalf of a governmental body, but ordinarily will not raise other exceptions. *See* Open Records Decision Nos. 481 (1987), 480 (1987), 470 (1987).

addresses we marked under section 552.137 of the Government Code, unless the owners of the e-mail addresses affirmatively consent to their disclosure.

In summary, the officers' TCOLE numbers are not subject to the Act and need not be released to the requestor. The constable's office must withhold the submitted L-2 and L-3 declaration forms we marked under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 1701.306 of the Occupations Code. The constable's office must withhold the information we marked under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 411.083 of the Government Code. The constable's office must withhold the submitted I-9 form and under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 1324a of title 8 of the United States Code. The constable's office must withhold the W-4 form under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 6103(a) of title 26 of the United States Code. The constable's office must withhold the F-5 report we marked under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 1701.454 of the Occupations Code. The constable's office must withhold the fingerprints we marked under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 560.003 of the Government Code. The constable's office must withhold the information we marked under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with the MPA. The constable's office must withhold the date of birth you marked under section 552.102(a) of the Government Code. The constable's office must withhold the information we marked under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy. The constable's office may withhold the submitted firearm serial numbers under section 552.108(b)(1) of the Government Code. The constable's office must withhold the information we marked under section 552.117(a)(2) of the Government Code; however, the constable's office may only withhold the cellular telephone numbers at issue if a governmental body did not pay for the cellular telephone service. To the extent the information we marked relates to licensed peace officers who elect to restrict access to their information in accordance with section 552.1175(b), it must be withheld from disclosure under section 552.1175 of the Government Code. The constable's office must withhold the information we marked under section 552.130 of the Government Code. The constable's office must withhold the insurance policy numbers we marked under section 552.136 of the Government Code. The constable's office must withhold the e-mail addresses we marked under section 552.137 of the Government Code, unless the owners of the e-mail addresses affirmatively consent to their disclosure. The constable's office must release the remaining information.⁶

This letter ruling is limited to the particular information at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other information or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For more information concerning those rights and

⁶ We note the information to be released contains a social security number. Section 552.147(b) of the Government Code authorizes a governmental body to redact a living person's social security number from public release without the necessity of requesting an attorney general decision under the Act. *See* Gov't Code § 552.147(b).

responsibilities, please visit our website at <https://www.texasattorneygeneral.gov/open-government/members-public/what-expect-after-ruling-issued> or call the OAG's Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. Questions concerning the allowable charges for providing public information under the Public Information Act may be directed to the Cost Rules Administrator of the OAG, toll free, at (888) 672-6787.

Sincerely,

Sean McCormick
Attorney
Open Records Division

SMC/jxd

Ref: ID# 817463

Enc. Submitted documents

c: Requestor
(w/o enclosures)