



KEN PAXTON
ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS

March 16, 2020

Ms. Kristi DeCluitt
Assistant City Attorney
City of Waco
P.O. Box 2570
Waco, Texas 76702-2570

OR2020-08142

Dear Ms. DeCluitt:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 817027 (ORR# LGL 19-249).

The Waco Police Department (the "department") received a request for information related to a specified incident. The department states it will redact dates of birth of members of the public pursuant to the previous determination issued in Open Records Letter No. 2018-15072 (2018).¹ The department also states it will withhold social security numbers pursuant to section 552.147(b) of the Government Code.² The department states it is releasing some of the requested information. The department claims the submitted information is excepted from disclosure under sections 552.101 and 552.130 of the Government Code.³ We have considered the exceptions the department claims and reviewed the submitted information.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code excepts "information considered to be confidential by law, either constitutional, statutory, or by judicial decision." Gov't Code

¹ Open Records Letter No. 2018-15072 authorized the department to withhold dates of birth of members of the public under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy without the necessity of requesting an attorney general's decision. *See* Open Records Decision No. 673 at 7-8 (2001) (listing elements of second type of previous determination under section 552.301(a) of the Government Code).

² Section 552.147(b) of the Government Code authorizes a governmental body to redact a living person's social security number without the necessity of requesting a decision from this office. *See* Gov't Code § 552.147(b).

³ Although the department does not raise section 552.130 of the Government Code in its brief, we understand the department to raise this exception based on its markings.

§ 552.101. Section 552.101 encompasses the doctrine of common-law privacy, which protects information that is (1) highly intimate or embarrassing, the publication of which would be highly objectionable to a reasonable person, and (2) not of legitimate concern to the public. *Indus. Found. v. Tex. Indus. Accident Bd.*, 540 S.W.2d 668, 685 (Tex. 1976). To demonstrate the applicability of common-law privacy, both prongs of this test must be satisfied. *Id.* at 681-82. Types of information considered intimate and embarrassing by the Texas Supreme Court are delineated in *Industrial Foundation*. *Id.* at 683. Generally, only highly intimate information that implicates the privacy of an individual is withheld. However, in certain instances, where it is demonstrated the requestor knows the identity of the individual involved as well as the nature of certain incidents, the entire report must be withheld to protect the individual's privacy. The department seeks to withhold the entirety of the submitted information under section 552.101 in conjunction with common-law privacy. However, the department has not demonstrated, nor does it otherwise appear, this is a situation in which the entirety of the information at issue must be withheld on the basis of common-law privacy. Accordingly, the department may not withhold the entirety of the submitted information under section 552.101 of the Government Code on that basis. Upon review, we agree most of the information the department marked satisfies the standard articulated by the Texas Supreme Court in *Industrial Foundation*. However, we find the department has not demonstrated some of the information it marked is highly intimate or embarrassing and not of legitimate public concern. This information, which we have marked for release, may not be withheld under section 552.101 in conjunction with common-law privacy. Therefore, with the exception of the information we marked for release, the department must withhold the information it marked under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy.

Section 552.130 of the Government Code provides information relating to a motor vehicle operator's license, driver's license, motor vehicle title or registration, or personal identification document issued by an agency of this state or another state or country is excepted from public release. *See Gov't Code § 552.130*. The department states it is withholding the motor vehicle record information it marked pursuant to section 552.130(c) of the Government Code.⁴ The department must also withhold the additional motor vehicle record information we marked under section 552.130 of the Government Code.

In summary, with the exception of the information we marked for release, the department must withhold the information it marked under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy. The department must also withhold the additional motor vehicle record information we marked under section 552.130 of the Government Code. The department must release the remaining information.

This letter ruling is limited to the particular information at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other information or any other circumstances.

⁴ Section 552.130(c) of the Government Code allows a governmental body to redact the information described in subsection 552.130(a) without the necessity of seeking a decision from the attorney general. *See Gov't Code § 552.130(c)*. If a governmental body redacts such information, it must notify the requestor in accordance with section 552.130(e). *See id.* § 552.130(d), (e).

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For more information concerning those rights and responsibilities, please visit our website at <https://www.texasattorneygeneral.gov/open-government/members-public/what-expect-after-ruling-issued> or call the OAG's Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. Questions concerning the allowable charges for providing public information under the Public Information Act may be directed to the Cost Rules Administrator of the OAG, toll free, at (888) 672-6787.

Sincerely,



Claire V. Morris Sloan
Assistant Attorney General
Open Records Division

CVMS/jlbn

Ref: ID# 817027

Enc. Submitted documents

c: Requestor
(w/o enclosures)